COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES
The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) may take action on any item appearing on this agenda.

Tuesday, November 1, 2016
3 to 4:30 p.m.
SANDAG, 7th Floor Conference Room
401 B Street, Suite 800
San Diego, CA 92101

Please take the elevator to the 8th floor to access the meeting room.

Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas
(619) 699-1972
hector.vanegas@sandag.org

AGENDA HIGHLIGHTS

• A FRESH LOOK AT IMPACTS OF THE BORDER DELAYS AT CALIFORNIA-BAJA CALIFORNIA PORTS OF ENTRY

• SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS GOODS MOVEMENT BORDER CROSSING STUDY - PHASE II

SANDAG offices are accessible by public transit. Phone 511 or visit 511sd.com for route information. Secure bicycle parking is available in the building garage off Fourth Avenue.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact SANDAG at (619) 699-1900 at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1900, (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905.
Welcome to SANDAG. Members of the public may speak to the Working Group on any item at the time the Working Group is considering the item. Please complete a Speaker's Slip, and then present the slip to the Clerk of the Working Group. Members of the public may address the Working Group on any issue under the agenda item entitled Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments. Public speakers are limited to three minutes or less per person unless otherwise directed by the Chair. The Working Group may take action on any item appearing on the agenda.

Public comments regarding the agenda can be sent to SANDAG via comment@sandag.org. Please include the agenda item, your name, and your organization. Email comments should be received no later than 12 noon, two working days prior to the meeting. Any handouts, presentations, or other materials from the public intended for distribution at the meeting should be received by the Clerk of the Working Group no later than 12 noon, two working days prior to the meeting.

In order to keep the public informed in an efficient manner and facilitate public participation, SANDAG also provides access to all agenda and meeting materials online at www.sandag.org/meetings. Additionally, interested persons can sign up for e-notifications via our e-distribution list at either the SANDAG website or by sending an email request to webmaster@sandag.org.

SANDAG operates its programs without regard to race, color, and national origin in compliance with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act. SANDAG has developed procedures for investigating and tracking Title VI complaints and the procedures for filing a complaint are available to the public upon request. Questions concerning SANDAG nondiscrimination obligations or complaint procedures should be directed to SANDAG General Counsel, John Kirk, at (619) 699-1997 or john.kirk@sandag.org. Any person who believes himself or herself or any specific class of persons to be subjected to discrimination prohibited by Title VI also may file a written complaint with the Federal Transit Administration.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact SANDAG at (619) 699-1900 at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting. To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1900, (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905.

SANDAG agenda materials can be made available in alternative languages. To make a request call (619) 699-1900 at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

Los materiales de la agenda de SANDAG están disponibles en otros idiomas. Para hacer una solicitud, llame al (619) 699-1900 al menos 72 horas antes de la reunión.

如有需要，我们可以把SANDAG议程材料翻译成其他语言。

请在会议前至少 72 小时打电话 (619) 699-1900 提出请求。

SANDAG offices are accessible by public transit.

Phone 511 or visit 511sd.com for route information. Bicycle parking is available in the parking garage of the SANDAG offices.

To access the meeting room please arrive on the 8th floor.
COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES
Tuesday, November 1, 2016

ITEM NO. RECOMMENDATION

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

   The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) is asked to
   review and approve the minutes from its September 6, 2016, meeting.

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS

   Members of the public shall have the opportunity to address the COBRO on
   any issue within the jurisdiction of SANDAG that is not on this agenda.
   Anyone desiring to speak shall reserve time by completing a “Request to
   Speak” form and giving it to the COBRO coordinator prior to speaking. Public
   speakers should notify the COBRO coordinator if they have a handout for
   distribution to COBRO members. Public speakers are limited to three minutes
   or less per person. COBRO members also may provide information and
   announcements under this agenda item.

CONSENT

4. UPCOMING EVENTS

REPORTS

5. A FRESH LOOK AT IMPACTS OF THE BORDER DELAYS AT
   CALIFORNIA-BAJA CALIFORNIA PORTS OF ENTRY (Elisa Arias)

   In an effort to bring to date and expand the findings obtained in the 2006
   study, the current Border Delays study seeks to assess not only the economic
   impact but the environmental repercussions of delays at ports of entry, in a
   post-Great Recession economy that has seen the emergence of new industry
   clusters. Elisa Arias will present an update on the findings made and
   challenges faced by the research team.

6. SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS GOODS
   MOVEMENT BORDER CROSSING STUDY - PHASE II
   (Mike Jones, SCAG)

   Mike Jones, Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG), will
   present a report on Phase II of the Goods Movement Border Crossing Study,
   launched with the goal of assessing the mobility of commerce at the
   California-Baja California border. Phase II of this study aims to develop freight
   planning strategies to address long-term trade and transportation
   infrastructure needs in the border region. The report will present an overview
   of the study and results, and recommendations from the effort.
7. NEXT MEETING DATE

The next meeting of COBRO is scheduled for Tuesday, February 7, 2017, at 3 p.m.

+ next to an item indicates an attachment
SEPTEMBER 6, 2016, MEETING MINUTES

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION

The meeting of the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) was called to order by Chair Paul Ganster, Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias at San Diego State University, at 3:08 p.m.

Chair Ganster welcomed members of COBRO and members of the public, and welcomed the new members of COBRO.

2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES (APPROVE)

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Efrain Ibarra, South San Diego County, and a second by Nathan Owens, Global Connect, COBRO approved the minutes from the June 7, 2016, meeting. Yes – Chair Ganster; Vice Chair Ibarra; Toby Sosbee, U.S. Customs and Border Protection; Viviana Ibanez; Andy Hall; Alicia Lopez, Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego; Nicola Bernard, Caltrans; Vivian Salazar, City of Tijuana; Justine Kozo, County of San Diego; Dr. Tito Alegría, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte; Heidy Salum; Nora Marquez, IMPLAN; Nathan Owens, San Diego Dialogue; Paola Avila, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce; and Rodolfo Argote, Universidad Iberoamericana. No – None. Abstain – None.

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS

Laura Araujo, Tijuana Innovadora, notified the group of Tijuana Innovadora’s bi-annual event to be held from November 3-10, 2016.

Andy Hall, City of Imperial Beach, provided an update on the Fiesta Del Mar event held on April 30, 2016. Mr. Hall mentioned that he would like to work with COBRO to be involved for next year’s event.

Alicia Lopez, Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego, announced that Consul General Remedios Gomez-Arnau’s successor, Consul General Marcela Celorio, will arrive in the coming days.

Chair Ganster shared an update on behalf of Cindy Gomper Graves, South County Economic Development Council (EDC), on the passing of Doug Perkins, the past Executive Director of South County EDC and long-time member.
Denise Moreno Ducheny, Center for U.S.-Mexican Studies at UC San Diego, added that the funeral services for Mr. Perkins will be held on Friday, June 10, 2016, in Solana Beach.

Hector Vanegas, SANDAG, introduced Nicola Bernard, Caltrans District 11.

CONSENT

4. UPCOMING EVENTS (INFORMATION)

Chair Ganster announced the item and asked the group to refer to their agenda packet for more details on the item.

Action: This item was presented for information.

5. RECENT SANDAG EFFORTS TO SUPPORT BORDER TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE (INFORMATION)

Hector Vanegas, SANDAG, presented the item.

Chair Ganster announced the item and asked the group to refer to their agenda packet for details on the item.

Action: This item was presented for information.

REPORTS

6. CALIFORNIA SUSTAINABLE FREIGHT ACTION PLAN: UPDATE REPORT (INFORMATION)

Chris Schmidt, Caltrans, presented the item and provided an update on the California Sustainable Freight Action Plan released by state agency leaders on July 29, 2016, in response to Governor Brown’s Executive Order B-32-15. The Action Plan is a comprehensive document that serves as a blueprint for transforming the state’s multi-billion dollar freight transport system into one that is environmentally cleaner, more efficient, and more economically competitive than it is today.

Action: This item was presented for information.

7. 2016 TIJUANA INNOVADORA EVENT UPDATE (INFORMATION)

Laura Araujo, Tijuana Innovadora, presented an update on Tijuana Innovadora an organization composed of border region residents who work together to promote innovative ideas to improve the City of Tijuana and the region.

Action: This item was presented for information.
8. UPDATE ON THE BINATIONAL REGION’S STUDENT POPULATION AND WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT STUDY (INFORMATION)

Melissa Floca, Center for U.S.-Mexican Studies at UC San Diego, provided an update on research findings and future plans for the Binational Student Population and Workforce Development Study. The focus of this study was to understand the nexus between the binational region’s workforce development needs, available opportunities, and challenges that the binational student population faces as they prepare to integrate into the workforce post-graduation.

Action: This item was presented for information.

9. NEXT MEETING DATE (INFORMATION)

The next COBRO meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, November 1, 2016, at 3 p.m.

10. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Ganster adjourned the meeting at 4:29 p.m.
UPCOMING EVENTS

WHAT: Tijuana Innovadora 2016 – “Creativa”
Tijuana Innovadora / Tijuana Verde
WHEN: November 3-10, 2016
WHERE: World Trade Center Tijuana – Paseo del Parque No. 18025, Rio Tercera Etapa, Tijuana, Baja California CP 22654
MORE INFO: laura.araujo@tijuanainnovadora.com or www.tijuanainnovadora.com

WHAT: TEDx Tijuana 2016
TEDx Tijuana
WHEN: November 5, 2016 – 8:30 a.m. - 2 p.m.
WHERE: El Trompo Museum – Libramiento los Insurgentes s/n, Rio Tijuana Tercera Etapa, Tijuana, Baja California CP 22226
MORE INFO: https://www.eventbrite.com/e/tedxtijuana-2016-tickets-27964961954

WHAT: Surf the Border Surf Contest
Surf Rider San Diego’s No Border Sewage Committee/Surf Rider Baja California
WHEN: November 6, 2016 – 7 a.m.
WHERE: Border Field State Park and Playas de Tijuana
MORE INFO: https://sandiego.surfrider.org/2016/08/12/surftheborder/

WHAT: Binational Golf Tournament III (MX)
San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce
WHEN: November 11, 2016 – 1 - 5 p.m.
WHERE: Club Campestre Tijuana - Boulevard Agua Caliente 11311, Col. Aviacion, Tijuana, Baja California CP 22020
MORE INFO: Jason M-B Wells: at (619) 428-5200 or www.sanysidrochamber.org

WHAT: 43rd INDEX Maquiladora Convention
INDEX
WHEN: November 16-18, 2016
WHERE: Baja California Center – Carretera Tijuana-Ensenada, Escenica 1029, ejido Mazatlán, Rosarito, Baja California
MORE INFO: convencion@index.org.mx
WHAT:  International Tribute Dinner  
San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce  
WHEN:  December 8, 2016 – 5 - 8 p.m.  
WHERE:  Hilton San Diego Bayfront – 1 Park Boulevard, San Diego, CA 92101  
MORE INFO:  English:  Katie Truong at (619) 544-1370 or ktruong@sdchamber.org  
Spanish:  Mayra Vazquez at (619) 544-1316 or mvazquez@sdchamber.org

WHAT:  La Posada Sin Fronteras 2016  
Friendship Park/Parque de la Amistad  
WHEN:  TBD  
WHERE:  Friendship Park at Border Field State Park – Via Frontera, San Diego, CA 92154  
Parque de La Amistad – Paseo Costero 728, Costa, Monumental, Tijuana, Baja California  
MORE INFO:  http://www.friendshippark.org/events

Key Staff Contact:  Hector Vanegas, (619) 699-1972, hector.vanegas@sandag.org
Introduction

The San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG), in collaboration with the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) and the Imperial County Transportation Commission (ICTC), has initiated a study to assess both the economic and air quality/climate impacts caused by border delays at California-Baja California ports of entry (POEs). About ten years ago, these partner agencies conducted the first landmark studies that measured economic impacts of border wait times at the San Diego region-Baja California POEs and at the Imperial County-Baja California POEs. Much has changed since these earlier studies – the local economy has rebounded from the Great Recession and new emerging industry clusters depend on cross-border trade. This report provides an overview of California-Mexico border region, key study tasks, and progress to date.

Discussion

A brief profile of the California-Mexico border

California and Baja California share a 150-mile long international border. The population of San Diego and Imperial Counties and the State of Baja California reached nearly 6.8 million in 2015 and is forecast to grow to approximately 10 million by 2040.¹ The close proximity between cities and communities on both sides of the border has resulted in interdependent relationships including shared economic and environmental concerns, border infrastructure, and a linked transportation system, among others.

As shown in Attachment 1, six land POEs connect the California-Baja California binational region: San Ysidro-Puerta México, Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay, Tecate-Tecate, Calexico West-Mexicali I, Calexico East-Mexicali II, and Andrade-Los Algodones. In addition, the Cross Border Xpress (CBX) facility opened in December 2015. CBX is an enclosed pedestrian skybridge that connects a terminal in Otay Mesa directly to the Tijuana International Airport terminal. The CBX border crossing can only be used by ticketed airport passengers for a fee. The Otay Mesa East-Mesa de Otay II POE is a new land border crossing under development.

¹ California-Baja California Border Master Plan, 2014 Update, Caltrans & State of Baja California Secretariat of Infrastructure and Urban Development (SIDUE).
The Otay Mesa POE is the busiest gateway for trade between California and Mexico and ranks third in value of trade along the entire U.S.-Mexico border. In 2015 it handled more than $42 billion in two-way trade by truck. The Calexico East POE ranks seventh in value of trade in the southern border and processed more than $16 billion in imports and exports carried by trucks in 2015.

Ninety-nine percent of surface trade across the California-Baja California POEs moves by truck. Rail carried approximately $297 million in two-way trade in 2015, with the vast majority of goods crossing at the Imperial County POEs.

Also in 2015, more than 55 million individuals crossed northbound from Baja California into San Diego and Imperial counties through the six land POEs, as well as 16.6 million pedestrians. A similar number of people is estimated to travel southbound.

**Key Study Tasks**

With assistance from a consultant team the study will encompass key tasks outlined below. A Project Study Team, with participation of staff from Caltrans District 11, ICTC, and SANDAG, meets regularly to provide technical input.

- Assess gaps in border data with a focus on economic, emissions, and border crossing wait time information as well as volume of crossings for vehicles and pedestrians
- Conduct economic and emissions surveys at the California-Baja California POEs
- Collect border wait time data at the California-Baja California POEs and evaluate technologies to monitor wait times
- Develop and implement economic and air quality/climate outreach plans
- Estimate economic and air quality/climate impacts of border delays (northbound and southbound)
- Develop study recommendations

The study is anticipated to be completed in fall 2017.

**Study Progress**

The data gaps analysis was completed in August 2016. It identified lack of available or recent economic information on crossborder trip expenditures, wait time threshold for cancelling trips, and for switching transportation modes due to congestion at POEs. For most POEs, there is a lack of information to estimate emissions, such as vehicle age and class, fuel type, and participation in vehicle emission inspection programs. Also, limited data exists on the breakdown of crossing times by segment (e.g., approach to queue, from end of queue to arrival at primary inspection, etc.). In general, there is very limited availability of southbound data (wait times, origin and destination, frequency of crossings). The study will rely on traffic volumes and data on border crossing trips from Caltrans and federal agencies.

---

2 HDR is the prime consultant and the economic lead, T. Kear Transportation Planning & Management is the air quality/climate lead, Crossborder Group is the data collection lead, and Sutra Research is the technology lead.

3 Emissions studies have been conducted at the San Ysidro, Calexico West, and Calexico East in the northbound direction in the past five years.
A survey methodology and survey questionnaires were developed for at-border surveys that will be conducted in three “waves:” summer, fall, and late fall/early winter 2017 at the six land POEs. The questionnaires were pre-tested at the Otay Mesa POE in late June. Economic and air emission surveys are conducted by mode: private vehicles, commercial vehicles or trucks, and buses. Pedestrians are asked the economic questions only. The surveys are applied by type of lane, such as general, Secure Electronic Network for Travelers Rapid Inspection (SENTRI), Free and Secure Trade (FAST), etc.\textsuperscript{4} The first wave of surveys has been completed and the second wave is underway.

In addition, data on border crossing times was collected at the six land POEs during the 4th of July holiday weekend as a peak season. Additional data collection will be conducted for trucks and for both passenger vehicles and trucks during non-peak seasons.

**Next Steps**

Upcoming tasks include conducting additional data collection at the POEs, preparing economic and air quality/climate outreach plans, developing economic and emissions model methodologies, and conducting stakeholder outreach. Findings from surveys and other data collection efforts will be shared with COBRO at future meetings.

Attachment: 1. California-Baja California Ports of Entry Map

Key Staff Contact: Elisa Arias, (619) 699-1936, elisa.arias@sandag.org

\textsuperscript{4} The SENTRI or Secure Electronic Network for Travelers Rapid Inspection program provides expedited Customs and Border Protection (CBP) processing for preapproved, low-risk travelers using their personal vehicle or crossing on foot. The FAST or Free and Secure Trade program is a commercial clearance program for known low-risk shipments entering the U.S. from Canada and Mexico.
DATE: September 29, 2016

TO: Transportation Committee (TC)

FROM: Mike Jones, Senior Regional Planner, (213) 236-1978, jonesm@scag.ca.gov

SUBJECT: SCAG Goods Movement Border Crossing Study - Phase II

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S APPROVAL: [Signature]

RECOMMENDED ACTION:
For Information Only – No Action Required.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:
SCAG recently completed the SCAG Goods Movement Border Crossing Study – Phase II to assess the mobility of commerce at the California – Baja California border, and develop freight planning strategies to address long-term trade and transportation infrastructure needs in the border region. The study gathered and synthesized information on goods moving across the U.S. – Mexico border through the Imperial County and San Diego County international land ports-of-entry (POEs). The effort developed and tested three different scenarios - baseline, optimistic, and pessimistic – to evaluate future trade projections of freight flows to assist SCAG and other regional stakeholders in their assessment of future infrastructure needs and general planning efforts. Major steps included the comprehensive study of bi-national trade and emerging business decisions and logistics strategies that affect the border region, transportation data collection (drayage and true origin - destination data by truck, rail, and intermodal transfers), and conceptualization and analysis of transportation infrastructure needs for regional ports-of-entry based on the potential trade flow scenarios. The project also assessed the nexus between the most critical commercial ports-of-entry, seaports (e.g., San Pedro Bay Ports), and areas of high freight concentrations such as warehouse and distribution clusters in the Inland Empire. SCAG staff will present an overview of the study and results and recommendations from the effort.

STRATEGIC PLAN:
This item supports SCAG’s Strategic Plan Goal 1: Improve Regional Decision Making by Providing Leadership and Consensus Building on Key Plans and Policies, Objective a: Create and facilitate a collaborative and cooperative environment to produce forward thinking regional plans.

BACKGROUND:
Mexico is the third largest trading partner of the U.S. behind Canada and China with $531 billion in trade in 2015. This trade volume accounted for over 14 percent of total U.S. foreign trade, growing by more than 2 percent since 2008. Annually, a total of $50 billion in two-way trade, or 13 percent of U.S. land exports to, and imports from, Mexico passes through the California – Baja California border (both San Diego and Imperial County ports-of-entry). California is the second largest exporter to Mexico amongst the 50 U.S. states (behind only Texas). In 2015, the state exported $26.8 billion worth of goods to Mexico accounting for over 16.2 percent of California’s overall goods exports. California is also the second largest domestic U.S. importer of Mexican goods, accounting for almost 15.3 percent of all...
Mexican imports. Trucking is the dominant mode of transportation for cross-border trade. Trade value by truck increased by over 22 percent between 2005 and 2015. Incoming trucks at the California – Baja California border increased by approximately 8 percent over the past decade to 1.22 million trucks in 2015.

Today’s global economy and time-based competition demand efficient freight transportation networks serve as extremely critical links between manufacturers, distributors, and consumers. Agencies across the U.S. are faced with the difficult task of proactively planning for adequate transportation infrastructure and freight facilities that enhance goods movement in their region. This is particularly challenging for border regions with limited information on true origin-destination patterns and end-to-end travel times. Effective planning requires identification of true origin and destination points, because freight network commodity flows often utilize secondary and tertiary points that do not originate or end in the area of jurisdiction of the responsible planning authority. Such planning should not only seek to understand freight flows, reduce current congestion delay, and improve travel time reliability and safety, but also anticipate potential shifts of commodity flows and traffic, and the associated ramifications across modes, routes, and ports-of-entry. The completed study aimed to assess the mobility of commerce at the California – Baja California border, and develop freight planning strategies to address long-term trade and transportation infrastructure potential needs in the border region.

The key findings from the study included:

- Border crossing traffic flows are large, but are not as significant, in terms of volume, compared to the domestic flows of goods in the region.
- Bottlenecks in the SCAG and SANDAG region are not the result of border-crossing flows, but are affected by them.
- The economic impact of drayage in the SCAG and SANDAG region is considerable.
- The movement of goods across the California – Baja California is of national significance.

Using key findings, a number of recommendations were developed. These include, but are not limited to:

- Prioritizing investment in projects to remove identified highway bottlenecks.
- Investing in greater capacity at land ports-of-entry.
- Promoting modal diversification in the region to leverage the region’s strategic location.
- Promoting the use of streamlined processes and state-of-the-art technological advances.
- Promoting higher levels of coordination between agencies and stakeholders to achieve the efficient shipment of goods across the border.

**FISCAL IMPACT:**
No fiscal impact.

**ATTACHMENT:**
PowerPoint Presentation: SCAG Goods Movement Border Crossing Study – Phase II