Social Services Transportation Advisory Council

The Social Services Transportation Advisory Council may take action on any item appearing on this agenda.

Wednesday, January 22, 2020
10 a.m. to 12 p.m.

SANDAG, Board Room
401 B Street, Suite 800
San Diego, CA 92101

Please take the elevator to the 8th floor to access the meeting room.

Staff Contact: Lisa Madsen
(619) 595-1432
lisa.madsen@sandag.org

Agenda Highlights

• 2020 Coordinated Public Transit-Human Services Transportation Plan

Please silence all electronic devices during the meeting

Mission Statement

The 18 cities and county government are SANDAG serving as the forum for regional decision-making. SANDAG builds consensus; makes strategic plans; obtains and allocates resources; plans, engineers, and builds public transit; and provides information on a broad range of topics pertinent to the region’s quality of life.
Welcome to SANDAG. Members of the public may speak to the Working Group on any item at the time the Working Group is considering the item. Please complete a Request to Comment form and then present the form to the Working Group coordinator. Members of the public may address the Working Group on any issue under the agenda item entitled Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments. Public speakers are limited to three minutes or less per person. The Working Group may take action on any item appearing on the agenda.

Both agenda and non-agenda comments should be sent to SANDAG via comment@sandag.org. Please include the Working Group name and meeting date, agenda item, your name, and your organization. Any comments, handouts, presentations, or other materials from the public intended for distribution at the meeting should be received by the Working Group coordinator no later than 5 p.m. two working days prior to the meeting. All public comments and materials received by the deadline become part of the official public record and will be provided to the members for their review at the meeting.

In order to keep the public informed in an efficient manner and facilitate public participation, SANDAG also provides access to all agenda and meeting materials online at sandag.org/meetings. Additionally, interested persons can sign up for email notifications at sandag.org/subscribe.

SANDAG operates its programs without regard to race, color, and national origin in compliance with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act. SANDAG has developed procedures for investigating and tracking Title VI complaints, and the procedures for filing a complaint are available to the public upon request. Questions concerning SANDAG nondiscrimination obligations or complaint procedures should be directed to the SANDAG General Counsel, John Kirk, at (619) 699-1997 or john.kirk@sandag.org. Any person who believes himself or herself or any specific class of persons to be subjected to discrimination prohibited by Title VI also may file a written complaint with the Federal Transit Administration.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact the SANDAG ADA Coordinator, the Director of Diversity and Equity, at (619) 699-1900, at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting. To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1900 or (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905.

SANDAG agenda materials can be made available in alternative languages. To make a request, call (619) 699-1900 at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

Los materiales de la agenda de SANDAG están disponibles en otros idiomas. Para hacer una solicitud, llame al (619) 699-1900 al menos 72 horas antes de la reunión.

如有需要，我们可以把SANDAG议程材料翻译成其他语言。

请在会议前至少72小时打电话(619) 699-1900提出请求。

SANDAG offices are accessible by public transit. Phone 511 or visit 511sd.com for route information. Bicycle parking is available in the parking garage of the SANDAG offices. To access the meeting room, please arrive on the 8th floor.
Social Services Transportation Advisory Council  
Wednesday, January 22, 2019

Item No. | Action
--- | ---
1. | Welcome and Introductions

2. | **Approval of Meeting Minutes**  
Approve  
The Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC) is asked to review and approve the minutes from its November 25, 2019, meeting.

3. | **Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments**  
Members of the public shall have the opportunity to address the SSTAC on any issue within the jurisdiction of SANDAG that is not on this agenda. Anyone desiring to speak shall reserve time by completing a Request to Comment form and giving it to the meeting coordinator prior to speaking. Public speakers should notify the meeting coordinator if they have a handout for distribution to SSTAC members. Public speakers are limited to three minutes or less per person. SSTAC members also may provide information and announcements under this agenda item.

**Reports**

4. | **Staff Report**  
*Information*  
*SANDAG Staff*  
Staff will report on notable activity within the SANDAG Short-Range Transit section.

5. | **Transit Operator Update**  
*Information*  
*MTS and NCTD Staff*  
Representatives from the Metropolitan Transit System and North County Transit District will provide an update on proposed service changes and any notable activity.

6. | **Facilitating Access to Coordinated Transportation Update**  
*Information*  
*FACT Staff*  
The SSTAC will hear a verbal report on the most recent developments of the Facilitating Access to Coordinated Transportation Update and the Council on Access and Mobility.
Workshop

7. 2020 Coordinated Public Transit-Human Services Transportation Plan Discussion

*SANDAG Staff*

SANDAG will hold a public workshop to gather input on the 2020 Coordinated Public Transit-Human Services Transportation Plan. Attendees are asked to provide input on ways to improve public transit and specialized transportation options for seniors, low-income, and disabled individuals, and to discuss other issues pertinent to specialized transportation in the San Diego region.

8. Upcoming Meetings Information

The next SSTAC meeting is scheduled for Monday, March 16, 2020, at 10 a.m.

9. Adjournment

+ next to an item indicates an attachment
November 25, 2019, Meeting Minutes

Chair Meagan Schmidt (Facilitating Access to Coordinated Transportation [FACT] – Seat B) called the meeting of the Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC) to order at 10 a.m. at the SANDAG offices.

1. Welcome and Introductions
The attendance sheet for this meeting is included.

2. Approval of Meeting Minutes (Approve)
   Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Jay Washburn (Metropolitan Transit System [MTS] – Paratransit) and a second by Kent Rodricks (Special Interest Voting Member – Seat B), the SSTAC approved the minutes as amended from its September 16, 2019, meeting. Yes: Chair Schmidt, Vice Chair Washburn, Betty Vorhies (At-Large Voting Member – Seat A), Mary Birdine (At-large Voting Member – Seat C 1st Alternate), Claudia Gavin (ElderHelp), Todd Shaw (Home of Guiding Hands), Vassilena Lerinska (MTS Fixed Route), Robert Gebo (NCTD Paratransit), Marissa Lucero (San Diego Center for the Blind), Ilse Carey (Special Interest Voting Member – Seat A), Kent Rodricks, Winona Garcia (Survivors of Torture, International). No: None. Abstain: Sharlene Ornelas (At-Large Voting Member – Seat B). Absent: FACT – Seat A, North County Transit District (NCTD) – Fixed Route, and The Arc of San Diego.

3. Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments
Sharlene Ornelas expressed a need for increased security in the afternoon at the City College Transit Station, citing reports that students had harassed blind individuals at the City College Transit Station.
Sharlene Ornelas also expressed a need for MTS Trolley conductors to call out the Trolley line names in the Downtown San Diego area to accommodate visually-impaired and other riders where the lines overlap; and requested that the volume of the Route 7 external bus call-outs at stops be adjusted to match ambient noise so that senior complexes and other residential areas along the route are not disturbed early in the morning.
Winona Garcia also expressed the need for more consistent bus call-outs so that asylum-seekers and individuals whose first language is not English can better access transit; and requested funding to help cover the transit fare costs for asylum-seeking riders, since they are not authorized to receive work permits while their asylum cases are being adjudicated.
Dan Totah, member of the public, expressed a need for compensation for paratransit users when they are inconvenienced to a great extent by the tardiness of paratransit operators. Dan Totah stated that a compensation mechanism could include waiving the $5 LYFT fee; and requested that SANDAG allocate funding to support expanded hours for paratransit service.
Sharon Beckas, member of the public, expressed difficulty communicating via NCTD’s and MTS’ websites with customer service feedback, after providing customer service feedback to NCTD on November 6, 2019, regarding an issue on Route 101, an acknowledgement from NCTD on November 8, 2019, was received but there has been no follow-up message on how or when the issues would be addressed. Callers must personally call MTS after ten working days to inquire about the status of a reported issue, Sharon Beckas believes this is inadequate and recommends that the transit operators include multiple categories for issues such as bus stop maintenance on customer feedback forms so that issues can be routed directly to operations, instead of through customer service and then to operations. Additionally, Sharon Beckas expressed the need for alignment between bus drivers and MTS customer service staff regarding MTS’ policies on oversized packages aboard buses.

Clytie Koehler, member of the public, expressed concern that the bus stop near the intersection of West Valley Parkway and Escondido Boulevard is still dangerous and inaccessible for visually-impaired bus riders; the design does not include any tactile directions and that improvements have yet to be made and expressed the need for better communication between NCTD and the City of Escondido to address this issue.

David Jackson, member of the public, was pleased to see the progression of the Mid-Coast Trolley Extension project.

Reports

4. 2020 SSTAC Meeting Calendar (Approve)

Action: Upon a motion by Sharlene Ornelas and a second by Vice Chair Washburn, the SSTAC approved the proposed meeting dates for 2020. Yes: Chair Schmidt, Vice Chair Washburn, Betty Vorhies, Sharlene Ornelas, Mary Birdine, Claudia Gavin, Todd Shaw, Vassy Lerinska, Robert Gebo, Marissa Lucero, Ilse Carey, Kent Rodricks, and Winona Garcia. Absent: FACT – Seat A, NCTD – Fixed Route and The Arc of San Diego.

5. 2020 Census Complete Count (Information)

Regional Census Data Center Manager Darlanne Hoctor Mulmat presented an overview of SANDAG activities related to the 2020 Census Complete Count. Darlanne Mulmat clarified for Sharlene Ornelas and Betty Vorhies that minorities as well as individuals with disabilities are included in the hard-to-count population that will receive targeted outreach to ensure a complete count. This targeted outreach will include information in accessible formats for individuals with disabilities. Sharon Beckas expressed concern over the security of personal information transmitted via the Internet and the type of information requested on the Census postcard. Darlanne Mulmat stated that residents can complete the Census via the Internet, mail, or by phone and that the nine-question draft survey is available on the Census’ website. Claudia Gavin asked what efforts have been undertaken to support community-based organizations so that social workers can assist their clients complete the Census. Darlanne Mulmat replied that the State of California has allocated funding so that service providers can receive locally-developed training and ensure a complete count. Megan Howell, City of La Mesa, stated that there will be kiosks at senior centers and other locations with closed networks for those who prefer those options.

Betty Vorhies asked how the community-based organizations were selected. Darlanne Mulmat responded that United Way solicited requests for proposals and a panel evaluated those proposals on the capacity of those organizations to reach the hardest-to-reach populations. Darlanne Mulmat reported that community-based organizations collectively requested $7 million, though only $1 million in funding was available.
6. Border to Bayshore Bikeway (Discussion)

Associate Active Transportation Planner Alison Moss presented proposed features of the Border to Bayshore Bikeway, an approximate 6.5-mile route within San Ysidro and Imperial Beach. Alison Moss confirmed for Helen Elias that pedestrians would have the right-of-way between pedestrians and bicyclists, indicated by signage, continental crosswalks, and yield marking. When asked by Marissa Lucero if the bike lanes would be at street-level or sidewalk-level, Alison Moss replied that the example discussed would be at street-grade. Alison Moss will check and follow-up with Kent Rodricks regarding the number of parking spaces lost from the proposed neighborhood traffic circle.

7. University Bikeway (Information)

Alison Moss presented on the proposed features of the University Bikeway, an approximate 2.9-mile urban bikeway route within the City of San Diego. Alison Moss noted for Kent Rodricks that there would be minimal parking loss for the University Bikeway project, but will later confirm the specific number of lost parking spaces. Mary Birdine inquired if the southeast curb at the intersection of University Avenue and 54th Street would be redone. Alison stated that is was her understanding that the entire intersection including that curb would be rebuilt. Mary Birdine expressed concern that University Avenue between College Avenue and 60th Street is particularly dangerous.

Ilse Carey and Kent Rodricks asked how many people are expected to use the new bikeways and if these new bikeways are a good investment. Alison Moss stated it is difficult to gauge ridership on a bikeway until there is a robust bikeway network and fewer disjointed bicycle lane segments; and also added that the SANDAG bikeway program includes a robust bike count and monitoring program, which will entail detailed analysis of all SANDAG bikeway projects. Sharlene Ornelas expressed a need for audible signals to ensure that the walk light to cross is on and the street names are announced at intersections for visually-impaired pedestrians. Alison Moss confirmed for Todd Shaw that there would be dedicated bicycle signals that would notify bicycle riders when to cross intersections. Vice Chair Washburn asked where the signals for the bicycle lanes would be located. Alison Moss stated that per the City of San Diego, there would be tacit detection as well as a push button and bicyclists would be required to yield to pedestrians at intersections. Alison Moss will follow-up with Helen Elias on the location of push buttons for pedestrians, especially where bikeways ramp up to, and intersect with, sidewalks.

Marissa Lucero appreciated the projects now include a difference in grades between the sidewalk and bicycle lane, though Alison Moss clarified that there are some cases where there would not be a difference in grades due to maintenance issues. Marissa Lucero also expressed the need for precision in the location of the push buttons and accessible pedestrian signals for hearing-impaired pedestrians. Sharlene Ornelas added that the accessible pedestrian signal volume should be set to ambient noise levels.

Kent Rodricks expressed concern that the proposed floating bus stop would be dangerous. Alison Moss stated that proposed design is an improvement to existing conditions. Alison Moss confirmed for Helen Elias that the bus island would include bus benches, shaded protection, and enough space to accommodate wheelchairs. Sharon Beckas asked if the height of the floating bus stop would accommodate kneeling buses. Vice Chair Jay Washburn asked if the width of the floating bus stop suffices to accommodate the deployment of bus ramps and space for wheelchairs to board bus ramps. Alison Moss will follow-up that the floating bus stops have been designed to accommodate kneeling busses and deployment of bus ramps.
Todd Shaw expressed concern that the protections that are gained when the bicycle lanes and sidewalks are grade-separated would be lost when bicycle lanes ramp up to pedestrian level near an intersection. Mary Birdine expressed concern that bicyclists would adequately slow down to avoid pedestrian traffic from curbs to the floating bus stop. Alison Moss stated that proposed features to address this concern include bright colors, yield markings, and continental crosswalks.

Regarding features of the proposed neighborhood traffic circle, Sharlene Ornelas commented that the landscaping should be high enough to ensure that visually-impaired or other pedestrians cross only at crosswalks, but low enough to ensure a person a wheelchair or a child can be seen. Sharlene Ornelas also expressed a need for a feature that notifies visually-impaired pedestrians that electric vehicles are approaching a traffic circle or roundabout. Alison Moss stated that this feature was included in other bikeway projects but excluded from the Border to Bayshore and University Bikeway designs due to maintenance objections raised by the City of San Diego. Helen Elias inquired about the specifications of an intersection that favor a roundabout versus a traffic circle design treatment. Alison Moss stated that the amount of available space and the volume of traffic are two factors that guide design treatment decisions.

8. El Portal Underpass (Discussion)

Jeremy Lahaye, T.Y. Lin, presented on proposed features of the El Portal Undercrossing project located in the City of Encinitas. Sharlene Ornelas asked if the angled crosswalks at the traffic circle could be made straight to assist visually-impaired pedestrians. Jeremy Lahaye responded that the angled crosswalks are part of the 101 Streetscape project through the City of Encinitas and not part of the El Portal Underpass project; however, he stated he would convey Sharlene Ornelas’ concern to the City of Encinitas. Sharlene Ornelas expressed a need for the head ramps at the traffic circle to be 90 degrees to the crosswalk. Jeremy Lahaye stated that the project tries to keep pedestrian slopes as low as possible.

Helen Elias expressed concern that the project would be giving bicyclists two lanes and increase conflict with pedestrian traffic. Jeremy Lahaye and Principal Engineer Bruce Smith explained that the project is intended to cater to speed cyclist groups as well as recreational users including school children and families. Kent Rodricks asked how much parking would be lost due to the project. Jeremy Lahaye stated that there would not likely be a parking loss. Clytie Koehler expressed concern about the noise level from rail and asked if the project could include features to mitigate the noise for pedestrians in the area. Jeremy Lahaye stated that rail traffic is intermittent and there is not much that can be done to deaden the noise.

Sharon Beckas expressed concerns about security and asked if the project would include call boxes. Jeremy Lahaye commented that call boxes are not slated to be included in the project, though the area would be monitored by video cameras. Dan Totah inquired about the crosswalks across Vulcan Avenue. Jeremy Lahaye confirmed that there are no plans for a crosswalk to connect to an adjacent school, though the City of Encinitas has constructed one next to the traffic circle on Vulcan Avenue.

Marissa Lucero expressed concern that some of the project features would be inaccessible for visually-impaired pedestrians and that the proposed truncated domes are confusing to visually-impaired pedestrians where bicycles ramp up to pedestrian level because truncated domes signal a crossing and danger to visually-impaired pedestrians. Jeremy Lahaye stated that traffic engineers from the City of Encinitas directed the design and placement of the truncated domes, though suggestions on improving the design would be welcomed. Marissa Lucero expressed the need for the SSTAC to convene a subcommittee to review accessibility concerns on this project such as the placement of truncated domes.
9. Working Group Forum Overview and Feedback Summary (Discussion)
Transit Planning Intern Zachary Rivera provided an overview of the 5 Big Moves and an overview of the feedback received at the Working Group Forum held on October 3, 2019.

10. Staff Report (Information)
Associate Transit Planner Lisa Madsen noted that a final decision on Track 2 issues regarding Senate Bill 1376: TNC Access for All will be made between January and March 2020. Lisa Madsen announced that San Diego Forward: The 2019 Federal Regional Transportation Plan was approved by the federal government and that SANDAG staff will be commencing outreach in January 2020 for the Coordinated Plan.

11. Transit Operator Update (Information)
Amanda Denham, MTS, provided an overview of MTS’ customer service program including how MTS staff handle customer compliments and concerns.

Robert Gebo noted an increase in paratransit ridership and stated that the interactive voice recognition and EZ Wallet systems have been implemented with generally positive feedback. Forthcoming projects include upgrades to the service infraction software and other software and technologies to enhance NCTD’s paratransit service. The service infraction software will flag paratransit riders for excessive cancellations or no-shows.

12. Facilitating Access to Coordinated Transportation Update (Information)
Chair Schmidt invited all SSTAC members to attend FACT’s annual meeting on December 17, 2019, at the Braille Institute. The annual meeting starts at 9 a.m., though guests can arrive at 8:30 a.m. for networking.

13. Upcoming Meetings (Information)
The next SSTAC meeting is scheduled for January 22, 2020, at 10 a.m. at the SANDAG offices.

14. Adjournment
Chair Schmidt adjourned the meeting at 12:10 p.m.
# Confirmed Attendance at SANDAG Social Services Transportation Advisory Council Meeting

November 25, 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction/Organization</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Attended</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At-Large Voting Member (Seat A)</td>
<td>Betty Vorhies</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At-Large Voting Member (Seat B)</td>
<td>Sharlene Ornelas</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At-Large Voting Member (Seat C)</td>
<td>Catherine Manis</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At-Large Voting Member (Seats A through C) Alternates</td>
<td>Mary Birdine</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rebecca Steiner</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ted Kagan</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ElderHelp</td>
<td>Claudia Gavin</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitating Access to Coordinated Transportation (Seat A)</td>
<td>Arun Prem</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitating Access to Coordinated Transportation (Seat B)</td>
<td>Meagan Schmidt</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Chair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home of Guiding Hands</td>
<td>Todd Shaw</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metropolitan Transit System (MTS) Fixed Route</td>
<td>Vassy Lerinska</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTS Paratransit</td>
<td>Jay Washburn</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Vice Chair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North County Transit District (NCTD) Fixed Route</td>
<td>Chris Duddy</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCTD Paratransit</td>
<td>Robert Gebo</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Diego Center for the Blind</td>
<td>Marissa Lucero</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Interest Voting Member (Seat A)</td>
<td>Ilse Carey</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Helen Elias, Alternate</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Interest Voting Member (Seat B)</td>
<td>Kent Rodricks</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wayne Landon, Alternate</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survivors of Torture, International</td>
<td>Winona Garcia</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Arc of San Diego</td>
<td>Anthony DeSalis</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Other Attendees**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amanda Denham, MTS</td>
<td>Charles Schwinger</td>
<td>Clytie Koehler</td>
<td>Dan Totah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeremy LaHaye, TY Lin International</td>
<td>Andrianna Ramirez, Travelers Aid</td>
<td>David Jackson</td>
<td>Liz Santucci, Caltrans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philip Brand, TY Lin International</td>
<td>Noela Rios, MV Transit</td>
<td>Meg Howell, City of La Mesa</td>
<td>Sharon Beckas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amanda Denham, MTS</td>
<td>Charles Schwinger</td>
<td>Clytie Koehler</td>
<td>Dan Totah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeremy LaHaye, TY Lin International</td>
<td>Andrianna Ramirez, Travelers Aid</td>
<td>David Jackson</td>
<td>Liz Santucci, Caltrans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philip Brand, TY Lin International</td>
<td>Noela Rios, MV Transit</td>
<td>Meg Howell, City of La Mesa</td>
<td>Sharon Beckas</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SANDAG Staff**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alison Moss</td>
<td>Darlanne Hoctor Mulmat</td>
<td>Elaine Richardson</td>
<td>Josh Parsell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa Madsen</td>
<td>Louise Torio</td>
<td>Zachary Rivera</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>