MEETING NOTICE AND AGENDA

COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES

The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) may take action on any item appearing on this agenda.

Tuesday, November 4, 2014

3 to 4:30 p.m.

SANDAG, 7th Floor Conference Room
401 B Street, Suite 800
San Diego, CA 92101-4231

Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas
(619) 699-1972
hector.vanegas@sandag.org

AGENDA HIGHLIGHTS

• BORDER MASTER PLAN 2014 UPDATE

• BINATIONAL INDUSTRY CLUSTERS

MISSION STATEMENT

The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) will advise the Borders Committee of the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG) concerning both short- and long-term binational related activities, issues, and actions; provide input regarding binational border-related planning and development; and identify ways to assist and coordinate with existing efforts in the binational area.

The COBRO will serve as a working group to the SANDAG Borders Committee to facilitate a better understanding of the binational border-related issues and needs of the California-Baja California region.
Welcome to SANDAG. Members of the public may speak to the COBRO on any item at the time that the Committee is considering the item. Please complete a Speaker’s Slip which is located in the rear of the room and then present the slip to Committee staff. Also, members of the public are invited to address the Committee on any issue under the agenda item entitled Public Comments/Communications. Speakers are limited to three minutes. The COBRO may take action on any item appearing on the agenda.

This agenda and related staff reports can be accessed at sandag.org under meetings on the SANDAG website. Public comments regarding the agenda can be forwarded to SANDAG via the email comment form also available on the website. Email comments should be received no later than 12 noon, two days prior to the COBRO meeting.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact SANDAG at (619) 699-1900 in advance of the meeting. To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1990, (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905.

SANDAG offices are accessible by public transit. Phone 511 or see 511sd.com for route information.
COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES  
Tuesday, November 4, 2014

ITEM NO. | RECOMMENDATION
--- | ---
1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

+2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES | APPROVE
The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) is asked to review and approve the minutes from its September 2, 2014, meeting.

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS
Members of the public shall have the opportunity to address the COBRO on any issue within the jurisdiction of SANDAG that is not on this agenda. Anyone desiring to speak shall reserve time by completing a “Request to Speak” form and giving it to the COBRO coordinator prior to speaking. Public speakers should notify the COBRO coordinator if they have a handout for distribution to COBRO members. Public speakers are limited to three minutes or less per person. COBRO members also may provide information and announcements under this agenda item.

CONSENT

+4. UPCOMING EVENTS | INFORMATION

REPORTS

+5. BORDER MASTER PLAN 2014 UPDATE (Elisa Arias and Cheryl Mason, SANDAG; and Sergio Pallares, Caltrans District XI) | INFORMATION
The Border Master Plan 2014 Update was presented to and accepted by the United States-Mexico Joint Working Committee in September 2014. This presentation will provide an overview of the planning process and key projects.

6. BINATIONAL INDUSTRY CLUSTERS (Daniel Flyte, SANDAG) | INFORMATION
As part of the CaliBaja Mega-Region Initiative, the long term economic development strategy that includes San Diego and Imperial Counties and the State of Baja California, Mexico, this report will present findings and progress on employment concentrations in the border region.

+7. METTROPOL-ÍNDEX (Carmen Romo and Jorge Zambrano, Metropol-Índex) | INFORMATION
The urban observatory METTROPOL-ÍNDEX is a nongovernmental organization responsible of gathering, monitoring, analyzing, and following public policies validating data, performance, and results issued by governmental and private agencies around important urban topics in the Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito metropolitan zone.

8. NEXT MEETING DATE | INFORMATION
The next meeting of the COBRO is scheduled for Tuesday, February 3, 2015, from 3 to 4:30 p.m., at SANDAG.

+ next to an item indicates an attachment
The meeting of the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) was called to order by Chair Paul Ganster, Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias at SDSU at 3 p.m.

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Members present were: Chair Paul Ganster, Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias at SDSU; Juan Carlos Rivas and Alicia Lopez, Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego; Giscard Guilloteau, Consulate General of the United States in Tijuana; Efrain Ibarra, South San Diego County Economic Development Council; Arturo González, City of Tijuana Binational Affairs Office; Miguel Tapia, City of Chula Vista; Alejandra Gavaldón, City of San Diego; Tito Alegría, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte; Heidy Salum, Gobierno de Baja California; Paola Avila, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce; Nathan Owens, San Diego Dialogue; Jason M-B Wells and Thomas Currie, San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce; Daniel Rubio, Instituto Metropolitano de Planeación de Tijuana; Cecilia Luken, Fundación Internacional de la Comunidad, A.C.; and Viviana Ibañez, Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce.

SANDAG staff members present were: Héctor Vanegas, Tayah Wheeland, Elias Sanz, and Steve Bossi.

2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES (APPROVE)

Chair Ganster changed the order of the agenda. When the COBRO achieved quorum, Chair Ganster solicited motion to approve the summary notes for the February 4, 2014, and May 6, 2014, meetings.

Upon a motion by Efrain Ibarra, and a second by Thomas Currie, COBRO unanimously approved the summary of the February 4, 2014, meeting.

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS (INFORMATION)

Chair Paul Ganster invited the members and the public to share any comments or announce any upcoming events.

Chair Ganster informed members that the Border Environment Cooperation Commission and North American Development Bank are proposing a merge and he encourages people to give input from a local perspective, particularly related to proposing a potential location in San Diego, rather than San Antonio.
Héctor Vanegas, SANDAG, informed members that Governor Jerry Brown visited Mexico City and signed a Memorandum of Understanding between the California State Transportation Agency and Mexico’s Ministry of Communications and Transportation creating an Oversight Policy Committee to promote the work of the local boards to develop the new Port of Entry (POE) in Otay Mesa. He explained that Mexican President Peña Nieto visited California to report interest in expediting the border crossing among other topics.

Kevin Swanson, member of the public, advocated for a street address, signing, and geo-naming system in the binational region that is bilingual. Mr. Swanson said this address system in Tijuana could be a model for the rest of Mexico and could increase information flow from both sides of the border and would increase efficiency at the border by avoiding decision-making time at the border.

Chair Ganster introduced Heidy Salum as a new member from the State of Baja California and Steve Bossi as a new member of the SANDAG Borders Team.

**CONSENT**

4. **UPCOMING EVENTS (INFORMATION)**

Chair Ganster invited attendees to review upcoming events that were included in the agenda packet.

**REPORTS**

5. **COBRO CALENDAR OF MEETINGS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2015 (INFORMATION)**

Mr. Vanegas explained that COBRO meetings for the next year will normally be held on the first Tuesday of every other month. He explained that one meeting is usually held in Mexico and the chosen date for the meeting in Mexico is yet to be determined.

James Clark, San Diego-Tijuana Smart Border Coalition, informed that the calendar lists the North American Competitiveness and Innovations Conference in 2014 at the Hilton Torrey Pines, in La Jolla, but it is in Toronto this year.

6. **OVERVIEW OF SELECT SAN DIEGO-BAJA CALIFORNIA BORDER REGION ISSUES (INFORMATION)**

Mrs. Wheeland announced that she prepared a draft 24-page document on San Diego-Baja California border region issues including transportation, jobs and housing, and environment, and she is adding a section on economic development. She encouraged participants to provide comments.

Chair Ganster explained how he supports the development and review of this report because it can be used as a reference when members are called on to make presentations about our binational region.
7. OUTCOMES FROM THE 2014 BINATIONAL SEMINAR – “EFFICIENT BORDER: A GLOBALLY COMPETITIVE REGION” AND TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATION (RECOMMEND)

Mr. Vanegas explained that COBRO created the task force to debrief the outcomes from the seminar that was held on June 3, 2014. He explained the task force met in August 2014 and decided further discussion is necessary with the whole COBRO community to discuss if recommendations based on the Binational Seminar would be presented to the Board of Directors.

Chair Ganster explained that the question lies in where the COBRO goes from here and he agreed that a more specific direction is needed in order to form potential recommendations. He stated that the discussion over the next few meetings should be based on issues within the purview of COBRO at SANDAG. He explained that collaboration across borders can lead to efficiencies in addressing common problems and result in saving money. SANDAG is especially innovative in its regional collaboration because it institutionalizes the collaboration by sharing planning data and developing shared regional plans and suggested that COBRO could be briefed on specific issues at other COBRO meetings. He emphasized that gathering input is important and understanding the realities on both sides of the border is highly significant and requires extensive communication. He presented the task force recommendation from the Item No. 7 attachment.

Mario Lopez, member of the public, stated that the task force recommendation sounds like the mission statement of COBRO itself and asked for clarity on how they differ.

Mr. Vanegas explained that the recommendations developed by the task force were very similar to the recommendations from the 2013 Binational Seminar and they created this recommendation to allow for COBRO to focus discussions to create recommendations that differ from the previous ones, and that consider more input from the Mexican side of the border.

Chair Ganster stated that there is excellent input collected from Mexico when the COBRO meetings are located south of the border.

Jason M-B Wells, San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce, proposed that COBRO entertains a Mexican co-chair and co-staff, like a counterpart director that would take over meetings on the other side of the border.

Miguel Aguirre, member of the public, stated that there does not seem to be a connection between the High Level Economic Dialogue (HLED) and the regional planning level, and he encourages COBRO to establish that communication.

Mr. Vanegas reminded everyone that COBRO was founded in 1996 and the COBRO Co-Chair is the Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego. He also explained that from the SANDAG perspective, local projects are part of the HLED agenda.

Nathan Owens, San Diego Dialogue, stated that he sits on the task force and explained the rationale for having the Binational Seminar topic was to supplement the HLED discussion. He explained that the event white paper identifies several mechanisms that are currently in place, usually at the federal level, for the United States and Mexico to discuss these issues. Based on the Binational Seminar, the task force was not able to develop recommendations that could be elevated
to the HLED and, as such, they decided that COBRO should further discuss if new recommendations could be elevated or COBRO can discuss other potential ways to elevate border issues.

Mr. Aguirre stated that he does not feel that the HLED has looked at the POEs and border crossings as tools for integrating the two countries. He explained that there is private sector innovation moving forward, but it is hitting roadblocks because there is no existing federal blueprint for supporting that North American strategy. He submitted that emphasis should be placed on POEs and private sector development that supports urban development.

Mr. Clark stated that most of those high level economic issues will be covered at the North American Competitiveness and Innovation Conference in Toronto this year where the three secretaries of commerce from North America will be there discussing how to keep competitive with other continents like Asia and Europe. He commented that the San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce is considering taking a team to the conference.

Mr. Vanegas stated that he is taking notes on the interest in the HLED and noted that SANDAG is especially interested in the HLED because the Otay Mesa East POE is part of the discussion and because one of the goals of the HLED is to support the conclusion of all of the Border Master Plans.

Giscard Guilloteau, Consulate General of the United States in Tijuana, explained that border issues are a high priority with the HLED.

Upon a motion by Thomas Currie, and a second by Arturo González, COBRO unanimously accepted the recommendation to “use some of COBROs upcoming meetings to explore alternatives that will enable stakeholders to discuss the region’s needs for improved collaboration to assure a prosperous future and to identify ways to more effectively communicate those needs to the community and government representatives on both sides of the border.”

8. 2014 Tijuana Innovadora Event Update (Information)

Chair Paul Ganster introduced the next presenters, Laura Araujo and Jose Gallicot, Tijuana Innovadora, to provide an update on the 2014 Tijuana Innovadora.

Ms. Araujo presented the foreground on Tijuana Innovadora and explained that they hope San Diego will be an active participant in the event this year and they are currently working with Mayor Kevin Faulconer’s office to have San Diego as a partner for next year’s Tijuana Innovadora event. She explained that there will be a North American Pavilion at the event where, among others, United States Customs and Border Protection (CBP) will have an exhibit, and also thanked James Clark and the San Diego-Tijuana Smart Border Coalition for supporting this Pavilion.

Mr. Gallicot informed the group about the many speakers that will present at the event and he encouraged purchasing tickets to the event. He also promoted the binational hack-a-thon, which is being organized by the University of Chihuahua and UC San Diego.

Ms. Araujo explained that transportation arrangements are being made with CBP to dedicate a lane and there will be special buses offered for universities and executive groups. She offered to distribute the digital information form once it is ready.
Alejandra Gavaldón, City of San Diego, announced that Mayor Faulconer is confirmed to be a part of a panel at the event on October 24, 2014.

9. OVERVIEW OF TIJUANA TE QUIERO (INFORMATION)

Monica Schroeder, Tijuana Te Quiero, presented the experiment and vision of Tijuana Te Quiero and her methods for collecting information from people waiting at the pedestrian border crossing at San Ysidro. Her findings showed that the main needs for the pedestrian border crossers are shade, restrooms, water, and medical services. She explained that Tijuana Te Quiero has received attention from multiple media outlets, universities, entrepreneurs, non-governmental organizations, and social media from countries around the world.

Ms. Gavaldón commended Ms. Schroeder for her work and said that these issues are always in discussions at City of San Diego meetings about the border and she advised that the more specific Ms. Schroeder can be in asking for what is needed, the more likely the City of San Diego will be able to help with those needs.

Mario Lopez, member of the public, explained that in recent years a border crossing project that involved local, state, and federal funding was halted and then lost due to federal delays and a change in administration. He commended Ms. Schroeder for her research highlighting issues that increasingly need attention.

Jason Wells invited everyone to see what Ms. Schroeder is doing and he noted that the handwritten comments from borders crossers would be highly valuable information for all of the agencies.

Arturo González commended Ms. Schroeder for raising awareness among the community and for bringing this to COBRO.

Elias Sanz, SANDAG, stated that the border crossing is known world-wide and Ms. Schroeder has the potential to make this a destination that people want to go to rather than a place that people pass through or avoid.

Chair Ganster thanked Ms. Schroeder for her presentation

10. NEXT MEETING DATE AND LOCATION (INFORMATION)

Chair Ganster informed the group that the next meeting of COBRO would take place on Tuesday, November 4, 2014, at SANDAG.
UPCOMING EVENTS

WHAT: Defining Mexico’s Role in the Global Economy
      Center on Emerging and Pacific Economies
WHEN: November 5, 2014
WHERE: The Great Hall, UC San Diego
MORE INFO: Lisa Lee at lisalee@ucsd.edu

WHAT: 25th Anniversary
      South County Economic Development Council
WHEN: November 6, 2014
WHERE: Otay Ranch Town Center
MORE INFO: (619) 424-5143 or scedc@southcountyedc.com

WHAT: Member Breakfast: Featuring Assemblymember Lorena Gonzalez
      San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce
WHEN: November 12, 2014
WHERE: HomeTown Buffet on Dennery Road
MORE INFO: (619) 428-1281 or Lvega@sanysidrochamber.org

WHAT: How to Build Leadership for an Agile and Secure Interchange Between
      United States and Mexico
      UC San Diego Center for United States-Mexican Studies
WHEN: November 12, 2014
WHERE: Institute of the Americas Deutz conference room
MORE INFO: usmex.ucsd.edu/fellows/martinez-cantu.html

WHAT: Baja’s 5th International Aerospace Supplier Forum- Industrial Tour
      City of Tijuana Secretariat of Economic Development – Tijuana EDC
WHEN: November 12, 2014
WHERE: Tijuana, Baja California
MORE INFO: (619) 207-4683 or Alejandra@tijuanaedc.org
WHAT: Twenty Years of North American Free Trade Agreement: Are Measures of Human Development Converging on the Border?
El Colegio de la Frontera Norte
WHEN: November 12, 2014
WHERE: COLEF Aula Magna
MORE INFO: colef.mx

WHAT: MEDSummit
Clúster de Productos Médicos de las California
WHEN: November 12, 2014
WHERE: VestaPark Tijuana III, Tijuana, Baja California
MORE INFO: +52 (664) 629-0988 or info@industriamedica.org

WHAT: Recognizing Refugees from Mexico and Central America
University of San Diego (USD) – Trans-Border Institute
WHEN: December 12, 2014
WHERE: USD Joan B. Kroc School of Peace Studies
MORE INFO: (619) 260-4148 or marthagarcia@sandiego.edu

WHAT: Annual International Tribute Awards Gala
San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce
WHEN: November 14, 2014
WHERE: Hotel Del Coronado
MORE INFO: (619) 544-1376 or register@sdchamber.org

WHAT: Preparing for the Effects of Climate Change in the Tijuana River Valley
Tijuana River National Estuarine Research Reserve (TRNERR)
WHEN: November 15, 2014
WHERE: TRNERR, Imperial Beach, California
MORE INFO: (619) 575-3613 or TRNERR.org

WHAT: Import Compliance Seminar
Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce
WHEN: November 18, 2014
WHERE: 8100 Gigantic St, San Diego, California 92154
MORE INFO: (619) 661-6111 or otaymesa.org

Key Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas, (619) 699-1972, hector.vanegas@sandag.org
Introduction

The California-Baja California Border Master Plan (BMP) 2014 Update is a binational comprehensive approach to coordinate planning and delivery of Port of Entry (POE) and transportation infrastructure projects serving the POEs in the California-Baja California region. The California and Baja California region completed its first BMP in 2008. One of the key successes of the 2008 BMP was the development of a methodology and criteria to evaluate and rank POE projects as well as roadway, interchange, and rail projects serving the POEs. Establishing criteria for ranking projects allowed for the development of a mutually agreed-upon list of prioritized projects within the binational study area that is an integral part of the California-Baja California BMP. The California-Baja California BMP was commissioned by the United States-Mexico Joint Working Committee to Caltrans, and the Secretariat of Infrastructure and Urban Development of Baja California. The SANDAG Service Bureau was a consultant for this project.

Discussion

The California-Baja California region has six international land POEs: San Ysidro/Virginia Avenue-Puerta México/El Chaparral, Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay, Tecate-Tecate, Calexico-Mexicali, Calexico East-Mexicali II, and Andrade-Los Algodones. In addition to these existing six POEs, the Otay Mesa East-Mesa de Otay II POE, a new passenger and commercial port, is planned to facilitate crossborder travel demand in the region. Also, the San Diego-Tijuana Airport Crossborder Facility is currently under construction. Another potential POE would be located at Jacumba-Jacumé, east of the Tecate-Tecate POE.

The California-Baja California BMP study area is focused on an “Area of Influence” – 60 miles north and south of the International Border – and a “Focused Study Area” – 10 miles north and south of the international border.

The goals of the California-Baja California BMP 2014 Update are to:

1. Re-establish and maintain binational coordination on the BMP, which began with the 2008 BMP.

2. Review findings of the 2008 BMP.
3. Identify new policy and/or legislative issues as well as funding trends and opportunities impacting planning and capital improvement in the study area of California and Baja California along the United States-Mexico border.

4. Adapt an existing web-based pilot data entry program in both English and Spanish for use by stakeholders. This tool allows stakeholder agencies to directly input project data information into a formatted online database, streamlining the previous process that required multiple steps of input at the agency and SANDAG Service Bureau levels.

5. Expand data collection, monitoring, and technical modeling capabilities to better capture crossborder travel characteristics and POE throughput capabilities. Research and develop capabilities to perform border region sensitivity analyses for scenario planning and project prioritization.

6. Identify ongoing funding sources for the California-Baja California BMP process.

7. Reach agreement with agencies on BMP process and objectives/requirements for future BMP activities.

8. Complete the update within three years from the date of the underlying agreement with a desired project completion date of December 31, 2013. (Note: The Policy Advisory Committee extended the completion date to June 30, 2014.)

The California-Baja California BMP 2014 Update features updated priority rankings of POE and connecting transportation infrastructure projects, presents a framework for a future model to conduct POE sensitivity analysis, discusses funding opportunities and sources, and outlines recommendations.

Attachment: 1. California–Baja California BMP 2014 Update

Key Staff Contact: Elisa Arias, (619) 699-1936, elisa.arias@sandag.org
Attachment 1

California – Baja California Border Master Plan 2014 Update

The full report in electronic format can be downloaded at

Hard copies of the report will be provided at the COBRO meeting or are available by contacting the Public Information Office at (619) 699-1950.
METTROPOL-INDEX

Cross-border Metropolitan Urban Observatory
Because sustainable urbanization is one of the most pressing challenges facing the global community in the 21st century, the United Nations launched the United Nations Human Settlements Program UN-HABITAT. This program aims to help policy makers and local communities find workable and lasting solutions for developing human settlements. UN-HABITAT will use “urban observatories” as one of its main mechanisms to achieve its goal.

The urban Observatory METTROPOL-ÍNDICE is a non-governmental organization responsible of gathering, monitoring, analyzing and following public policies validating data, performance and results issued by governmental and private agencies around important urban topics.
"Planning efforts in Tijuana-Tecate-Rosarito are surpassed by the pressures of a rapidly growing population. These cities lack resources to help mitigate the constant and uncontrolled growth of both formal and informal settlements.

Another problem is vital planning information is lost each time the City administration change (every 3 and 6 years). As a result, authorities in the region have scattered, obsolete and incomplete knowledge and data.

To help address this problem, an independent, non-profit, non-partisan entity could be used to evaluate public policies and identify where improvements could be made. Indicators should be developed to help understand the trends of rapid development and that can help us make realistic forecasts that can anticipate problems so we can have the capacity to improve living conditions.
The purpose of METTROPOL-INDEX is to help local authorities, the private sectors and civil society to:

- Improve urban policies, based on increased capacity to collect, interpret and apply information on urban trends and conditions.
- Formulate and implement regional and local plans of action, based on a better understanding of how our cities work.
- Foster civic engagement and participatory decision-making.
- Improve urban management and development.
- And provide tools for:
  - Urban data collection and management,
  - Data analysis and presentation,
  - Application of data in decision-making,
  - Learning from best practices

**Mission**

"Mettropol-Index" is an organization focused on gathering and administrating urban data of the metropolitan area of Tijuana, Tecate, Playas de Rosarito and its cross-border condition with San Diego; to inform, issue recommendations and foster actions and policies that have a positive impact on quality of life in the region.

**Vision**

Mettropol-Index serves as a city changer organization, promoting community action and best civic practices through citizen collaboration, disclosure of relevant information and empowering communities in order to improve living conditions in the metropolitan area.
Strategy

"Metropol-Index" will gather and administer information through observing, assessing, monitoring and collecting data about the actions and policies of government agencies, the private sector, civil society and the community at large through collaborative processes and communication using as core values openness, honesty and fairness.

"Metropol-Index" will collaborate as partner with government agencies, the private sector, civil society and the community at large in order to generate relevant, accurate and reliable indicators through cutting edge technology platforms.

"Metropol-Index" will encourage the development of effective projects and proposals, to improve living conditions through proper planning and public policies for the benefit of communities.

"Metropol-Index" will -through knowledge and education- strive to improve social, economic and environmental conditions in the metropolitan area.
We believe that actions that promote community engagement and partnerships between governmental agencies and civil society play a fundamental role in fostering permanent solutions to urban problems.