FY 2020-2024 Operating and Capital Budget

SANDAG Transportation Committee Item 6 | June 21, 2019

About North County Transit District (NCTD)

- Jurisdiction area encompasses 1,020 square miles and about 30% of San Diego County population (965,000)
- About 72% of our customers have a household annual income of less than $45,000
- Nearly 30% of customers are transit-dependent
- Land use is lower density consisting of suburban, rural, and military uses
- Fleet of 152 buses, 7 locomotives, 28 passenger rail cars, and 12 light rail DMU passenger trains
- Bus operations and maintenance, Rail operations and maintenance, and Facilities Maintenance are provided by private contractors
### Peer Comparison – Motorbus
**Purchased or Directly Operated Transportation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Passenger Trips/ Per Capita</th>
<th>Passenger Trips/ Per Revenue Hour</th>
<th>Operating Expense/ Per Revenue Hour</th>
<th>Pure Farebox Recovery (%) *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NCTD</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>$103.09</td>
<td>12.97% **</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tampa, FL</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>19.7</td>
<td>$110.29</td>
<td>18.84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlotte, NC</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>$106.63</td>
<td>21.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Santa Clara, CA</td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>21.5</td>
<td>$182.65</td>
<td>10.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacramento, CA</td>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>$146.88</td>
<td>19.26%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Fare revenues divided by operating expenses
** YTD Farebox recovery through the 3rd quarter of FY19 is 15.2%

Source: 2017 National Transit Database; Urban Integrated National Transit Database

---

### Peer Comparison – Commuter Rail
**Purchased or Directly Operated Transportation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Passenger Trips/ Per Capita</th>
<th>Passenger Trips/ Per Revenue Hour</th>
<th>Operating Expense/ Per Revenue Hour</th>
<th>Pure Farebox Recovery (%) *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NCTD</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>42.3</td>
<td>$524.37</td>
<td>32.59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seattle, WA</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>69.5</td>
<td>$711.69</td>
<td>33.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alexandria, VA</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>$989.47</td>
<td>57.15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chesterton, IN</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>29.9</td>
<td>$418.98</td>
<td>45.77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dallas, TX</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>$390.06</td>
<td>31.37%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Fare revenues divided by operating expenses

Source: 2017 National Transit Database; Urban Integrated National Transit Database
### Peer Comparison – Hybrid Rail

**Purchased or Directly Operated Transportation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Passenger Trips/ Per Capita</th>
<th>Passenger Trips/ Per Revenue Hour</th>
<th>Operating Expense/ Per Revenue Hour</th>
<th>Pure Farebox Recovery (%) *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NCTD</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>82.4</td>
<td>$498.14</td>
<td>17.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newark, NJ</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>54.3</td>
<td>$616.18</td>
<td>7.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austin, TX</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>64.8</td>
<td>$1,709.25</td>
<td>9.08%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denton, TX</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>$642.85</td>
<td>5.27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portland, OR</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>60.1</td>
<td>$959.05</td>
<td>6.62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Fare revenues divided by operating expenses

Source: 2017 National Transit Database; Urban Integrated National Transit Database

### NCTD Five-Year Budget Plan

- **Significantly improve service frequencies between FY2020 and FY2024**
  - Improve BREEZE bus service frequencies
  - Implement 30-minute peak service frequencies for COASTER
  - Implement 15-minute frequencies for SPRINTER
  - Implement comprehensive program for first and last mile services
Key Studies to Increase Transit Ridership

- **Land Use and Transit Integration Study (LUTIS)**
  - Coordination with local jurisdictions to develop a matrix of service options and recommendations for better integrating land use and transit
  - Anticipated completion: September 2019

- **Strategic Multimodal Transit Implementation Plan**
  - Builds upon the LUTIS to develop implementable service strategies for existing and future mobility services
  - Anticipated completion: Fall 2020

- **Public Benefits Study**
  - Demonstrates specific economic and environmental benefits to increased NCTD services
  - Anticipated completion: November 2019

NCTD Projects to Increase Transit Ridership

- **Procurement of locomotives and rail cars for increased frequencies**
- **Procurement of battery-electric buses**
- **On-demand rideshare pilot at Poinsettia COASTER station**
  - Partnership with City of Carlsbad, SANDAG
- **Micromobility pilot at California State University San Marcos (CSUSM) SPRINTER station**
  - Partnership with CSUSM, City of San Marcos, and SANDAG
Projects to Enhance the Customer Riding Experience

• Develop cohesive and comprehensive signage and wayfinding plan for all transit stations and stops

• Helps solve first/last mile issue through:
  – Clarity & ease of use
  – Connectivity
  – Community placemaking
  – Brand & image

Projects to Enhance the Customer Riding Experience

• Updated GoNCTD Website
  – Greater ease of use on both desktop and mobile
  – Improved trip planning functions

• Customer Relationship Management software
  – Expanded communication solutions
  – Enhanced website service alerts and text alerts

• Real-time Trip Information
  – Currently analyzing vendor options
Projects to Enhance the Customer Riding Experience

- **Next Generation Regional Fare Collection System**
  - Streamlined regional fares will pave the way for new Regional Fare Collection System
  - Regional, account-based fare system will streamline regional fare architecture

NCTD Overview – 2019 Staffing Levels

```
- Facilities 36, 4%
- Rail Contractor 141, 17%
- Direct 134, 16%
- Bus Contractor 534, 63%

Total Direct Employee and Contractor's Staff: 845
```
FY 2020-2024
Operating and Capital Budget Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FY 2020</th>
<th>FY 2021</th>
<th>FY 2022</th>
<th>FY 2023</th>
<th>FY 2024</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL REVENUES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passenger Fares</td>
<td>$16,894,415</td>
<td>$17,464,901</td>
<td>$17,464,901</td>
<td>$17,464,901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Transportation Revenues</td>
<td>$2,558,548</td>
<td>$2,653,904</td>
<td>$2,714,360</td>
<td>$2,795,794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auxiliary Revenues</td>
<td>$10,885,798</td>
<td>$11,212,372</td>
<td>$11,546,743</td>
<td>$11,895,206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Grants</td>
<td>$41,587,063</td>
<td>$37,341,310</td>
<td>$37,341,310</td>
<td>$37,341,310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Grants</td>
<td>$35,319,866</td>
<td>$27,174,692</td>
<td>$17,217,139</td>
<td>$17,259,659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Grants</td>
<td>$55,166,147</td>
<td>$57,881,021</td>
<td>$59,962,544</td>
<td>$62,178,588</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Year Carryover</td>
<td>$3,875,338</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL REVENUES</td>
<td>$166,287,175</td>
<td>$153,709,600</td>
<td>$146,249,000</td>
<td>$148,935,457</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FUNDS ALLOCATION</th>
<th>FY 2020</th>
<th>FY 2021</th>
<th>FY 2022</th>
<th>FY 2023</th>
<th>FY 2024</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Capital Improvement Program</td>
<td>$48,842,042</td>
<td>$36,845,904</td>
<td>$15,028,756</td>
<td>$15,000,000</td>
<td>$15,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preventive Maintenance</td>
<td>$29,686,997</td>
<td>$30,577,607</td>
<td>$31,494,935</td>
<td>$32,439,783</td>
<td>$33,412,976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Train Control</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>$3,551,000</td>
<td>$3,657,530</td>
<td>$3,767,256</td>
<td>$3,880,274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Expenses</td>
<td>$87,758,136</td>
<td>$90,390,880</td>
<td>$93,102,607</td>
<td>$95,895,685</td>
<td>$98,772,556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL FUNDS ALLOCATION</td>
<td>$166,287,175</td>
<td>$161,365,391</td>
<td>$143,283,828</td>
<td>$147,102,724</td>
<td>$151,065,805</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FY 2020-2024
Constrained Capital Improvement Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Asset Class Description</th>
<th>FY 2020</th>
<th>FY 2021</th>
<th>FY 2022</th>
<th>FY 2023</th>
<th>FY 2024</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revenue Vehicles-ADA</td>
<td>$2,164,052</td>
<td>$1,501,387</td>
<td>$1,142,407</td>
<td>$1,414,405</td>
<td>$1,414,405</td>
<td>$6,222,251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue Vehicles-Bus</td>
<td>$7,816,561</td>
<td>$11,896,996</td>
<td>$11,636,523</td>
<td>$12,348,593</td>
<td>$12,111,585</td>
<td>$55,912,258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue Vehicles-Rail</td>
<td>$16,672,053</td>
<td>$21,265,261</td>
<td>$290,090</td>
<td>$242,000</td>
<td>$242,000</td>
<td>$38,711,404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building and Structure Improvements</td>
<td>$2,268,229</td>
<td>$490,000</td>
<td>$1,515,000</td>
<td>$1,175,000</td>
<td>$1,175,000</td>
<td>$6,623,229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right-of-Way Improvements</td>
<td>$2,687,744</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>$2,687,744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signal Equipment</td>
<td>$16,150,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>$16,150,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio Equipment</td>
<td>$1,500,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>$1,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue Collection and Fare Equipment</td>
<td>$1,229,953</td>
<td>$955,605</td>
<td>$28,756</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>$2,214,314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Processing Equipment</td>
<td>$517,502</td>
<td>$72,000</td>
<td>$57,000</td>
<td>$92,000</td>
<td>$57,000</td>
<td>$795,502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL CONSTRAINED CIP</td>
<td>$48,842,042</td>
<td>$36,845,904</td>
<td>$15,028,756</td>
<td>$15,000,000</td>
<td>$15,000,000</td>
<td>$130,716,702</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MTS Fiscal Year (FY) 2020 Operating Budget Report

San Diego Metropolitan Transit System

Transportation Committee Item 6 | June 21, 2019

Fiscal Year 2019 Highlights

Transit Optimization Plan (TOP)

- Approved unanimously by Board in September 2017
- $2 million to improve bus network
  - Changes to 2/3rds of bus routes
  - 12 routes with increased service all seven days of the week
  - Ridership increases ranged from 1% to 39% on TOP-adjusted routes
  - Spurred overall turnaround in ridership
Free Ride Day

- Held Oct. 2, 2018
- 53,000 additional trips for the day – 17% increase
- Ridership on Sycuan Green Line up 37% during the event
- 3.5 million media impressions

Fiscal Year 2019 Highlights

Next-Gen Fare Collection

- Contract awarded to Innovations in Transportation (INIT) in Dec 2018
- INIT has implemented similar system for TriMet (Portland, OR)
- New system to launch in 2021
Zero Emission Bus Pilot Program

- 6 zero-emission buses (ZEB) arriving in July 2019
- Charging stations under construction at Imperial Avenue and Kearny Mesa Divisions in 2019
- Pilot will run ZEBs on different routes for two-years and test for operating variables

Fiscal Year 2019 Highlights

New Trolleys in Service

- New Siemens S70s began service in April
  - 9 Trolley cars running on Blue and Orange Lines
  - Remaining 36 for Mid-Coast
- New seating arrangement in middle section improves door-to-door accessibility
- Replacement of high-floor SD100 series vehicles awarded to Siemens in June 2019
  - Vehicles to arrive mid-2021
South Bay Rapid

- Full service began Jan. 27
- Daily service from 5 a.m. to 11 p.m., peak frequency every 15 minutes
- Daily ridership +1,500

Fiscal Year 2019 Highlights

Updated Transit Oriented Development (TOD) Policy

- Development of MTS property shall prioritize transit needs.
- Projects are expected to generate value to MTS, through direct/indirect revenues or new transit facilities.
- Encanto (Completed -- 67 units; 100% affordable)
- Active projects:
  - Grantville
  - Palm
  - E Street
  - El Cajon
  - 12th & Imperial
Elevate SD 2020

- Region-wide public participation effort
- Community advisory meetings, public forums, working groups, transit station pop-up events, web project tool and more
- Seeking input for potential transit improvements for near and long-term

FY20 Operating Budget

- Fare increases included in budget
  - Also projecting ridership growth of 500K riders
- Non-operating revenues
  - Utilizing the SANDAG revenue projections for TDA/TransNet
  - Additional TransNet operating reimbursement for South Bay Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) launched in January 2019, first full year
- Expenses
  - South Bay Rapid full year of expenses
  - Adjusting for service and one-time items, expenses are growing by 2.8%
  - $1M for Sales Tax Ballot Measure
- Balanced budget with recurring revenues meeting recurring expenses
FY 2020 Combined Budget – Revenue/Expense (Summary in $000s)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Amended FY 2019</th>
<th>Budget FY 2020</th>
<th>Variance</th>
<th>Variance Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL REVENUES</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Revenues</td>
<td>111,715 $</td>
<td>115,913 $</td>
<td>4,198</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non Operating Revenues</td>
<td>180,233</td>
<td>189,186</td>
<td>8,953</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined Revenues</td>
<td><strong>$291,948</strong></td>
<td><strong>$305,099</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,151</strong></td>
<td><strong>4.5%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL EXPENSES</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel Expenses</td>
<td>135,602 $</td>
<td>141,022 $</td>
<td>5,420</td>
<td>4.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchased Transportation</td>
<td>76,656</td>
<td>81,016</td>
<td>4,359</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside Services</td>
<td>26,273</td>
<td>27,916</td>
<td>1,643</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>29,719</td>
<td>30,076</td>
<td>357</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Other Expenses</td>
<td>23,698</td>
<td>25,069</td>
<td>1,371</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined Expenses</td>
<td><strong>$291,948</strong></td>
<td><strong>$305,099</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,151</strong></td>
<td><strong>4.5%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Revs Less Exps</td>
<td>$0 (0)</td>
<td>$(0) (0)</td>
<td>$(0) (0)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Major Assumptions
- Mid-Coast Trolley, partial year in FY22, full year FY23-24
- Operating revenue growth averages 3.7% annually
- Subsidy revenue growth averages 3.8% annually
  - STA/SB1 revenue in Operating Budget stays constant at $11.3M
- Expense growth averages 4.0% per year (2.7% excluding Mid-Coast)
### MTS Peer Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Farebox Recovery</th>
<th>Oper. Cost/Revenue Hour</th>
<th>Passengers/Revenue Hour</th>
<th>Subsidy/Passenger</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fixed Route Bus</td>
<td>30.6%</td>
<td>$83.82</td>
<td>25.3</td>
<td>$2.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Light Rail</td>
<td>47.2%</td>
<td>$163.54</td>
<td>74.6</td>
<td>$1.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTS Combined</td>
<td><strong>36.2%</strong></td>
<td><strong>$100.14</strong></td>
<td><strong>35.4</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1.80</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dallas DART</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>$153.87</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>$6.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denver RTD</td>
<td>26.1%</td>
<td>$110.73</td>
<td>22.5</td>
<td>$3.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portland TriMet</td>
<td>28.7%</td>
<td>$149.80</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>$2.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacramento RTD</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
<td>$175.53</td>
<td>25.5</td>
<td>$5.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Santa Clara VTA</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
<td>$205.94</td>
<td>22.3</td>
<td>$8.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seattle</td>
<td>32.6%</td>
<td>$177.71</td>
<td>33.4</td>
<td>$3.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah Transit Authority</td>
<td>20.1%</td>
<td>$114.81</td>
<td>22.5</td>
<td>$4.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comparison Metrics**
- Farebox Recovery Ratio: The percentage of costs paid by the passengers
- Operating Cost per Revenue Hour: The cost to operate each hour of service
- Passengers per Revenue Hour: Average number of passengers per hour of service
- Subsidy per Passenger: The amount of public funding for each passenger trip
- Source: FY 2017 National Transit Database - Combined Light Rail and Fixed Route Bus
Transportation Committee Item 7  |  June 21, 2019

Agenda

• Transportation Development Act
• Approach for TDA Performance Audit
• TDA Performance Indicators
• Recommendations
Transportation Development Act

Transportation Development Act (TDA) – 1971
• Local Transportation Fund (1/4 general sales tax statewide)
• State Transportation Fund (state taxes on diesel fuel)

TDA Audits
• Required every three years
• Administered by Caltrans

Recent Legislation
• SB 508 – Passed in October 2015, provides an opportunity for agencies to recognize local revenues in fare box recovery calculation

Approach

Useful Study Results

Balanced Findings
• Report Good, Moderate and Poor Performance
• Constructive Analysis
• Appropriate Context
• Causes, Not Symptoms

Useful Recommendations
• Pragmatic & Specific
• Implementation Actions Clearly Defined & Prioritized
• Operators Involved
• Tailored to Environment
• Expected Results Quantified

Effective Communication
• No Surprises
• Frequent Communications
• Share Findings Early
• Discuss Alternatives
• Adequate Review Time
Transit Ridership Declines

- Declining transit ridership over the past 3-4 years is a national phenomenon and Southern California is no exception
- Among the key reasons are:
  - Historically low fuel prices
  - Assembly Bill 60
  - Rising cost of living in San Diego
  - Lower density areas that are challenging to effectively serve with transit
  - Transportation Network Companies (TNCs)
  - Zero or low cost of parking in many locations

Five Plus One Performance Indicators

- **Cost per Service Hour**: a measure of cost efficiency
- **Operating Cost per Passenger**: for cost effectiveness
- **Passengers per Service Hour**: for service productivity
- **Passengers per Service Mile**: also for service productivity
- **Vehicle Service Hours per Employee Full-Time Equivalent (FTE)**: a measure of labor productivity
- **Farebox Recovery Ratio** – e.g., Fare Revenues divided by Operating Cost
MTS Performance Indicators

- Ridership declines (11%) and ongoing operating cost increases (16%) have negatively impacted cost effectiveness and cost efficiency, as well as service productivity.

- Service changes especially from the Transit Optimization Plan (TOP) in 2018 and 2019 plus other changes have stemmed ridership loss.

- Total staffing was stable during the audit period; labor productivity (measured by service hours per employee FTE) went up 0.6%.

### MTS Performance Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verified TDA Statistics &amp; Performance Indicators</th>
<th>Base Year FY15</th>
<th>Base Year FY18</th>
<th>% Change FY15-FY18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating Costs</td>
<td>$244,611,260</td>
<td>$284,436,283</td>
<td>16.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlinked Passengers</td>
<td>96,660,850</td>
<td>85,429,212</td>
<td>-11.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicle Service Hours</td>
<td>2,475,048</td>
<td>2,554,405</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicle Service Miles</td>
<td>32,118,758</td>
<td>33,323,214</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee FTEs</td>
<td>2,431</td>
<td>2,494</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Cost per Revenue Vehicle Hour</td>
<td>$98.83</td>
<td>$111.35</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Cost per Passenger</td>
<td>$2.53</td>
<td>$3.33</td>
<td>31.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passengers per Revenue Vehicle Hour</td>
<td>39.06</td>
<td>39.44</td>
<td>-1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passengers per Revenue Vehicle Mile</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>2.56</td>
<td>-14.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Hours per Employee FTE</td>
<td>1,018</td>
<td>1,024</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Change in Consumer Price Index (CPI-All)</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NTD Reports, Form-C Reports
MTS Farebox Recovery Ratio (FRR)

- FRR is down from FY2015 to 31.7% (system), 20.8% (bus), and 43.6% (rail) but still above 20% requirement
- Applying SB 508 provisions (local revenues) increases systemwide farebox recovery to 29.5% (bus) and 49.8% (rail)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date Item and Farebox Ratio</th>
<th>Base Year FY15</th>
<th>FY18</th>
<th>% Change FY15-FY18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating Costs</td>
<td>$244,611,260</td>
<td>$284,436,283</td>
<td>16.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Revenues</td>
<td>$99,114,021</td>
<td>$90,235,809</td>
<td>-9.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Cost</td>
<td>$145,497,239</td>
<td>$194,200,474</td>
<td>33.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlinked Passenger Trips</td>
<td>96,660,850</td>
<td>85,429,212</td>
<td>-11.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Recovery Ratio - Systemwide</td>
<td>40.5%</td>
<td>31.7%</td>
<td>-21.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Recovery Ratio - Directly Operated Fixed Route Bus</td>
<td>29.7%</td>
<td>20.8%</td>
<td>-30.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Recovery Ratio - Rail</td>
<td>56.3%</td>
<td>43.6%</td>
<td>-22.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Fare per Passenger Trip - Systemwide</td>
<td>$1.03</td>
<td>$1.06</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Cost per Passenger Trip - Systemwide</td>
<td>$1.51</td>
<td>$2.27</td>
<td>51.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Change in Consumer Price Index (CPI-All)</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NTD Reports, B-10 Reports

MTS Recommendations

- MTS is in full compliance with PUC code requirements
- MTS had no prior audit recommendations
- One recommendation is offered for this cycle:
  - Track and document farebox recovery ratio with SB 508 and without. Consider fare changes in the future subject to ongoing developments.
NCTD Performance Indicators

- NCTD operating costs kept up with inflation (at about 8%) but ridership decreased 15.6%, negatively affecting cost effectiveness, cost efficiency, and service productivity.

- During the audit period NCTD has worked hard to grow ridership by reducing 80+ stops to increase operating speeds, partnering with cities to achieve mobility plans, and double tracking COASTER to add service, among others.

- Consolidating bus and rail operating contracts simplified contract oversight for NCTD (Bombardier for Rail, MV for bus).

### NCTD Performance Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verified TDA Statistics &amp; Performance Indicators</th>
<th>Base Year FY15</th>
<th>Base Year FY18</th>
<th>% Change FY15-FY18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating Costs</td>
<td>$86,349,565</td>
<td>$93,189,180</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlinked Passengers</td>
<td>12,640,231</td>
<td>10,662,534</td>
<td>-15.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicle Service Hours</td>
<td>650,033</td>
<td>647,756</td>
<td>-0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicle Service Miles</td>
<td>9,801,189</td>
<td>9,370,150</td>
<td>-4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee FTEs</td>
<td>741</td>
<td>801</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Cost per Service Hour</td>
<td>$132.84</td>
<td>$143.86</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Cost per Passenger</td>
<td>$6.83</td>
<td>$8.74</td>
<td>27.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passengers per Service Hour</td>
<td>19.45</td>
<td>16.46</td>
<td>-15.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passengers per Service Mile</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>-11.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Hours per Employee FTE</td>
<td>877</td>
<td>808</td>
<td>-7.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NTD Reports, Form-C Reports
NCTD Farebox Recovery Ratio (FRR)

- In FY2018, FRR is down to below 18.8% without local funds and is also low for demand response services – below 10%
- However, by including local revenues and adjustments to the operating cost allowed under SB 508, FRR jumps to 34.7%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date Item and Farebox Ratio</th>
<th>Base Year</th>
<th>% Change FY15-FY18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating Costs</td>
<td>$86,349,565</td>
<td>$93,189,180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Revenues</td>
<td>$19,438,167</td>
<td>$15,117,480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Cost</td>
<td>$66,911,398</td>
<td>$78,071,772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlinked Passenger Trips</td>
<td>12,640,231</td>
<td>10,662,534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Recovery Ratio (no local funds)</td>
<td>22.5%</td>
<td>16.2% -27.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Fare per Passenger Trip</td>
<td>$1.54</td>
<td>$1.42 -7.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Cost per Passenger Trip</td>
<td>$5.29</td>
<td>$7.32 38.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Recovery, Fixed Route Bus</td>
<td>19.5%</td>
<td>14.1% -27.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Recovery, Commuter Rail</td>
<td>37.5%</td>
<td>30.2% -19.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Recovery, Light Rail</td>
<td>18.6%</td>
<td>13.9% -25.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farebox Recovery, Demand Response</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
<td>7.4% -19.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Change in Consumer Price Index (CPI-All)</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NTD Reports, B-10 Reports

PUC and Prior Audit Recommendations

- NCTD is in compliance with PUC requirements, with exception of farebox recovery ratio for systemwide and ADA paratransit services
- NCTD has meaningfully addressed all three recommendations from the prior Audit period:
  - Implement strategies to minimize LIFT operating cost
  - Institute a robust tracking and management system for excess capital inventory at rail maintenance facilities
  - Work with SANDAG on developing a digital database for storing NCTD right of way information
NCTD Recommendations

- Recommendation 1: Expand efforts to understand what riders want and how to grow demand. Complete studies designed to garner information, publicly share implementation plan and report progress.

- Recommendation 2: Closely track and document farebox recovery ratio with both traditional calculation and with SB 508 provisions.

SANDAG Prior Audit Recommendations

- 1. Conduct fare study to identify and develop opportunities for fare policies, connectivity between MTS, NCTD, and others (Amtrak, Metrolink) – Complete

- 2. SANDAG and FACT should work together to review FACT contractual responsibilities and funding – Partially complete

- 3. Update TDA Claim manual to address SB 508 and inform claimants – Partially complete

Recommendations #2 and #3 carry over with slight twist
SANDAG Recommendations

• Recommendation 1: Work with FACT to identify and pursue additional funding sources (e.g., Article 4.5, spending down TDA balance, further coordination)

• Recommendation 2: Continue efforts to update Policy 27 and TDA Claim Manual to address SB 508 and AB 1113 statutory changes
Delegation of Approval
for Administrative Modifications to the
Regional Transportation Improvement Program

Two Types of RTIP Amendments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Changes</th>
<th>Administrative Modification</th>
<th>Amendment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minor changes to :</td>
<td>• Project description • Funding sources • Project phase costs</td>
<td>• Addition or deletion of a project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Grouped listings</td>
<td>• Major change in:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Project/phasing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Design concept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review</td>
<td>None Approval can be delegated</td>
<td>Public review and comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Demonstration of fiscal constraint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Approval by TC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Approval by State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Approval by FHWA/FTA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Administrative Modification Guidelines

- Change fund sources or program year of funds
- Add or delete projects from grouped project listing within funding limits
- Can revise a description of a project or grouped project listing without change in scope
- Increase funding 40% of total project cost or no more than $10 million, whichever is less
- Cost decrease as long as phase is still fully funded
- Program federal funds for Advanced Construction conversion if capacity exists
- Split or combine individual projects
- Program emergency funds
- Program FTA transfers

Levels of Delegation

Administrative Modification

- **FHWA/FTA**: Authorized by June 7, 2011 memo
- **Caltrans**: Has current authority to approve
- **SANDAG Board/TC**: Requesting
- **Executive Director**: Requesting
Benefits to Delegation

- Mitigation to Regional Plan delay
- Allows agencies to access funds sooner
- More efficient use of committee meeting time
- More attention focused on major changes
- Less staff time

Recommendation

The Transportation Committee is asked to recommend that the Board of Directors approve Resolution No. 2020-01:

1. requesting delegation of approval for administrative modifications to the Regional Transportation Improvement Program; and
2. delegating that approval to the Executive Director.
DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY

The purpose of this policy is to establish the authority granted by the Board of Directors to the Executive Director. It also provides the Executive Director with the authority to delegate functions he or she has been delegated by the Board to SANDAG staff.

Definitions

The following words shall have the meanings indicated when used in this policy:

“Agreement” shall be interpreted to include contracts, memorandums of understanding, agreement amendments, purchase orders, invoices, money transfers, or any other document that could be enforced against SANDAG in a court of law.

“Budget” shall be interpreted to include SANDAG’s annual budget, revisions and amendments thereto, and the Overall Work Program.

“Emergency or Urgent Need” for purposes of this policy shall mean a situation in which, in the Executive Director’s or his/her designee’s opinion, injury to persons, or significant injury to property, covered species, habitats, linkages, and/or corridors identified in the San Diego County Natural Communities Conservation Planning program, or interruption of a public service will occur if immediate action is not taken.

Procedures

1. Adoption of a budget by the Board shall automatically authorize the Executive Director to enter into any agreements or take any other actions necessary to implement the budget items or other actions approved by the Board.

2. Any authority delegated to the Executive Director shall automatically vest with a Chief Deputy Executive Director when business must be conducted in the absence of the Executive Director.

3. In the event of emergency or an urgent need, the Executive Director is authorized to take all necessary actions to prevent significant unnecessary loss to SANDAG, a shut-down of public services, or to address a situation threatening the health or safety of persons or property, including, but not limited to, authorization to contract with a contractor or consultant on a sole source basis, consistent with applicable state or federal law without prior approval from the Board. In the event such an emergency or urgent need occurs, the Executive Director will consult with the Chair of the Board, promptly communicate all actions taken to the Board members, and submit a report to the Board at its next regular meeting in order to obtain ratification for those actions.
4. The Executive Director is hereby authorized to carry out the actions set forth below. In the event any of the authorities in this paragraph are exercised, the Executive Director will report actions taken to the Board in summary written form at the next regular meeting of the Board.

4.1 Enter into agreements not currently incorporated in the budget and make other modifications to the budget in an amount up to $300,000 per transaction so long as the overall budget remains in balance. This provision may not, however, be used multiple times on the same budget line item or contract in order to circumvent the $300,000 limit.

4.2 Approve all design plans, specifications and estimates for capital improvement projects.

4.3 Execute all real property transfer documents, including but not limited to, rights of entry, licenses, leases, deeds, easements, escrow instructions, and certificates of acceptance.

4.4 Approve the establishment of an offer of just compensation based on a qualified appraisal and within approved project budget for property sought to be acquired, and direct payment to persons for such property so long as the payment amount does not exceed 110 percent of the appraised value, or $100,000 above the appraised value, whichever is greater, or the full satisfaction of court judgments regarding property valuation.

4.5 Reject all bids and/or suspend the competitive procurement process.

4.6 Provide the final determination to persons or firms filing a protest regarding SANDAG’s procurement or contracting process or procedures.

4.7 File administrative claims and to initiate and maintain lawsuits on behalf of the Board to recover for damage to or destruction of SANDAG property, or interruption of a public service.

4.8 Settle all lawsuits initiated under paragraph 4.7.

4.9 Settle all lawsuits that SANDAG must defend when the settlement amount does not exceed $100,000.

4.10 Accept reimbursement from member agencies for use of SANDAG on-call contracts.

4.11 Execute tolling agreements to extend the statute of limitations for litigation involving SANDAG as a potential plaintiff or defendant when deemed in the best interest of SANDAG by the Executive Director and Office of General Counsel.

4.12 Authorize transfers of funds in the SANDAG budget for capital improvement projects following approval of such a transfer by the affected transit operator’s board of directors or designated governing body.

4.13 Authorize the expenditure of Emergency Land Management Funds designated in the most recent Board-adopted Environmental Mitigation Program Funding Strategy based upon support from a cross-section of technical experts not affiliated with the request.
4.14 Modify the Board of Directors meeting agenda regarding issues that arise after the most recent Executive Committee meeting with the concurrence of Chair of the Board.

4.15 Execute Right-of-Way Certifications for submittal to the California Department of Transportation, and take all other actions necessary to facilitate the timely filing of such certifications, for SANDAG projects that are either on the State Highway System or for those off-system projects with federal funding.

4.16 Authorize writing off or compromising uncollectable debt in an amount not exceeding $5,000 per account when, in the judgment of the Director of Finance, after using all appropriate collection tools, it is likely that the full debt is uncollectible and that it would not be cost efficient to pursue collection of the entire debt.

4.17 Approve an addendum to a previously-approved Environmental Impact Report or Negative Declaration consistent with CEQA Section 15164 where only minor technical changes or additions are necessary.

5. The Executive Director shall act as the appointing authority for SANDAG with the authority to appoint, promote, transfer, discipline, and terminate all employees of SANDAG subject to the provisions of SANDAG’s Administrative Rules and Regulations.

6. The Executive Director shall prepare for the Board’s consideration, and shall update on a regular basis, an administrative policy that includes a process to conduct staff performance evaluations on a regular basis to determine if the knowledge, skills, and abilities of staff members are sufficient to perform their respective functions in order to allow the Board monitor the staff evaluation process on a regular basis.

7. Pursuant to Article V, Section 4, paragraph c of the Bylaws, the Executive Director shall promulgate an administrative policy governing the procedures for delegating his/her authority to other SANDAG staff.

Adopted October 2003
Amended November 2004
Amended December 2006
Amended December 2008
Amended February 2012
Amended November 2012
Amended October 2013
Amended November 2014
Amended January 2019
ALLOCATION OF RESPONSIBILITIES

1. Board and Policy Advisory Committees Responsibilities

Shown below are responsibilities for the Board of Directors and each of the six Policy Advisory Committees (Executive, Transportation, Regional Planning, Borders, Public Safety, and Audit). Selected responsibilities are delegated by the Board to the Policy Advisory Committees to allow SANDAG to effectively address key public policy and funding responsibilities. All items delegated to the Policy Advisory Committees are subject to Board ratification.

All functions not specifically delegated by the Board to a Policy Advisory Committee may be delegated to a Policy Advisory Committee on a one-time basis upon request by the Executive Director and approval by the Chair. Such actions shall be reported to the Board at its next regular meeting.

2. Board Responsibilities

2.1 Approve the Regional Plan, which merges the Regional Comprehensive Plan (RCP), the Regional Transportation Plan, and the Sustainable Communities Strategy as well as plan components and other regional plans (e.g., Regional Energy Plan, MHCP, etc.)

2.2 Approve Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP) and corridor studies

2.3 Fulfill responsibilities of the consolidated agency as set forth in the San Diego Regional Transportation Consolidation Act (Public Utilities Code §132350 et seq.)

2.4 Fulfill the responsibilities of the San Diego Regional Transportation Commission (RTC)

2.5 Approve programming of funds (TDA, CMAQ, STIP, etc.)

2.6 Certify/adopt project environmental documents pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act or the California Environmental Quality Act

2.7 Approve Overall Work Program and Program Budget

2.8 Approve amendments to the Program Budget and Overall Work Program and authorize contracts with consultants for amounts equal to or greater than the amounts to be determined for administrative and policy committee authorization.

2.9 Approve the annual legislative agenda

2.10 Provide policy direction through Policy Development Board meetings

2.11 Appoint Committees and Board officers

2.12 Delegate responsibilities to Policy Advisory Committees and ratify Committee actions. All items delegated to the five Policy Advisory Committees are subject to direct Board action upon request of any members.
2.13 Delegate responsibilities to Board Chair consistent with Board criteria. Conference sponsorships and proclamations are hereby delegated subject to current or subsequently approved criteria.

2.14 Develop and adopt an administration policy that includes a process to conduct staff performance evaluations on a regular basis to determine if the knowledge, skills, and abilities of staff members are sufficient to perform their respective functions and monitor the evaluation process on a regular basis.

2.15 Provide a report, developed by the Transportation Committee, to the Legislature consistent with Government Code section 9795 on or before July 1 of each year that outlines the public transit needs, transit funding criteria, recommended transit funding levels, and additional work on public transit, as delegated to the Transportation Committee by the Board, and specifying the funds spent explicitly on public transportation.

2.16 Develop and adopt internal control guidelines based on recommendations from the Audit Committee to prevent and detect financial errors and fraud based on the internal control guidelines developed by the state Controller pursuant to Government Code section 12422.5 and the standards adopted by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants.

2.17 Vote on whether to remove the independent performance auditor for cause, such removal being subject to an approving vote by two-thirds of the Audit Committee and the Board.

2.18 Approve which firm to contract with to conduct the annual financial statement audits.

2.19 Approve the individual or firm to hire to carry out independent performance auditor responsibilities.

2.20 Approve the budget needed to carry out the annual audit plan of the independent performance auditor.

3. **Executive Committee Membership and Responsibilities**

3.1 The Executive Committee shall consist of six voting members with board members representing East County, North County Coastal, North County Inland, South County, and the representative, or the representative's alternate in their absence, from the City of San Diego and the County. The Chair and Vice Chair of the Board shall serve as voting members of the Executive Committee. Additionally, any Chair of any other Policy Advisory Committee who is not otherwise a member of the Executive Committee shall serve as an advisory, non-voting member of the Executive Committee.

3.1.1 Set agenda for Board. Any Board member requesting that an item be considered for inclusion on the agenda must present such request in writing to the Chairperson prior to the Executive Committee's consideration of such agenda.

3.1.2 Review and recommend Overall Work Program and Program Budget

3.1.3 Approve amendments to the Program Budget and Overall Work Program and authorize contracts up to amount approved by the Board
3.1.4 Review and act on state and federal legislation
3.1.5 Comment on behalf of SANDAG or provide recommendations to the Board regarding comments on third party environmental documents
3.1.6 Act upon and evaluate dispute resolution
3.1.7 Advise on personnel actions
3.1.8 Act on behalf of Board when timing requires
3.1.9 Make policy recommendations to the Board
3.1.10 Perform other duties as assigned by the Board
3.1.11 Approve financial/contracting transactions, including selection of vendors, acceptance of funding, stipulations of any nature, and any resulting budget amendment up to $500,000, subject to increase by Board action.
3.1.12 Annually review a list of all the SANDAG lower-level committees and working groups to determine the need to maintain the committee or working group and approve any revisions in functions or membership.
3.1.13 Review all proposed amendments to the Bylaws or Board Policies and make recommendations to the Board regarding those amendments.
3.1.14 Conduct expedited reviews and approvals of Energy Working Group actions on an as-needed basis.

4. Transportation Committee Membership and Responsibilities

4.1 The Transportation Committee shall consist of ten voting members with board members or alternates representing East County, North County Coastal, North County Inland, South County and the mayor or a council member from the City of San Diego, a supervisor from the County of San Diego, a member of the board of the MTS appointed by the board of the MTS, a member of the board of the NCTD appointed by the board of the NCTD, a member of the board of the San Diego County Regional Airport Authority appointed by the board of the Airport Authority, and a member of the board of the San Diego Unified Port District appointed by the board of the Port District.

4.1.1 Provide oversight for consolidated transit responsibilities
4.1.2 Provide policy oversight for transportation plans and corridor and systems studies
4.1.3 Establish/approve transportation prioritization criteria for SANDAG programs
4.1.4 Approve of SANDAG submitting grant applications for SANDAG transportation projects.
4.1.5 Approve TDA and STA claim amendments and RTIP and STIP amendments
4.1.6 Recommend funding allocations to the Board
4.1.7 Approve transit operator budgets for funding
4.1.8 Approve Regional Short Range Transit Plan and Coordinated Human Service and Public Transportation Plan
4.1.9 Make recommendations regarding changes to Board Policy No. 018: Transit Service Policy and Board Policy No. 029: Regional Fare Policy and Comprehensive Fare Ordinance

4.1.10 Conduct public hearings as delegated by Board

4.1.11 Approve contracts for transit up to amount approved by the Board

4.1.12 Advise Board on other transportation policy-level issues

4.1.13 Recommend legislative program for transportation and transit

4.1.14 Approve financial/contracting transactions, including selection of vendors, acceptance of funding, stipulations of any nature, and any resulting budget amendment up to $500,000 for transportation items, subject to increase by Board action

4.1.15 Convene closed sessions and make final decisions with regard to real property transactions related to transportation projects; however, this delegation does not include the authority to make a Resolution of Necessity or to commence litigation

4.1.16 Conduct hearings and authorize additional public meetings when appropriate pursuant to Board Policy No. 025 to hear official testimony from the public regarding Comprehensive Fare Ordinance amendments

4.1.17 Approve amendments to the Comprehensive Fare Ordinance

4.1.18 Accept for distribution, hold public hearings regarding, and adopt/certify environmental documents for projects within the Transportation Committee’s Responsibilities

4.1.19 Approve loans of TransNet funds when such loans are incorporated into an RTIP amendment requiring an exchange of TransNet funds for funds from another source

4.1.20 Provide oversight and approvals for Coordinated Transportation Services Agency (CTSA) matters and appoint Transportation Committee representative to the CTSA Board

4.1.21 Approve revisions to funding allocations for Federal Transit Administration Section 5311 funding

4.1.22 Approve the TransNet compliance audits consistent with Board Policy No. 031: TransNet Ordinance and Expenditure Plan Rules

4.1.23 Provide input on project selection criteria for, and recommend projects for funding under, the statewide and TransNet active transportation programs, and other TransNet grant programs such as the Smart Growth Incentive Program and Environmental Mitigation Program

4.1.24 Provide oversight for Service Authority for Freeway Emergencies responsibilities and related motorist aid programs
4.1.25 Provide coordinated oversight with the Regional Planning Committee for recommendations on the preparation and implementation of components of the Regional Plan

4.1.26 Develop a report by July 1 of each year that specifies the funds spent explicitly on public transportation, outlines the public transit needs, transit funding criteria, recommended transit funding levels, and additional work on public transit, and recommend acceptance of such report to the Board.

5. **Regional Planning Committee Membership and Responsibilities**

5.1 The Regional Planning Committee shall consist of six voting members with board members or alternates representing East County, North County Coastal, North County Inland, South County, and the mayor or a council member from the City of San Diego, and a supervisor from the County of San Diego.

5.1.1 Provide coordinated oversight with the Transportation Committee for recommendations on the preparation and implementation of components of the Regional Plan

5.1.2 Recommend regional infrastructure financing strategies to the Board

5.1.3 Represent the Board for outreach and public information on the Regional Plan and its components

5.1.4 Advise Board on regional planning policy issues

5.1.5 Approve distribution of funds from the California Coastal Commission Beach Sand Mitigation Fund and California Coastal Commission Public Recreational Beach Impact Mitigation Fund.

5.1.6 Recommend project selection criteria for, and recommend projects for funding under, the TransNet Smart Growth Incentive Program and Environmental Mitigation Program

6. **Borders Committee Membership and Responsibilities**

6.1 The Borders Committee shall consist of seven voting members with board members or alternates representing East County, North County Coastal, North County Inland, South County and the mayor or a council member from the City of San Diego, a supervisor from the County of San Diego, and a mayor, council member, or supervisor from the County of Imperial.

6.1.1 Provide oversight for planning activities that impact the borders

6.1.2 Provide oversight for the preparation of binational, interregional, and tribal planning programs

6.1.3 Recommend border infrastructure financing strategies to the Board

6.1.4 Establish closer SANDAG working relations with surrounding counties, Mexico, and the region’s tribal nations

6.1.5 Advise Board on binational, interregional, and tribal policy-level issues

6.1.6 Review and comment on regionally significant projects in adjoining counties
7. **Audit Committee Membership and Responsibilities**

The membership, authority and responsibilities for this committee are set forth in Board Policy No. 039.

8. **Public Safety Committee Membership and Responsibilities**

The membership, authority and responsibilities for this committee are set forth in Board Policy No. 026.

9. **Distribution of Meeting Materials**

9.1 All agendas for meetings of the Board of Directors, Policy Advisory Committees, and all other SANDAG legislative bodies covered by the Brown Act (Government Code § 54950 et seq.) shall be posted on the SANDAG website, and copies of such agendas will be available for viewing by the public in the SANDAG business office reception area.

9.2 All closed session items shall be provided to appropriate Board and/or Policy Advisory Committee members prior to the closed session. Closed session meeting materials will be sent by a secure method and clearly labeled as confidential. If a representative will not be able to attend a meeting he/she should ensure the closed session materials are forwarded to the appropriate alternate to review prior to the meeting. All closed session meeting materials must be deleted or returned to the Office of General Counsel at the end of the closed session.

10. **Work Assigned to Staff**

Requests for staff to perform work on a project that is not specified in the Overall Work Program or Program Budget shall only be conducted following approval by the Board if the work is estimated to exceed four hours of staff time.

Adopted January 2003
Amended November 2004
Amended January 2006
Amended December 2006
Amended January 2010
Amended December 2012
Amended October 2013
Amended March 2014
Amended November 2014
Amended December 2015
Amended January 2017
Amended February 2018
Amended January 2019
Interstate 15
Express Lanes Configuration

I-15 Express Lanes Facts and Features

• 20 miles of flexible travel on I-15 between SR 78 and SR 163
• Jointly operated by SANDAG, Caltrans, and MTS
• Concrete moveable barrier separated from the main lanes for 16 miles
• Moveable barrier allows lane flexibility from northbound (NB) to southbound (SB) and vice versa
I-15 Express Lanes Success

Southbound I-15 from SR 78 to SR 163
Average Weekday Travel Times by Time of Day

Northbound I-15 from SR 163 to SR 78
Average Weekday Travel Times by Time of Day
I-15 Express Lanes
Volumes Southbound

I-15 Southbound HOV Volume (vehicles/hour) by Time of Day

I-15 Express Lanes
Volumes Northbound

I-15 Northbound HOV Volume (vehicles/hour) by Time of Day
Travel Times / Average Speed

- Southbound times 15-16 minutes Monday through Friday
- Minimum average southbound speeds 65+ mph Monday through Friday
- Northbound times 15-21 minutes Monday through Friday
- Minimum average northbound speeds 59 mph Monday through Friday

What’s Next?

- CMT Meeting Quarterly
- Implement Recommendations
- Continually Review/Analyze Traffic Data
- Recommend Modifications as Needed