Proposed Amendments to the Regional Transit Comprehensive Fare Ordinance and *TransNet* Ordinance

Independent Taxpayer Oversight Committee | Item 10 | January 9, 2019

Goals

- Simplify fare structure
- Revenue neutral or positive outcome
- Minimize ridership loss
Timeline

- Data collection: October 2016 – February 2017
- Development of fare proposals: June 2017 – August 2018
- Modeling revenue and ridership impacts: June 2017 – December 2018
- Transfer analysis: February – March 2018
- Public input: September – November 2018
- MTS Board: December 13, 2018
- NCTD Board: December 20, 2018
- Title VI analysis: December 2018
- Recommend new fare structure: Early 2019

Basis for Proposed Fare Changes

- Operational costs over the past 10 years have increased
- Decrease in fare revenue
- Fares have remained unchanged
- Resulting increase in fare revenue, maintain high levels of service
- Simplify fare structure across the region
- Enable future support of customer friendly policies (i.e., fare capping)
Basis for Proposed Fare Changes

- Regional fare simplification to enhance customer riding experience
- Most fares have not increased since 2009
  - NCTD decreased most fares in 2011
- Decline in fare revenue
- Operational costs have increased
- Need to increase investment in capital improvement program to support state of good repair needs
Fare Table After Simplification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>One-Way Cash</th>
<th>Day Pass</th>
<th>30-Day/Monthly</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adult/Youth</td>
<td>SDM Adult</td>
<td>SDM/Youth Adult</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTS Bus, Rapid, Express, Trolley, NCTD BREEZE and SPRINTER</td>
<td>$2.50</td>
<td>$1.25</td>
<td>$6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTS Rapid Express/ Premium and NCTD FLEX</td>
<td>$5</td>
<td>$2.50</td>
<td>$12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTS Rural</td>
<td>$8</td>
<td>$4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTS Access/NCTD LIFT</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>$5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>One-Way Cash</th>
<th>Day Pass</th>
<th>30-Day/Monthly</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adult/Youth</td>
<td>SDM/Youth</td>
<td>SDM/Youth Adult</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCTD COASTER 1 Zone</td>
<td>$5</td>
<td>$2.50</td>
<td>$15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCTD COASTER 2 Zones</td>
<td>$5.75</td>
<td>$2.75</td>
<td>$15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCTD COASTER 3 Zones</td>
<td>$6.50</td>
<td>$3.25</td>
<td>$15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Public Engagement and Feedback

• Engagement
  – 6 open houses
  – 14 MTS Station pop-ups and online surveys
  – 3 NCTD Station pop-ups and online surveys
  – Phone, email, webpage, social media, press releases

• Feedback
  – More than 600 comments received
  – Many opposed SDM and paratransit fare increases
  – Some support for Youth fare decreases
  – Many understood it has been 10 years since last increase
Overview of Proposed Changes

- Single one-way fare price ($2.50) for MTS Bus, Trolley, Rapid, SPRINTER, and BREEZE ($5 for ADA Paratransit)
  
- Newly added $3 Day Pass for Seniors/Disabled/Medicare (SDM) and Youth for MTS Bus, Trolley, Rapid, SPRINTER, and BREEZE
  
- No change to $72 Regional Monthly Pass (eliminate SPRINTER/BREEZE monthly pass)
  
- One discounted monthly pass price of $23 for SDM and Youth for MTS Bus, Trolley, Rapid, SPRINTER, and BREEZE*
  
- Increase minimum age for senior discounts from 60 to 65 years (seniors 60 or older prior to the effective date will remain eligible for reduced fares)*

*TransNet Ordinance amendment required

---

Overview of Proposed Changes

- Price increase for COASTER one-way, Day Pass, and 30-Day/ Monthly Passes

- Newly added one-way Youth COASTER one-way discount

- Newly added $7.50 Day Pass for Seniors/Disabled/Medicare and Youth for COASTER

- Increase Adult Regional Day Pass to $6

- Elimination of 2, 3, 4, and 14-day passes

- Elimination of free Trolley-to-Trolley transfers to align with bus policy (bus transfers eliminated in 2008, Day Passes introduced)
Overview of Fare Change Impacts

- Estimated annual revenue increase of $7.6 million (7%)
  - MTS: $5.2 million (6%)
  - NCTD: $2.4 million (16%)
- Estimated annual ridership decrease of 3.0 million (-3%)
  - MTS: 2.5 million fewer riders (-3%)
  - NCTD: 0.5 million fewer riders (-5%)

Title VI Fare Equity Analysis

- SANDAG Board Policy for Title VI Equity Analysis
  - 10% threshold for disparate impacts or disproportionate burdens
- 72% of all riders are minority
  - 67% of those adversely affected are minority
    - Not a disparate impact on minority population
- 66% of all riders are low-income
  - 66% of those adversely affected are low-income
    - Not a disproportionate burden on low-income population
### Next Steps

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Anticipated Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Committee (TC) Recommendation</td>
<td>January 4, 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Taxpayer Oversight Committee Recommendation</td>
<td>January 9, 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANDAG Board of Directors – First Reading</td>
<td>January 25, 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANDAG Board of Directors – Second Reading and Approval</td>
<td>February 8, 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ordinance Amendment Enactment</td>
<td>March 2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Recommendation

The ITOC is asked to recommend that the Board of Directors adopt the proposed amendments to the Comprehensive Fare Ordinance and *TransNet* Ordinance.
2018 Regional Monitoring Report

TransNet Independent Taxpayer Oversight Committee | Item 13
January 9, 2019

San Diego Forward: The Regional Plan

Performance Monitoring Indicators (Appendix S)

- Supporting a healthy environment
- Creating a more vibrant economy
- Incorporating innovative mobility and planning
### Monitoring Indicators

**Healthy Environment and Communities**
- Habitat conserved within designated preserve areas
- Beach widths
- Impaired waterbodies
- Air quality
- **Fatalities/Serious injuries per Vehicle Miles Traveled**
  - Share of new housing units and jobs located in Smart Growth Opportunity Areas
  - Share of new housing units within County Water Authority water service boundary
- Water consumption
- Diversity of water supply
- Diversity of energy supply and use
- Electric and natural gas consumption by sector

**BOLD = new indicator**

---

### Regional Plan Monitoring Indicators

**Vibrant Economy**
- **Travel times to jobs**
- Real per capita income, compared with California and the United States
- Regional poverty rate, compared with California and the United States
- Percent of households with housing costs greater than 35 percent of income
- Annual income needed to afford fair market rent
- Regional crime rate

**BOLD = new indicator**
Regional Plan Monitoring Indicators

Innovative Mobility and Planning

Travel times and volumes for all modes

Commuter mode share

Annual transit boardings

Border wait times

Border crossing volumes

Alternative fuel vehicle ownership

BOLD = new indicator

Regional Performance Indicators

• Moving in the right direction
• Areas for improvement
Commute

Travel Time to Jobs (Minutes), 2005–2017

Travel Times

Freeway Travel Times in Key Auto Corridors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corridor</th>
<th>Length (Miles)</th>
<th>AM Peak 2006 (Minutes)</th>
<th>AM Peak 2011 (Minutes)</th>
<th>AM Peak 2017 (Minutes)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I-5 Oceanside to Downtown</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-805 Chula Vista to Sorrento Valley</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-15 Escondido to Downtown San Diego</td>
<td>29.3</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SR 52 Santee to Kearny Mesa</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SR 56 Poway to Carmel Valley</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Travel Times

Freeway Travel Times in Key Auto Corridors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corridor</th>
<th>Length (Miles)</th>
<th>PM Peak 2006 (Minutes)</th>
<th>PM Peak 2011 (Minutes)</th>
<th>PM Peak 2017 (Minutes)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I-5 Oceanside to Downtown</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-805 Chula Vista to Sorrento Valley</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-15 Escondido to Downtown San Diego</td>
<td>29.3</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SR 52 Santee to Kearny Mesa</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SR 56 Poway to Carmel Valley</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Bike Volumes

Bike Volumes (Annual Daily Bidirectional Average) 2012-2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regional Bikeway Corridor</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bayshore Bikeway, Chula Vista</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>476</td>
<td>469</td>
<td>437</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inland Rail Trail, San Marcos</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Park, San Diego</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>269</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uptown: Fourth and Fifth Avenue Bikeways, San Diego</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Park</td>
<td>Mid-City: Landis Bikeway, San Diego</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coastal Rail Trail: Rose Canyon, San Diego°</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>461</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uptown: Eastern Hillcrest Bikeways, San Diego</td>
<td>585</td>
<td>578</td>
<td>559</td>
<td>498</td>
<td>399</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coastal Rail Trail: Highway 101, Solana Beach</td>
<td>1,171</td>
<td>945</td>
<td>1,039</td>
<td>1,037</td>
<td>851</td>
<td>822</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Commute Mode Shares

Percent of Commuters by Primary Mode of Work Commute, 2016

Percent of Commuters by Primary Mode of Work Commute

Drive Alone
Carpool/Vanpool
Transit
Walk
Bike
Work at Home
Other

Transit Boardings

Annual transit boardings, 2005–2017
Lessons and Takeaways

- Challenges facing the region
- Change takes time
- Similar issues facing California and United States
- Identify course corrections in San Diego Forward: 2019-2050 Regional Plan
- Continue to monitor progress
Next Steps

- Release Draft Regional Performance Monitoring Report
- Final Report to Board of Directors