MEETING NOTICE AND AGENDA

SAN DIEGO CONFORMITY WORKING GROUP
The San Diego Conformity Working Group may take action on any item appearing on this agenda.

Wednesday, March 5, 2014
10:30 a.m. to 12 noon
SANDAG, Conference Room 8C
401 B Street, Suite 800
San Diego, CA 92101-4231

Staff Contact: Rachel Kennedy
(619) 699-1929
rachel.kennedy@sandag.org

AGENDA HIGHLIGHTS

- 2014 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM: CONFORMITY CRITERIA AND PROCEDURES

If you wish to participate by conference call, please call (888) 204-5987. The conference call passcode is 6838699#.

SANDAG offices are accessible by public transit.
Phone 511 or see www.511sd.com for route information.
Secure bicycle parking is available in the building garage off Fourth Avenue.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact SANDAG at (619) 699-1900 at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1900, (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITEM #</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>INTRODUCTIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+2.</td>
<td>MINUTES OF DECEMBER 4, 2013, MEETING INFORMATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The minutes of the December 4, 2013, San Diego Conformity Working Group (CWG) meeting is attached. The CWG is asked to review the meeting minutes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Members of the public will have the opportunity to address the Working Group during this time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+4.</td>
<td>2014 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM: CONFORMITY CRITERIA AND PROCEDURES DISCUSSION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The CWG will discuss the conformity criteria and procedures to be followed to determine conformity of the 2014 Regional Transportation Improvement Program and redetermine conformity of the 2050 Regional Transportation Plan for consistency purposes. SANDAG staff will make brief presentations on the following topics:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+A. Revenue-Constrained Program Assumptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+B. The 2050 Regional Growth Forecast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Transportation Modeling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Latest Emissions Model, Emissions Budgets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E. Transportation Control Measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+F. Public Involvement and Outreach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>DEVELOPMENT OF NEXT VERSION OF EMFAC INFORMATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>California Air Resources Board staff will update the CWG on the development of the next version of the EMFAC model.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE 2008 NATIONAL AMBIENT AIR QUALITY STANDARDS FOR OZONE: STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN REQUIREMENTS RULE

On May 29, 2013, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) proposed a rule that would address a range of implementation requirements for the 2008 National Ambient Air Quality Standards for ground-level ozone. The proposed rule was published in the Federal Register on June 6, 2013, and the public comment period closed on September 4, 2013. U.S. EPA staff will provide an update on this rule.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

8. ADJOURNMENT AND NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the CWG is scheduled for Wednesday, April 2, 2014, from 10:30 a.m. to 12 noon at SANDAG.

+ next to an item indicates an attachment
MINUTES OF MARCH 6, 2013, MEETING

ITEM #1: INTRODUCTIONS
Self-introductions were made. See attached attendance list.

ITEM #2: SUMMARY OF DECEMBER 4, 2013, MEETING
Rachel Kennedy, SANDAG, asked the Conformity Working Group (CWG) to review the meeting minutes. There were no comments or edits made to the minutes of the December 4, 2013, meeting.

ITEM #3: PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS/MEMBER COMMENTS
There were no public comments/communications/member comments.

ITEM #4: SAN DIEGO FORWARD: THE REGIONAL PLAN SCHEDULE DISCUSSION AND INTERAGENCY CONSULTATION
SANDAG is currently working on the development of San Diego Forward: The Regional Plan. Staff provided updates on the Regional Plan Schedule, the 2050 Regional Growth Forecast, and Transportation Modeling.

Elisa Arias, SANDAG, provided an overview of the San Diego Forward: The Regional Plan schedule. Ms. Arias highlighted that the air quality conformity determination for the draft Regional Plan will be developed in fall 2014. The draft plan and its conformity analysis are anticipated to be released for public review in March 2015 with the final plan adoption anticipated in summer 2015. Ilene Gallo, Caltrans, asked whether the jurisdictions will do their own greenhouse gas (GHG) analysis for the GHG targets or if SANDAG would do it. Ms. Arias responded that some jurisdictions have GHG data, as well as climate action plans, but Senate Bill 375 (Steinberg, 2008) requires SANDAG to conduct the GHG analysis for passenger vehicles. Ms. Gallo asked whether the CWG will see parts of the Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) prior to March 2015. Ms. Arias responded affirmatively, and clarified that the CWG is tasked with the federal conformity process while the SCS is a state requirement.

Kirby Brady, SANDAG, provided an overview of the 2050 Regional Growth Forecast, which will be used in development of the Regional Plan. Ms. Brady directed the CWG to an attached report and PowerPoint presentation where she discussed the Regional Growth Forecast, which projects population, housing units, and jobs for the San Diego region for the years 2010-2050. Ms. Brady also referred the CWG to the subregional growth forecast which includes similar information for each local jurisdiction.
Ziying Ouyang, SANDAG, presented information about SANDAG’s activity-based model (ABM) which has been under development since 2009. SANDAG now has a calibrated and validated model to support the development of San Diego Forward: The Regional Plan. An ABM simulates individual and household transportation decisions that compose their daily travel itinerary. It predicts whether, where, when, and how people travel outside their home for activities such as work, school, shopping, healthcare, and recreation.

The SANDAG ABM strives to be as behaviorally realistic as possible and is based on empirical data collected by SANDAG, Caltrans, and the federal government. The model development has been regularly peer-reviewed by the ABM Advisory Committee, a panel of national experts in the travel demand forecasting field. The SANDAG ABM is innovative, and it builds off of a proven model design that has been tested in practice in the San Francisco, Atlanta, and New York regions.

ABMs are at the forefront of travel demand modeling technology. These models allow for a more nuanced analysis of complex policies and projects. The powerful analytic capabilities of an ABM are particularly helpful in evaluating Transportation Demand Management policies, social equity, carpooling, transit access, parking conditions, tolling, and pricing. Because an ABM tracks the characteristics of each person, the model can be used to analyze the travel patterns of a wide range of socioeconomic groups. For example, a household with many members may be more likely to carpool, own multiple vehicles, and share shopping responsibilities.

Unlike a four-step model’s aggregate approach to model trips based on zonal inputs, an ABM simulates individual and household travel decisions through tours. A tour is a journey that begins and ends at home, and it can include stops at other destinations on the way to or from the primary destination. The ABM starts with generating a representative population that looks like the real San Diego. Once a representative population is created, the model predicts long-term and medium-term decisions such as a choice of work or school location and a household’s choice of number of cars to own. Next, each person’s day is scheduled, taking into account the priority of various activities and interaction among the household members. Once all journeys to and from home have been scheduled, the model predicts specific travel details such as mode, the number of stops to make, where to stop, and when to depart from each stop to continue the tour. The final step of the ABM is traffic assignment where trips are summarized by traffic analysis zones and assigned to transportation networks in the same fashion as the four-step model. ABM takes Series 13 Growth Forecast and highway and transit networks as inputs and generates output such as vehicle miles traveled (VMT), mode share, and trips and network level of service. This information is used to calculate measures of performance.

The ABM predicts the travel patterns of San Diego County residents. To account for travel generated by visitors, Mexican residents, commercial vehicles, freight transportation, and special events such as professional football games, a number of special models (commercial vehicle model, truck model, special events model, air passenger model, external trip model, visitor model, cross-border model) address these other sources of transportation demand. The last step of traffic assignment includes trips generated from these special models. The assignment outputs such as VMTs by speed bin by vehicle class are inputs to EMFAC to produce emission results.

The SANDAG ABM includes a number of methodological strengths. It predicts the travel decisions of San Diego residents at a detailed level, taking into account the way people schedule their day, their behavioral patterns, and the need to cooperate with other household members. When simulating a
person’s travel patterns, the ABM takes into consideration a multitude of personal and household attributes like age, gender, income, and presence of children. The model’s fine temporal (30 minutes) and spatial (22,000 zones) resolution ensures that it is able to capture subtle aspects of travel behavior.

ITEM #5: 2014 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM DRAFT SCHEDULE

Michelle Merino, SANDAG, provided an overview of the draft schedule for the 2014 Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP). Ms. Merino highlighted key dates where the CWG would be consulted as well as relevant tasks for model updates, conformity analysis, comment periods, and policy review/action. Staff will be conducting interagency consultation with the CWG in March 2014 and a draft conformity analysis is anticipated to be issued to the CWG for review in May 2014. The Transportation Committee will be asked to release the draft 2014 RTIP and its conformity analysis for a public review period in July 2014 and it is anticipated that the SANDAG Board will approve the final 2014 RTIP and its air quality conformity analysis in September 2014.

ITEM #6: EMFAC 2011 AND DEVELOPMENT OF NEXT VERSION OF EMFAC

Jason Crow, California Air Resources Board (CARB), reported that EMFAC 2013 is under development. The next workshop in 2014 will put forth a new beta version and this new version will go out to 2050. Carl Selnick, Air Pollution Control District, asked if there is a scheduled date for when the EMFAC 2013 will be submitted to the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) for approval. Mr. Crow responded that it will likely be at the last quarter of 2014. Mr. Selnick also asked if the EPA approval would occur in early 2015. John Kelly, EPA, stated that it would likely take about half a year to approve. Paul Swearingen, Caltrans, District 11, asked how the new model would handle particulate matter (PM) for tire wear or break wear. Mr. Crow replied that the new model will have a larger component for PM 2.5.

Mr. Selnick stated that EMFAC 2013 and the Visions model should consider long-term developments. Probably by 2040, it is hoped that all cars will be zero emission cars. EMFAC 2013 would not reflect this (as it is not an official ARB regulation), but could see this possibly in the Visions model/tool. Mr. Crow stated that the Visions tool can do scenarios with percentage of zero emissions vehicles. Mr. Selnick asked when the Visions tool would be available. Mr. Crow will follow up on the schedule. Mr. Selnick stated that projecting out to 2050 should be able to look at zero emissions vehicles.

ITEM #7: REDESIGNATION OF SAN DIEGO COUNTY TO ATTAINMENT FOR THE 1997 8-HOUR OZONE STANDARD

Ms. Kennedy provided an update on the re-designation of San Diego County to attainment for the 1997 8-Hour Ozone Standard. Mr. Kelly stated that the budget was approved in the final action and that the approval occurred on July 5, 2013.

ITEM #8: IMPLEMENTATION OF THE 2008 NATIONAL AMBIENT AIR QUALITY STANDARDS FOR OZONE: STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN REQUIREMENTS RULE

Mr. Kelly provided an update on the implementation of the 2008 national ambient air quality standards for ozone: State Implementation Plan (SIP) requirements rule. He stated that about
57 comments were submitted, some being significant, but not related to air quality conformity. He also stated that there will be two implementation rules for the 2008 ozone standard, and that this is the second rule. The first rule was approved in June/July 2012.

Mike Brady, Caltrans, stated that he had not heard more than what Mr. Kelly highlighted. Mr. Kelly stated that May 2014 would be the timing for final action for the 2008 national ambient air quality standards for ozone. Ms. Arias asked whether San Diego would need to do a SIP. Mr. Selnick stated that he believes that ARB will conduct a SIP for the entire state. Mr. Kelly stated that it should be verified with CARB that they are preparing the inventory, and that the deadline is due in July 2014. The attainment date for the San Diego region is December 2015.

**ITEM #9: ADJOURNMENT AND NEXT MEETING**

Ms. Kennedy stated that the next scheduled meeting is February 6, 2013, from 10:30 a.m. to 12 noon at SANDAG. The agenda package for the next meeting will be sent out prior to the meeting.

Mr. Brady commented that there is PM hot spot training in December in Los Angeles and that the primary contact is Karina O'Connor, EPA. He also stated that he would be retiring in early 2014. Mr. Crow, CARB has taken over as the statewide CWG chair. Marilee Mortenson will be the lead contact for Caltrans Headquarters, and Rodney Tavitas is the backup conformity contact for Caltrans Headquarters. At the Federal Highway Administration, Michael Morris will support regional conformity, and Joseph Vaughn will still be the contact for project level conformity.
San Diego Region Conformity Working Group

Meeting Attendance
December 4, 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Agency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jason Crow (phone)</td>
<td>ARB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mike Brady (Phone)</td>
<td>Caltrans Headquarters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodney Tavitas (Phone)</td>
<td>Caltrans Headquarters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilene Gallo (Phone)</td>
<td>Caltrans, District 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Swearingen (Phone)</td>
<td>Caltrans, District 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Kelly (Phone)</td>
<td>EPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Morris (Phone)</td>
<td>FHWA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elisa Arias</td>
<td>SANDAG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirby Brady</td>
<td>SANDAG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rachel Kennedy</td>
<td>SANDAG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michelle Merino</td>
<td>SANDAG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ziying Ouyang</td>
<td>SANDAG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott Strelecki</td>
<td>SANDAG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carl Selnick (Phone)</td>
<td>SDAPCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carla Walecka (Phone)</td>
<td>TCA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Due Dates</td>
<td>Activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-Jan</td>
<td>2014 Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP) Presentation at Interagency Technical Working Group on Tribal Transportation Issues.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 10-Jan    | Memo to all jurisdictions regarding schedules/procedures for the 2014 RTIP process including:  
  • Any new or updates to capacity increasing projects. |
| 6-Feb     | 2014 RTIP Presentation at CTAC. |
| 30-Jan    | 2014 RTIP Workshop at SANDAG. |
| 5-Mar     | Consultation with San Diego Conformity Working Group (CWG) on conformity criteria and procedures including: revenue-constrained program assumptions, latest planning assumptions, transportation control measures, emissions model, emissions budgets, exempt projects, consultation, and public involvement. |
| 14-Mar    | All projects proposed for 2014 RTIP due in ProjectTrak including new/updates to capacity increasing (CI) projects. |
| 28-Mar    | Issue 2014 Project List to CWG for interagency consultation (NCI [Non-Capacity Increasing] and CI). |
| 2-Apr     | Discuss 2014 RTIP Project List at CWG meeting. |
| 11-Apr    | Close of CWG Project List interagency consultation (NCI and CI). |
| 25-Apr    | Complete coding of 2014 RTIP Capacity Increasing (CI) projects/review project submittals. |
| 9-May     | Complete model runs of 2014 RTIP CI projects. |
| 14-May    | Presentation at Independent Taxpayer Oversight Committee (ITOC) to discuss draft projects and report. |
| 16-May    | Issue 2014 RTIP Draft Conformity Analysis for 30-day CWG review and comment. |
| 4-Jun     | Discuss 2014 RTIP Conformity Analysis at CWG meeting. |
| 27-Jun    | Signed resolutions with proof of public hearing due from all jurisdictions. |
| 16-Jun    | 30-day CWG comment period for 2014 RTIP draft Conformity Analysis ends. |
| 23-Jun    | Incorporate CWG comments for 2014 RTIP into revised draft Conformity Analysis. |
| 9-Jul     | ITOC reviews draft 2014 RTIP. |
| 18-Jul    | Transportation Committee (TC) requested to recommend the release of draft 2014 RTIP including its air quality conformity determination for public comment. |
| 25-Jul    | Board requested to release the draft 2014 RTIP including its air quality conformity determination for a 30-day public comment period;  
  and set September 5, 2014, TC meeting to hold public hearing.  
  SANDAG submits draft 2014 RTIP to state for review and comment. |
| 25-Aug    | 30-day comment period ends for draft 2014 RTIP including the Draft Conformity Analysis. |
| 5-Sep     | TC holds public hearing to review the draft 2014 RTIP including its air quality conformity determination and asked to recommend Final 2014 RTIP to the SANDAG Board for approval. |
| 26-Sep    | SANDAG Board asked to adopt the Final 2014 RTIP including its air quality conformity. |
| 30-Sep    | Deadline to submit Final 2014 RTIP to state. |
| 7-Oct     | Start of state FSTIP Public Participation process. |
| 28-Oct    | State Public Participation process ends. |
| 14-Nov    | FSTIP submittal to Federal Highway Administration (FHWA)/Federal Transit Administration (FTA). |
| 17-Dec    | Federal approval for FSTIP. |
2014 Regional Transportation Improvement Program Development:
Draft Financial Chapter Highlights

FINANCIAL CAPACITY

As the Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) for a nonattainment area, the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG) is required to prepare a revenue-constrained document with programmed projects based upon committed funding for the first two fiscal years of the Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP) development period and be reasonably available for the remaining years within the RTIP. Funding assumptions are generally based upon: (1) authorized or appropriated levels of federal and state funding from current legislation; (2) reasonable projections of future federal and state funding assuming a continuation of current funding levels; (3) the most current revenue forecasts for TransNet, the local transportation sales tax program; and (4) the planning and programming documents of the local transportation providers.

INFLATION ASSUMPTIONS

The projects to be programmed in the 2014 RTIP, covering Fiscal Year (FY) 2014/15 to FY 2018/19 are expressed in future dollars. That is, they have been escalated based upon anticipated inflation and other factors to the expected year of obligation or expenditure. For the State Transportation Improvement Program (STIP) and State Highway Operations, Protection Program (SHOPP), the revenues and program are based on the 2014 Fund Estimate (FE) adopted by the California Transportation Commission (CTC) in August 2013. Based on the Department of Finance Budget Letter, the FE assumes a 2 percent annual escalation for state operations expenditures covering the period FY 2014/15 through FY 2018/19.

For the major transportation projects funded with the County Transportation sales tax, TransNet, the SANDAG rate takes into account recent trends in a slow pace recovery economy and a competitive environment for construction projects. The rate used for FY 2014/15 starts at 3.9 percent annual escalation over the next four years, with an increase of 5 percent in FY 2018/19. This rate also is consistent with the current update to the long-range plan as well as the Plan of Finance.

PROGRAM REVENUES

RTIP revenue sources have been grouped into different categories: (1) federal; (2) state; (3) local; and (4) other. These fund sources are described below:

Federal Revenues

Federal funds programmed are based on the federal authorizing legislation, Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century (MAP-21), which was signed in July 2012 and reauthorizes surface transportation programs through September 30, 2014. Continuation of the federal funds programmed for formula programs (for both Federal Transit Administration [FTA] and Federal Highway Administration) is assumed at MAP-21 levels.
Border Infrastructure Program: This program, under prior legislation, is a formula-based program at the national level but administered at the state level to improve transportation at international borders and ports of entry, and within trade corridors. For San Diego, the state legislation identified funding for the State Route (SR) 905, SR 11, and the San Ysidro main line projects. Under MAP-21, this fund source was incorporated into the Surface Transportation Program (STP).

Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (CMAQ)/Regional Surface Transportation Program (RSTP): Both of these formula programs are estimated and apportioned by Caltrans for the San Diego region. By SANDAG Board Policy, 90 percent of these programs are allocated to the TransNet Early Action Program, which seeks to advance regionally significant projects in order to provide increased mobility in the region.

Demonstration/High-Priority Projects: The Safe, Accountable, Flexible, Efficient Transportation Equity Act: A Legacy for Users (SAFETEA-LU) includes several San Diego region projects under the High-Priority Project Authorizations program. Projects are currently funded with funds from the previous authorization; however, these funds are not included in MAP-21.

Federal Railroad Administration: The Federal Railroad Administration (FRA) revenues include The Passenger Rail Investment and Improvement Act of 2008 (PRIIA), which focuses on intercity passenger rail with improvements on service, operations, and facilities and funds were awarded through a competitive call for projects process. Under the FRA–PRIIA program, the region received $50 million; $25 million to implement Positive Train Control and $25 million to fund five projects through final environmental clearance.

Federal Transit Administration Urbanized Area Formula (Section 5307): The FTA Section 5307 is a formula-based program. Section 5307 funds ongoing preventive maintenance, bus acquisition programs, the regional vanpool program, office and shop equipment, and other transit capital projects. Through MAP-21, this program now includes the former FTA Section 5316 Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) program, which was eliminated.

Federal Transit Administration Formula Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities (Section 5310): This program provides formula funding to increase the mobility of seniors and persons with disabilities. Under MAP-21, this program was expanded to include the former New Freedom program (Section 5317). At least 55 percent of program funds must be spent on the types of capital projects eligible under the former Section 5310 and 45 percent may be used for the following: public transportation projects exceeding requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act; projects that improve access to fixed-route service; or alternatives to public transportation that assist seniors/disabled.

Federal Transit Administration Rural Area Formula Grants (Section 5311) Program: Section 5311 is administered by Caltrans and provides capital, planning, and operating assistance to support transit services in the non-urbanized areas of the region. Caltrans provides the estimates of revenues for the formula program and announces the award under the discretionary program on an annual basis. The rural portion of the JARC program is now eligible under this program along with a tribal program through MAP-21.
Federal Transit Administration State of Good Repair (Section 5337) Program: FTA Section 5337 is a formula program created by MAP-21 to replace Section 5309 Fixed Guideway. Eligible uses of the funds include replacement and rehabilitation of Fixed Guideway assets including railcars, ferry vessels, buses operating in HOV lanes, and related infrastructure.

Federal Transit Administration Bus and Bus Facilities (Section 5339) Program: Section 5339 is a formula program created in MAP-21 that replaces the discretionary Section 5309 Bus and Bus Facilities program. Eligible uses of these funds include bus and bus facility replacement, rehabilitation, expansion, and enhancement projects. These funds are distributed based on urbanized areas by FTA-based population, vehicle revenue miles, and passenger miles.

Highway Bridge Program/High Risk Rural Roads/Highway Safety Improvement Program: The Highway Bridge Program (HBP)/High Risk Rural Roads (HRRR)/Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) programs are administered by Caltrans at the statewide level. All funding is provided by Caltrans and programmed as a lump sum.

State Revenues

The state highway projects programmed are based on the proposed 2014 STIP scheduled for adoption at the March 2014 CTC meeting.

Active Transportation Program: MAP-21 established a new program to provide for a variety of alternative transportation projects, including many that were previously eligible activities under separately funded programs. The Active Transportation Program (ATP) consolidates existing federal and state transportation programs, including the Transportation Alternatives Program (TAP), Bicycle Transportation Account (BTA), and State Safe Routes to School (SR2S), into a single program. ATP funds are administered by the CTC and the designated MPO and projects are selected through a competitive process.

Freeway Service Patrol: Funds are provided through the state legislature. The Freeway Service Patrol (FSP) program costs and revenue estimates have been developed jointly by SANDAG, Caltrans, and the California Highway Patrol based upon the most current statewide FSP Act funding levels.

Proposition 1A: The Safe, Reliable High-Speed Passenger Train Bond Act for the 21st Century approved by the voters as Proposition 1A on November 4, 2008, authorizes the CTC upon appropriation by the legislature to allocate funds for capital improvement to intercity rail, commuter rail, and urban rail systems.

Proposition 1B: The CTC is the responsible agency for administering the transportation component of the Highway Safety, Traffic Reduction, Air Quality, and Port Security Bond Act of 2006, approved by the voters as Proposition 1B on November 7, 2006. CTC has approved or allocated funding for various programs including STIP/SHOPP Augmentation, Public Transportation Modernization, Improvement and Service Enhancement Account (PTMISEA), Congestion Mobility Improvement Account (CMIA), State-Local Partnership Program (SLPP), and the Trade Corridors Improvement Fund (TCIF). The funding received under these programs is included in the RTIP.
- **State Transportation Improvement Program and State Highway Operations, Protection Program:** The CTC programs the STIP and SHOPP on a statewide basis. The San Diego projects will be programmed in the RTIP upon approval of the 2014 STIP.

**Local Revenues**

- **TransNet Local Transportation Sales Tax Program:** *TransNet* revenues are estimated based upon taxable retail sales forecasts derived from SANDAG’s short-term forecasting model.

  The *TransNet* Ordinance specifies several sub-programs that augment the major transportation projects in the region including Major Corridors, Bicycle/Pedestrian, and Transit programs, and an innovative program for early mitigation for projects – Environmental Mitigation Program – the first in the state to purchase right-of-way early in order to reduce the cost of projects in the future while preserving the ecology of the region.

- **Local Agency Funding:** The local agency revenues programmed are based on reasonably expected revenues as submitted by local agencies. Included are city and county local gas tax subventions, developer fees, local public funds, Proposition 42 funds, and developer funds administered by local agencies.

- **Local Privatization/Toll Revenues:** There is one local privatization/toll revenue funding: the SR 241 Foothill Corridor toll road.

- **State Transit Assistance:** The State Transit Assistance (STA) budget provides funding for allocation to local transit agencies to fund a portion of the operations and capital costs associated with local mass transportation programs. Pursuant to ABX8 6 (March, 2010), STA allocations are based on sales tax generated from consumption of diesel fuel. The State Controller’s office is responsible for providing the estimates in January of each year.

- **Transportation Development Act:** Although this is a state program, the Transportation Development Act (TDA) is administered locally. Funds are based on a one-quarter percent state sales tax, with revenues made available primarily for transit operating and capital purposes. The San Diego County Auditor’s office estimates the apportionment for the upcoming fiscal year. SANDAG prepares forecasts of TDA based on a forecast of sales tax revenues estimated for the San Diego County using SANDAG’s short-term forecasting model, which takes into consideration numerous variables, including population growth, jobs, inflation, and real income growth.

**Other Transportation Program Revenues**

- **Other Funds:** These funds include contributions from various state funding sources, local agency contributions, private sector funding, advertising income, investment earnings, passenger fare revenue, and other miscellaneous income. Revenues from these sources are generally consistent with established historical trends or are based upon funding commitments from local agencies.

- **Financing:** SANDAG Board issues long-term debt backed by *TransNet* in order to complete major transportation projects early.
Regional Results:
Population, Jobs, Housing

Population, Housing, Jobs over time from 1970 to 2050.
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION/PLAN POLICY

Purpose

This policy establishes a process for obtaining input from and providing information to the public concerning agency programs, projects, and program funding in order to ensure the public is informed and has the opportunity to provide SANDAG with input so plans can reflect the public's desire. SANDAG will review and update this plan every three years. Various federal and state laws and regulations require that an agency such as SANDAG conduct and establish a Public Participation Plan to ensure that the public is involved and that community concerns are addressed. For example, planning of mass transit capital projects, development of short range service policies and plans, and fare policy and structure changes to public transportation require public participation. The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) also have public information components that require an agency such as SANDAG to conduct public participation programs to ensure that the public is involved and that community concerns are addressed. A significant component of the SANDAG mission is a strong commitment to public participation and involvement to include all residents and stakeholders in the regional planning process.

The public participation policy is consistent with the requirements of Public Utility Code Section 132360.1 established with the passage of Assembly Bill 361 which reads as follows:

(c) The agency shall engage in a public collaborative planning process; recommendations from that process shall be made available and considered for integration into the plan. A procedure to carry out this process including a method of addressing and responding to recommendations from the public shall be adopted.

Social Equity and Environmental Justice

Ensuring the meaningful involvement of low income, minority, disabled, senior, and other traditionally underrepresented communities is a key component of SANDAG public participation activities. SANDAG policies, procedures, and programs are consistent with federal and state environmental justice laws, regulations, and requirements, Title VI, related nondiscrimination requirements, and reflect the principles of social equity and environmental justice. Social equity means ensuring that all people are treated fairly and are given equal opportunity to participate in the planning and decision-making process, with an emphasis on ensuring that traditionally disadvantaged groups are not left behind. Environmental justice means ensuring that plans, policies, and actions do not disproportionately affect low income and minority communities.
Scope

The policy addresses public participation policies and public information efforts in the following areas:

A. Overall Public Participation Plan
B. Short Range Program – Regional Transportation Improvement Program
C. Development Planning
D. Design and Construction
E. Fare Changes
F. Short Range Transit Planning
G. Native American Consultation

A. **Overall Public Participation Plan** -- Unless otherwise noted or required, the Public Participation Plan provides SANDAG general policies for public participation for major planning initiatives such as the Regional Transportation Plan, Regional Comprehensive Plan, Regional Short Range Transit Plan, and other planning and programming projects, including any tailored public involvement plans associated with them.

1. The SANDAG Public Participation Plan is designed to inform and involve the region’s residents in the decision-making process on issues such as growth, transportation, environmental management, housing, open space, air quality, energy, fiscal management, economic development, and public safety.

2. The Public Participation Plan seeks to involve all citizens, including but not limited to low income households, limited English proficient individuals, Hispanic, African American, Asian, Native American, senior, and other communities, persons with disabilities, as well as community and civic organizations, public agencies, business groups and associations, environmental organizations, and other stakeholders.

3. SANDAG Board meetings provide the public forum and decision point for significant regional issues. SANDAG Directors usually hold one or two Board meetings each month: a Board Policy Meeting the second Friday of each month and a Board Business Meeting the fourth Friday of each month. Meetings held at the SANDAG office are accessible by public transit. During these meetings, Directors adopt plans, allocate transportation funds, approve transit construction plans, approve transit fare changes, and establish policies and develop programs that are used by local governments as well as other public and private organizations.

4. The SANDAG Public Participation/Involvement Program shall comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). SANDAG shall hold public meetings in buildings, rooms, or locations that are accessible to persons with disabilities. SANDAG shall provide public meeting information in alternate formats and shall provide special accommodations at public meetings with three business days notice.
5. The SANDAG Public Participation/Involvement Program Plan is carried out as an integrated work element of the agency’s Overall Work Program and Budget and as part of other programming, development, and implementation processes such as the Regional Transportation Plan, the Regional Comprehensive Plan, Regional Short Range Transit Plan, Regional Transportation Improvement Program, Environmental Impact Reports, transit capital project development, project construction, transit fare changes, corridor studies, and other projects.

6. SANDAG shall proactively seek and promote public participation in SANDAG workshops and public hearings, as well as participation and attendance at committees, working groups, and task forces. SANDAG shall follow local, state, and federal guidelines for posting public meeting and hearing notices. Depending upon the specific project, SANDAG shall endeavor to hold meetings at times that can attract as many participants as possible, including evenings and weekends and at locations in communities throughout the region. SANDAG shall endeavor to hold these meetings in locations that are accessible by public transit.

7. SANDAG shall inform the public in a timely manner about regional issues, actions, and pending decisions through a number of efforts. As needed or required, SANDAG shall post public notices in newspapers of general circulation for publication of legal notices. Other publication and distribution efforts can include mail distribution to residents, agencies, and city/county governments, the SANDAG website, email lists, and rEgion – the SANDAG monthly electronic newsletter. As needed, SANDAG also shall distribute press releases and media alerts to local, regional, and Mexico border area print and broadcast media.


9. SANDAG shall use its website to provide the public with useful and timely information including meeting schedules and agendas; plans and environmental documents; reports and other publications; demographic profiles and data downloads; and interactive database and mapping applications.

10. As appropriate and as required by local, state, and federal guidelines, SANDAG shall translate into Spanish, and other languages, publications, announcements, and web content. In addition, numerous staff members are bilingual Spanish-English speakers and participate in public outreach and conduct presentations in Spanish. Translators shall be hired as outlined in the SANDAG Language Assistance Plan and as required by local, state, and federal guidelines to provide services in Spanish and other languages as appropriate.
11. SANDAG conducts periodic public opinion surveys as part of the outreach and citizen participation component of the SANDAG work program. These surveys shall be designed to include the San Diego region's residents in the regional planning process and to keep SANDAG officials aware of issues that are of concern to the people who live here.

12. SANDAG will endeavor to respond to general comments received by phone, fax, letter, or email within five (5) business days of receipt. Comments shall be routed to the SANDAG staff person who is responsible for that issue. Comments may be responded to in writing (email or letter) or may be resolved with the initial phone call. Some comments may need to be resolved by another agency or jurisdiction so the customer is referred to the appropriate entity. When a comment is submitted as part of a public review process (e.g., a plan or environmental report) the comment and response is logged into a database. Comments, concerns, and responses received as part of a public review process shall be included in the final plan or report.

B. Short Range Program – Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP) – Document updated every two years outlining major transportation projects to be implemented during a five-year period.

1. SANDAG shall follow the latest federal and state regulations regarding participation by interested parties.

2. As the document that implements the long range plan, the RTIP shall be incorporated as part of the Board-adopted public involvement process established for the Regional Transportation Plan (October 27, 2006) including participating in public outreach efforts, providing adequate public notice (legal notice publications), employing visualization techniques, holding public meetings at convenient and accessible locations.

3. SANDAG shall respond to any significant public input or comment received during the development of the biennial update and/or during the amendment cycle as part of its report to the Board or Transportation Committee (as appropriate).

4. The biennial RTIP update will be noticed in newspapers of general circulation including in alternate languages and a public hearing shall be held prior to final adoption by the Board of Directors.

5. During the amendment cycle, SANDAG will provide a draft of the amendment to all interested parties for a 15-day comment period.
OVERALL PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCESS

The SANDAG PPP establishes a process for obtaining input from and providing information to the public concerning agency policies, programs, projects, and program funding in order to ensure the public is informed and has the opportunity to provide SANDAG with input so plans can reflect the public’s vision. In accordance with FHWA regulations, SANDAG will review and update this plan as needed. The various federal and state laws and regulations mentioned require that an agency such as SANDAG conduct public participation programs to ensure that the public is involved and that community concerns are addressed. For example, planning of public transit capital projects, development of short-range transit service policies and plans, and setting of toll rates, transit fare policy and structure changes to public transportation require public participation. A significant component of the SANDAG mission is a strong commitment to public participation and involvement to include all residents and stakeholders in the regional planning process. The public participation process, development of plans, and outreach activities are coordinated through the SANDAG communications division.

Ensuring the meaningful involvement of all social and economic groups, including low-income, minority, disabled, senior, and other traditionally underrepresented communities is a key component of the PPP. As discussed in the Introduction section of this PPP, activities covered in the PPP are consistent with federal and state environmental justice laws, regulations, and requirements, Title VI of the Civil Rights Act and related nondiscrimination requirements, and they reflect the principles of social equity and environmental justice. The overall public participation process follows these guidelines and principles:

1. The PPP is designed to inform and involve people and organizations in the region’s decision-making process on issues such as growth, transportation, TransNet projects, environmental management, housing, open space, air quality, energy, fiscal management, economic development, and public safety. The PPP seeks to involve all citizens, including, but not limited to, low-income households, Hispanic, African American, Asian, Native American, senior, limited English speaking populations, persons with disabilities, as well as community-based and civic organizations, public agencies, business groups and associations, environmental organizations, corporations, city commissions, schools, and other stakeholders in the decision-making process.

2. SANDAG seeks to involve audiences outlined in Section 450.316 of Title 23 in the Code of Federal Regulations: citizens, affected public agencies, representatives of public transportation employees, freight shippers, providers of freight transportation services, private providers of transportation, representatives of users of public transportation, representatives of users of pedestrian walkways and bicycle transportation facilities, representatives of the disabled, and other interested parties. These efforts also are designed to reach affordable housing advocates, transportation advocates, neighborhood and community groups, environmental advocates, home builder representatives, broad-based business organizations, landowners, commercial property interests, and homeowner associations.

3. SANDAG Board of Directors and Policy Advisory Committee (PAC) meetings provide the public input forum and decision point for significant regional issues. SANDAG Directors typically hold one or two board meetings each month: a Board Policy meeting the second Friday of each month and a Board Business meeting the fourth Friday of each month. Policy Advisory Committee meetings also are held on Fridays. Meetings held at SANDAG offices are accessible by public transit. During these meetings, Directors solicit public input, adopt plans, allocate
transportation funds, approve transit construction plans, approve transit fare and regional transit service changes, approve the Regional Growth Forecast, implement smart growth initiatives, consider energy and habitat plans, and establish policies and develop programs that are used by local governments, as well as other public and private organizations. The PACs are named as follows: Executive Committee, Regional Planning Committee, Transportation Committee, Borders Committee, and Public Safety Committee. A list of SANDAG committees and working groups active in 2012 is provided in Appendix C. These meetings all provide opportunity for public comment.

4. For planning, project, funding, transit fare, toll rate, and policy decisions, public input shall be documented, issues or concerns addressed, and resolution of issues and/or changes made reflected in final reports, plans, or other documents. The final reports or documents are subject to approval by a vote at a public SANDAG Board or PAC meeting.

5. SANDAG proactively seeks and promotes public participation in SANDAG public workshops, meetings, and hearings, as well as participation and attendance at committees, working groups, and task forces. SANDAG follows local, state, and federal guidelines for posting public meeting and hearing notices. Depending upon the specific project, SANDAG endeavors to hold meetings at times that can attract as many participants as possible and at locations in communities throughout the region. SANDAG endeavors to hold these meetings in locations that are accessible by public transit. These meetings are held in buildings, rooms, or locations that are accessible to persons with disabilities.

6. SANDAG uses its website and social media channels to provide the public with useful and timely information, including: meeting schedules and agendas; plans and environmental documents; reports and other publications; demographic profiles and data downloads; and interactive database and mapping applications. SANDAG maintains and updates a public involvement web page with information for the public, reporters, and other stakeholders on the public participation program. This can be accessed at sandag.org/ppo.

7. SANDAG seeks to provide information in a variety of media, including social media, visual simulations of projects, web-based videos or photo displays, interactive displays at kiosks in targeted public locations, and other visualization techniques to secure feedback on transportation plans and projects.

8. SANDAG informs the public in a timely manner about regional issues, actions, and pending decisions through a number of efforts. As needed or required, SANDAG provides adequate notice in newspapers of general circulation for publication of legal notices, including minority and Spanish language publications. Other publication and distribution efforts to residents, agencies, and city/county governments may include e-mail notification, notices on the SANDAG website, publication in rEGion (a SANDAG monthly electronic newsletter), posts on SANDAG social media channels, and select distribution via mail.

9. SANDAG regularly informs local print and broadcast media about SANDAG decisions, events, research, and other issues. SANDAG regularly distributes press releases to community, minority, local and regional print, as well as web-based publications. SANDAG also distributes information to local and Spanish radio and television stations. A compilation of news coverage on SANDAG programs and projects is posted on the SANDAG home page weekly.
10. Following Department of Transportation (DOT) guidance, SANDAG conducted a Four Factor Analysis and subsequent Language Assistance Plan (LAP). The plan details the number of limited English speakers in the county and outlines the language assistance measures provided for these populations. The LAP can be viewed at: sandag.org/ppp. In accordance with the LAP, as appropriate and depending on the specific project, SANDAG translates into Spanish and other languages, publications, announcements, and web content. In addition, numerous staff members are bilingual Spanish-English speakers and participate in public outreach and conduct presentations in Spanish. Translators are hired as needed to provide services in Spanish and other languages as appropriate.

11. SANDAG conducts periodic public opinion surveys as part of the outreach and citizen participation component of the SANDAG OWP. These surveys are designed to include the San Diego region’s residents in the regional planning process and to keep SANDAG officials aware of issues that are of concern to the diverse groups of people who live here.

12. SANDAG periodically reviews the effectiveness of the procedures and strategies contained in the agencywide PPP and any other planning, program, or project-specific public participation plans to ensure the goals of the outreach and involvement are met. Quantitative and qualitative assessment is considered to determine results of outreach effectiveness by reporting how many people are contacted, how many respond, and did SANDAG receive the necessary input, as well as what follow up measures were taken to ensure persons who commented know what was done with their comments. SANDAG will revise the overall outreach process as needed based on this review. A table of some commonly used outreach strategies and evaluation methods is included in this PPP.

13. SANDAG coordinates and consults with other federal, state, local, and nonprofit agencies in developing regional transportation plans and transportation improvement programs, including ensuring coordination of metropolitan planning activities with planning for nonemergency transportation services and social service transportation.

SANDAG Board Policy No. 025, which is SANDAG’s Public Participation Policy, is included as Appendix D to this PPP. The guidelines and principles in this PPP are intended to be consistent with the mandates in Board Policy No. 025. In the event of a conflict between the language in this PPP and Board Policy No. 025, the requirements in Board Policy No. 025 shall supersede the provisions in this PPP.

---

1 Although certain revisions to Board Policy No. 025 are scheduled to be considered by the Board in late 2012, those revisions are non-substantive in nature and are consistent with the version included in Appendix D of this report.
Project Development and Program Planning

SANDAG will follow the guidelines outlined in the overall public participation process as well as the guidelines below when conducting public outreach and involvement for planning, environmental, and preliminary engineering activities.

Some of the current SANDAG planning projects underway that are incorporated under this PPP are outlined below. If needed, individual public involvement plans with specified strategies and activities to secure public input and involvement will be developed and included in the final plan or report.

- Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP)
- Sustainable Communities Strategy
- Coordinated Public Transit - Human Services Transportation Plan (Coordinated Plan) for San Diego County
- Combined Regional Comprehensive Plan (RCP) and Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) update
- Mid-Coast Corridor Transit project
- South Bay Bus Rapid Transit project
- SuperLoop Transit project
- TransNet Early Action Program implementation
- SANDAG Overall Work Program (OWP)
- Other studies, projects, and initiatives (i.e., corridor studies, grant-funded programs)

Public Participation Process

1. SANDAG will follow current federal and state regulations regarding public involvement processes and procedures. SANDAG will develop public involvement plans in consultation with all interested parties and will describe and secure feedback on procedures, strategies, and desired outcomes.

2. SANDAG will develop public involvement plans tailored to meet specific project needs, which address the unique challenges presented by each project. SANDAG will follow best practices in developing these plans, including recommendations contained in the Transportation Research Board publication entitled: “Practical Approaches for Involving Traditionally Underserved Populations in Transportation Decisionmaking (NCHRP Report 710). This includes addressing needs and conducting outreach with stakeholders listed in the overall public participation process section.

3. The tailored public involvement plans will set objectives, identify people to be reached, develop public involvement strategy, and define specific outreach techniques. This will be developed in consultation with interested stakeholders.

4. SANDAG will maintain and enhance opportunities to promote plans and projects and secure input on those plans and projects through the SANDAG website, email newsletters and notification, social media channels, and other web-based activities.

5. SANDAG will promote plans and projects at Board of Directors meetings and meetings of the SANDAG Policy Advisory Committees: Executive, Transportation, Regional Planning, Borders, and Public Safety.

6. SANDAG will promote other opportunities for public participation and involvement at the meetings of the Interagency Technical Working Group on Tribal Transportation Issues; Social Services Transportation Advisory Committee; Regional Planning Stakeholders Working Group; Regional Planning Technical Working Group; Cities/County Transportation Advisory Committee; Bicycle/Pedestrian Working Group; Regional Energy Working Group; Regional Housing Working
Group; Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities; San Diego Region Conformity Working Group; and any other appropriate working groups.

7. SANDAG will ensure that opportunities for public participation and comment are provided at key milestones during the development of RTP updates, RTIP, project criteria, network alternatives, funding alternatives, environmental documents, planning studies, toll rate decisions and other project and policy efforts so that public comment and responses are provided and considered prior to any final SANDAG action or approval.

8. The PPP will be developed so that critical community concerns and technical issues are identified and potential options to address those concerns are provided. These issues include but are not limited to siting decisions, relocations, engineering, environmental, economic, social, and financial analyses that respond effectively to community needs and preferences and satisfy local, state, and federal environmental clearance requirements.

9. For planning, project, funding, transit fare, and policy decisions, public input shall be documented, issues or concerns addresses, and resolution of issues and/or changes made reflected in final reports, plans, or other documents. The final reports or documents are subject to approval by a vote at a public SANDAG Board or PAC meeting.

10. To facilitate community participation, lists of individuals, agencies, and organizations will be maintained for distribution of agency materials. SANDAG will promote opt-in opportunities for web-based participation. These lists will include persons who have indicated an interest in transportation planning projects during previous public information efforts and/or focused on the specific project. Project information would be distributed to the persons on this list in conjunction with public meetings and workshops to solicit comments and recommendations.

11. Environmental documents will be prepared in accordance with CEQA and NEPA, as appropriate, and in coordination and consultation with various federal, state, and local agencies and with elected officials, community leaders, organizations, and other individuals from the neighborhoods and communities potentially affected by the proposed action. SANDAG will prepare and distribute appropriate notices and communications to comply with CEQA and NEPA requirements. Coordination and public participation will be achieved through a variety of means, such as formal public hearings and meetings, circulation of draft documents, mailings, scoping and focus group meetings, workshops, and individual/group contacts.

12. When developing RTP updates and the RTIP, SANDAG will consult with agencies and officials responsible for other planning activities within the metropolitan planning area – the San Diego region – that are affected by transportation. These planning activities include state and local planned growth, economic development, environmental protection, transit projects, border crossings, airport and seaport operations, or freight movements.

13. Formal scoping meetings, public hearings, and/or other meetings during the comment period and environmental document certification will be held in accordance with the requisite environmental laws. As required, meetings will be announced in the Federal Register, local publications, and on the SANDAG website. Persons and organizations on the project mailing list also will be notified. SANDAG will endeavor to hold public meetings in locations accessible by public transit. These meetings will be held in buildings, rooms, or locations that are accessible to persons with disabilities.

14. A targeted public participation program will be developed to inform the community of factors related to a planning project. The information program may include briefings for the news media, informational meetings, presentations to include community and professional associations and educational institutions, community-based organizations, business groups and associations, environmental organizations, and other public forums.