MEETING NOTICE
AND AGENDA

COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES
The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) may take action on any item appearing on this agenda.

Tuesday, November 6, 2012
3:00 to 4:30 p.m.
SANDAG, 7th Floor Conference Room
401 B Street, Suite 800
San Diego, CA  92101-4231

Staff Contact:  Hector Vanegas
(619) 699-1972
Hector.Vanegas@sandag.org

AGENDA HIGHLIGHTS
• BORDER 2020: UNITED STATES – MEXICO ENVIRONMENTAL PROGRAM
• BINATIONAL SEAWATER DESALINATION FEASIBILITY STUDY: STATUS UPDATE
• CITY OF TECATE BORDER PROJECTS

MISSION STATEMENT
The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) will advise the Borders Committee of the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG) concerning both short- and long-term binational related activities, issues, and actions; provide input regarding binational border-related planning and development; and identify ways to assist and coordinate with existing efforts in the binational area.
The COBRO will serve as a working group to the SANDAG Borders Committee to facilitate a better understanding of the binational border-related issues and needs of the California-Baja California region.
Welcome to SANDAG! Members of the public may speak to the COBRO on any item at the time that the Committee is considering the item. Please complete a Speaker’s Slip which is located in the rear of the room and then present the slip to Committee staff. Also, members of the public are invited to address the Committee on any issue under the agenda item entitled Public Comments/Communications. Speakers are limited to three minutes. The COBRO may take action on any item appearing on the agenda.

This agenda and related staff reports can be accessed at www.sandag.org under meetings on SANDAG’s Web site. Public comments regarding the agenda can be forwarded to SANDAG via the e-mail comment form also available on the Web site. E-mail comments should be received no later than noon, two days prior to the COBRO meeting.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact SANDAG at (619) 699-1900 in advance of the meeting. To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1990, (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905.

**SANDAG offices are accessible by public transit.**
*Phone 511 or see www.511sd.com for route information.*
1. **WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS**

2. **SUMMARY OF MEETINGS**
   

3. **PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS**

   Members of the public shall have the opportunity to address the COBRO on any issue within the jurisdiction of SANDAG that is not on this agenda. Anyone desiring to speak shall reserve time by completing a “Request to Speak” form and giving it to the COBRO coordinator prior to speaking. Public speakers should notify the COBRO coordinator if they have a handout for distribution to COBRO members. Public speakers are limited to three minutes or less per person. COBRO members also may provide information and announcements under this agenda item.

**CONSENT (4)**

4. **UPCOMING EVENTS**

**REPORTS (5 through 7)**

5. **BORDER 2020: UNITED STATES – MEXICO ENVIRONMENTAL PROGRAM** (Dave Fege, U.S. EPA)

   Dave Fege will provide an overview of the Border 2020: U.S.- Mexico Environmental Program. In addition, highlights from the Border 2013 - 2020 Air Policy Forum held in Tijuana on August 7-8, 2012, will be given.

6. **BINATIONAL SEAWATER DESALINATION FEASIBILITY STUDY: STATUS UPDATE** (Halla Razak, San Diego Water Authority)

   The San Diego Water Authority is participating in a binational feasibility study of a large-scale seawater desalination plant that would be constructed in Rosarito Beach in Baja California, Mexico. An update on the status of this project will be provided.

7. **CITY OF TECATE BORDER PROJECTS** (Gabriel Vazquez, City of Tecate; and Carlos Graizbord)

   This presentation will provide updates on the Cottonwood Creek and Tecate River rehabilitation program, and proposed land uses in the border area of Jacumé.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITEM #</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>NEXT MEETING DATE AND LOCATION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The next meeting of the COBRO is scheduled for Tuesday, February 5, 2013, from 3:00 to 4:30 p.m., at SANDAG.

+ next to an item indicates an attachment
SUMMARY OF THE JUNE 5, 2012, MEETING

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Both the Chair and Vice Chair were not present at this meeting. As a result, Miguel Tapia, City of Chula Vista, was nominated to be Chair only for this meeting through a motion by Dave Fege, U.S. EPA and a second by Dennis LaSalle, CDT. This motion was unanimously approved by the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO). The June 5, 2012, COBRO meeting was called to order by Acting Chair Miguel Tapia at 3:14 p.m.

Members present were: Miguel Tapia, City of Chula Vista; Dave Fege, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Border Liaison Office (U.S. EPA); Dennis LaSalle, Oscar Escobedo, Pedro Romero, and Mario López, Consejo de Desarrollo Económico de Tijuana (CDT); Daniel Rubio, Rodolfo Argote, and Luis Elias Sanz, Instituto Metropolitano de Planeación Tijuana (IMPLAN Tijuana); Gerardo Chávez, City of Tecate; Tito Alegría, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte (COLEF); Tatiana Martínez, Laura Araujo, and Aida Bustos; Binational Committee Tijuana Innovadora; Viviana Ibañez, Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce and Binational Tijuana Innovadora; James Clark and Víctor Zapata, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce; Denice García and Nancy Gudiño, City of San Diego; Carolina Chávez and Daniela Villamor, City of Tijuana; Ismael Plascencia, Universidad Autónoma de Baja California (UABC).

SANDAG staff present were: Hector Vanegas, Ron Saenz, and Freslinda Vera.

Chair Miguel Tapia welcomed two new members to COBRO, Oscar Escobedo member of the Executive Coordinating Council of Tijuana (Consejo Coordinador Ejecutivo de Tijuana), and Daniel Rubio, Executive Planning Director of IMPLAN Tijuana.

+2. SUMMARY OF MEETING

Action: Upon a motion by Viviana Ibañez, Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce, and a second by Dave Fege, U.S. EPA, the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities unanimously approved the summary of the February 7, 2012, meeting.

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS

No comments were presented this time.
CONSENT (4 and 5)

+4. UPCOMING EVENTS

Hector Vanegas, SANDAG, indicated that information regarding the event Bike to Work Day and “Tijuaneando en Bici” could be found in the agenda, a joint effort of San Diego and Tijuana to promote active transportation in the region.

Denice García, City of San Diego, invited attendees to the Third Binational Summit of the U.S.-Mexico Border Mayors Association, hosted by the City of San Diego on Friday, August 24, 2012; at the Manchester Grand Hyatt.

James Clark, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce, also extended an invitation to the “One Region One Voice, Mission to Washington, D.C” trip that will take place on Friday, September 9-12, 2012.

Viviana Ibañez, Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce, announced the 22nd Annual Golf Tournament that will take place on Friday, July 13, 2012, at the Riverwalk Golf Club.

Action: This item was presented for information. No action was taken on this item.

+5. 2012 BIKE TO WORK AND TIJUANEANDO EN BICI

Hector Vanegas explained that the San Diego region annually celebrates the Bike to Work Day to promote the bicycle as an option for commuting to work. Since 2011, Tijuana began a similar event called “Tijuaneando en Bici” as part of a joint effort with SANDAG, in order to expand to Mexico the use of active transportation. Part of the “Tijuaneando en Bici” route included the crossing of the San Ysidro POE to a pit stop located near the border, symbolizing the collaboration between the cross-border region, and a link between the two events.

Chair Miguel Tapia added that these events are extremely positive in terms of promoting awareness of the health, environment, and transportation system benefits of using alternative non-motorized transportation. It also supports the establishment of programs and policies focused on the use of active transportation.

REPORT ITEMS (6 through 8)


Hector Vanegas stated that the annual Binational Seminar began as a suggestion from COBRO, 15 years ago, and since it represents an important event for SANDAG, recommendations and/or suggestions are welcomed and appreciated. He added that COBRO created a Taskforce to support the organization of this year’s Binational Seminar, and informed attendees that the Save the Date of the event for Tuesday, June 26, could be found in the agenda packet.
Hector Vanegas explained that the Binational Seminar agenda for 2012 was similar to the format used for 2011, with the innovation of having a keynote speaker, for which they are seeking to confirm a representative of the Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Geografía (INEGI, Mexican National Institute of Statistics and Geography).

Hector Vanegas added that the theme, “The Mechanics of Crossborder Collaboration: The San Diego Region and the Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito Metropolitan Zone,” is mainly an opportunity to review the plans of the San Diego-Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito Metropolitan Zone region in order to determine the similarities between them and identify the areas that require further work, in order to acquire a more effective collaboration on the border.

The agenda contains welcoming remarks followed by comments by local officials, already confirmed. The next step will be an introduction to the subject as a prelude for the presentation of the Strategic Metropolitan Zone Plan of Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito finalizing in a panel of experts from both countries discussing strategies for cross-border collaboration. He added that hopefully the outcome will be a list of recommendations for the development of policies, which COBRO will extend to the Borders Committee and Board of Directors.

Hector Vanegas explained that the white paper is under development and will be distributed to participants upon its finalization, prior to the Binational Seminar. Ron Saenz, SANDAG, added that the white paper will include a table, in which the contents of the Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito Strategic Zone Metropolitan Plan, San Diego Regional Comprehensive Plan, and 2050 Regional Transportation Plan will be compared in order to identify similarities and opportunities for collaboration.

7. TIJUANA INNOVADORA (José Galicot and Tatiana Martínez, Tijuana Innovadora)

Tatiana Martínez, Binational Committee Tijuana Innovadora, invited attendees to participate in Tijuana Innovadora 2012. Ms. Martínez explained she is a journalist focused on border issues, with the main purpose of improving the image of Tijuana, a mission shared by Tijuana Innovadora. The event began in 2010 with the main interest of showing the positive aspects of the city and mitigate the negative profile that characterized Tijuana, enforced by media. With this purpose in mind, they made a joint effort with CDT, COTUCO, and other organizations and gathered 700 attendants for the event, which was a platform to introduce current issues in which the city was involved and introduced a positive new vision previously disregarded. Ms. Martínez added that due to the success of 2010, this year’s event focus was the binational aspect of the region.

Ms. Martínez stated that Tijuana Innovadora 2010, held a series of notable speakers such as former Vice President Al Gore; Paul Jacobs, General Director of Qualcomm; Larry King, Television and Radio Host; among others.

Ms. Martínez explained that this year’s event incorporated a Binational Committee in order to address potential attendees from San Diego. One of the strategies of the Binational Committee of Tijuana Innovadora is to show San Diegans the positive aspects of Tijuana, and present both cities as part of the same region, with the purpose of improving tourism and investment. As part of the service, they will offer shuttles to commute to the event.
Tatiana Martínez explained that the event will take place on October 11 – 21, 2012; and will be divided into three main subjects: creativity, industry, and humanities, each having their own list of subtopics with conferences given by different international and Mexican speakers.

Laura Araujo, Binational Committee Tijuana Innovadora, explained she has been coordinating with potential leaders and volunteers for the event; since in the 2010 event they had 364 students as part of the team, she predicts over 600 recruits for this year to collaborate with logistics and operations. In addition to students and academics, the event aims for business leaders and patrons of the arts in order to cover all the important areas that represent Tijuana.

Ms. Martínez shared a list of confirmed speakers that includes Emilio Azcárraga, President of Group Televisa, the largest media company in Latin America; Marcela Valladolid, Tijuana chef; Enrique Norten, renowned Mexican architect, on the Mexican side and Steve Wozniak, Co-founder of Apple Computers; Ada Yonath, Nobel Prize in Chemistry, as international guests.

Tatiana Martínez explained that besides the variety of subjects and renowned speakers the event offers, they aim to have a suitable price for all audiences and public workshops free of charge.

Tito Alegría, COLEF, suggested to the Binational Committee of Tijuana Innovadora to include the cosmopolitan aspect of the region, since it represents one of its strongest characteristics, having immigrants from 36 countries around the world.

Carolina Chávez, City of Tijuana, stated that since they host and attend events throughout the region, they have a large database, which could be used to share the information of the event.

Regarding a question on the registration process, Ms. Martínez explained that even though attendees may register online and arrive at the event by their own means, the Binational Committee of Tijuana Innovadora had been giving presentations in order to inform about the event and schedule shuttles for interested groups that could provide transportation to the event and back.

Laura Araujo added that part of the idea of having workshops is for attendees to have a wider spectrum of activities, which includes panels and PYMES meetings, promoted by the Mexican Secretariat of Economy and Work as an opportunity for small and medium sized business to encounter and exchange information.

Mario López, CDT, added that part of the strategy they are addressing this year is to give the event a wider range of promotion in time and range of public. Specifically, elected officials are an important audience, for which they have made special presentations and asked SANDAG for support in promoting the event among the staff of elected officials, including scheduling a presentation in a Border Committee’s meeting.

Rodolfo Argote, IMPLAN, stated that Digital City is a subject included in Tijuana Innovadora’s schedule and recently incorporated in the Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito Metropolitan Zone Strategic Plan. Hector Vanegas added that in the comparison of issues made between those addressed in the Strategic Plan and in the different Regional Plans published by SANDAG, they found that Digital City was a subject that did not have a counterpart project in San Diego, and was worth pursuing in future plans.
Mario López, CDT, introduced Pedro Romero, CDT, as a distinguished businessman from Tijuana, President and founder of CDT and CCE (Consejo Coordinador Empresarial, Business Coordinating Council), former President of Museo del Trompo, an interactive museum for children; who has been working for the past years in the Strategic Economic Zone.

Mr. Romero explained that this project has been supported by State Governors, City Mayors, Business leaders and Universities; and highlighted that one of the biggest issues the region presents are border crossings, which currently experience two or more hour long waits. Mr. Romero explained that the research they have done includes successful examples from around the world. Specifically they have focused in the city of Shenzhen, in China, country in which Mr. Romero owns business offices, and has had the opportunity of witnessing the scientific and technologic strategies that have enabled the establishment of public policies for regional development.

The main focus of the presentation was to explain the importance of Special Economic Zones, which work as “Regional Innovation Ecosystems”. In the specific example of Baja California, the Strategic Economic Zone includes the state of Baja California, Baja California Sur, and part of Sonora. The goal of the project is to take advantage of the region’s strategic location, strengthen the trade between Mexico-U.S., increase exports, enhance industrial upgrading and promote science, technology, and innovation throughout the region.

Mr. Romero and Mario Lopez explained that the establishment of the Strategic Economic Zone will be divided in three phases. The first will be the creation of a Trade Policy, in which they will seek to determine an appropriate tariff in order to be able to raise regional competitiveness and retain consumers, an issue that currently represents the loss of 30 percent of the state’s Gross Domestic Product (GDP). The Second phase regards Policy Innovation, in which through research and development of enterprises and educative institutions, they will promote innovation, science, and technology. The final Third phase involves Fiscal Policy; in which after the competitiveness level has been improved, the region will aim for further international competition in order to attract new talent and gain Foreign Direct Investment.

Mario Lopez stated that the Strategic Economic Zone vision is to become a region with a higher level of generalized social welfare, international recognition for its scientific and technologic development as a result of a “Culture of Innovation” and a Knowledge based Economy. Mr. Lopez also outlined the mission, which states that the focus will be to take advantage of the region’s privileged geographical location, creating a Regional Innovation Ecosystem as a platform for entrepreneurs, professionals and researchers to develop projects, generate business products and services, with high added value and better paid jobs.

Ismael Plascencia, UABC, explained that the model they are following comes from the German Development Institute, which consists of four levels. The first is the MICRO level, which includes consumers, small, medium, and large enterprises, and multinational corporations. This is followed by the MESO level in which we can find Non-governmental Cluster Initiatives. The third level is for the MACRO level regarding economic development policy; and finally the fourth, META level, which links the MESO and MACRO level within the Economic Strategic Zone or Regional Innovation Ecosystem.
Mr. Plascencia explained that China currently has 164 Strategic Zones that fluctuate from Scientific and Technologic Development Zones to Investment Zones in Taiwan. He added that in the 60's, China studied the Maquiladora phenomenon in Tijuana and adapted it to their circumstances. One of the main differences in assimilation was that Tijuana viewed Maquiladoras as an Employment Policy, in contrast to China that adopted the Export Processing Zones as an Industrial Policy with further more success.

Ismael Plascencia added that a clear example of collaboration of an Economic Strategic Zone is the relationship the City of Shenzhen established with Hong Kong, taking advantage of their location, demography, economic growth, and structure; a situation that could be applied to our region, in which San Diego would be the equivalent of Hong Kong and Tijuana of Shenzhen.

Mario López explained that following the three phases of the establishment of an Economic Strategic Zone, Shenzhen outcomes were as follows: The first stage 1980-1986, Hong Kong transferred labor industries to Shenzhen acquiring an annual growth of 44 percent. On the second stage 1987-1995, the GDP growth was 29 percent and the municipal government promoted a system centered in scientific, technological development, and innovation in enterprises. Finally, on the third stage 1996-2006, the growth of GDP was of 19 percent, and hi-tech industry achieved a 53.3 percent growth per year.

Mr. López added that the key policies Shenzhen followed in order to succeed were: attracting Foreign Direct Investment, creation of new competitive advantages, investment in research and development, promotion of technicians training, relocation of productive activities, upgrade of the financial system, and promotion of the development of industrial clusters.

Christina Luhn, EDC, explained she is currently working in the Mega Region Initiative, which involves Imperial Valley, San Diego and Baja California. As part of her research, two years ago she visited the area of Shenzhen-Hong Kong, given that it presents a unique circumstance, similar to our region. One of the things she found was that given the process they went through, the success in the region had pushed out the less expensive or more competitive labor force; as the region has developed they are facing different challenges, and wondered if those forthcoming changing circumstances were being taken into consideration in the Strategic Economic Zone plan.

Pedro Romero explained they are looking to improve the concepts they found to be successful. Their main concern is to develop science and technology, and establish the concept of working as one region.

Mario Lopez suggested to Christina Luhn to schedule a meeting with the Mega Region Initiative in which they could present the Strategic Economic Zone work, in order to link both projects, seeming that they already have a considerable progress with the current Mexican Federal Government.

Pedro Romero highlighted that one of the main issues that needs to be mitigated to guarantee success are waits at the border, which represent an important obstacle for binational businesses.

Hector Vanegas informed attendees that during the last Borders Committee meeting, the Consul General of Mexico presented a report on the Trans-Pacific Partnership, a free trade agreement between 13 countries of the Pacific Rim, to which Mexico has been invited but still needs approval from all the members.
James Clark, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce, stated that regarding the border waits, they have suggested to Customs Border Protection (CBP) a program in which people with SENTRI may register guests for a determined period of time, so they may be able to avoid long border waits. Mr. Clark explained that it is an ongoing effort and negotiation with CBP, but they still need more regional support in order to be able to take the issue to a federal level.

To conclude, Chair Miguel Tapia thanked attendees for his designation as Chair of the meeting and reminded attendees to RSVP for the Binational Seminar of June 26.

9. NEXT MEETING DATE AND LOCATION

The next meeting of the COBRO is the 2012 Binational Seminar on Tuesday, June 26, 2012, from 12:15 to 5 p.m., at Caltrans District 11.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:34 pm.
SUMMARY OF THE SEPTEMBER 4, 2012, MEETING

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

The September 4, 2012, Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) meeting, was called to order by Chair Paul Ganster, Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias, San Diego State University (SDSU) at 3:15 p.m.

Members present were: Chair Paul Ganster, Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias at SDSU; Alberto Díaz and Juan Carlos Rivas, Consulate General of the United States in Tijuana; Past Chair Elsa Saxod, Saxod Enterprises/S.D. County Water Authority; Sergio Pallares, Caltrans District 11; Miguel Tapia, City of Chula Vista; Denice Garcia, City of San Diego; Daniela Villamor, City of Tijuana; Dennis LaSalle, Consejo de Desarrollo Económico de Tijuana (CDT); Tito Alegría, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte (COLEF); Rubén Carrillo, Instituto Metropolitano de Planeación Tijuana (IMPLAN); Nathan Owens, San Diego Dialogue; Jason M-B Wells, San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce; David Fege, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Border Liaison Office (U.S. EPA); and Halla Razak, San Diego County Water Authority.

SANDAG staff present were: Héctor Vanegas, Ron Saenz, and Freslinda Vera.

2. SUMMARY OF MEETING

Action: Due to lack of quorum, this item was presented for information. No action was taken on this item.

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS

Alberto Díaz, Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego, invited attendees to a press conference of Tijuana Innovadora, Wednesday, September 5, at 10:30 a.m. at 4117 Fourth Avenue, in downtown San Diego.

Action: This item was presented for information. No action was taken on this item.
CONSENT (4 and 5)

+4. UPCOMING EVENTS

Chair Ganster invited attendees to review upcoming events and meeting times that were included in the agenda packet.

Chair Ganster also reminded attendees that SANDAG is becoming a paperless agency, which means that for forthcoming meetings agendas will only be viewed digitally.

Action: This item was presented for information. No action was taken on this item.

+5. COBRO CALENDAR OF MEETINGS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2013 (Hector Vanegas)

Hector Vanegas, SANDAG, announced that the calendar of meetings for Fiscal Year 2012 was included in the agenda packet. The following are the scheduled COBRO meeting dates: November 6, 2012; February 5; March 22 (Joint Meeting); April 9; and June 4, 2013. The last date is tentatively reserved for the Annual Binational Event.

Action: This item was presented for information. No action was taken on this item.

REPORTS (6 through 9)


Past Chair Elsa Saxod informed attendees that the Binational Seminar’s theme of 2012 represents the second effort that the binational region has made jointly in the planning field, the first being the Otay Mesa - Mesa de Otay Binational Corridor Strategic Plan which was a result of the 2004 Binational Seminar. Since then, the border region has grown stronger with a better relationship and communication. The 2012 Binational Seminar brought to the table new subjects and discussions that need to be addressed for the region’s growth.

The recommendations of the Task Force are based on the discussion of key points made at the 2012 Binational Seminar. The 2012 Binational Seminar Task Force participants propose that COBRO consider forwarding the following recommendations to the Borders Committee:

1. Identify mechanisms and/or opportunities on how the San Diego region and the Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito Metropolitan Zone could improve addressing Land Port of Entry issues, such as border wait times, and consequently effectively guide federal decisions through local input.

2. SANDAG should collaborate with various stakeholders to explore strengthening a communication strategy (the border narrative) to improve articulating the region’s needs on border issues. This message should reflect a positive narrative of cooperation.
3. Promote the inclusion of the State of Baja California and representatives from Tecate and Playas de Rosarito at the next joint meeting of the Borders Committee, COBRO, and the City of Tijuana. Participants at the next joint meeting would discuss linking proposed regional planning strategies. These strategies also would be considered in the development of the upcoming San Diego Regional Plan. Staff also would continue to collaborate with IMPLAN so that they may consider including these items in the Second Phase of the Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito Metropolitan Zone Strategic Plan.

Mario Lopez, Smart Border Coalition, stated that the first recommendation is something the region has been fighting against for the past decade, which involves a series of issues that still remain a problem and as a region we still haven’t been able to determine a course of action in order to diminish them. He considers Recommendation 2 to be the most innovative; it is an important tool to have a better understanding with the media, in order for them to truly understand the issues the border presents and create a truthful border narrative. For Recommendation 3, Mr. Lopez stated that since last year Tecate, Playas de Rosarito, and Tijuana signed an agreement to create an association of governments, a subject in which SANDAG could share experiences, especially those regarding specific planning documents such as the Regional Comprehensive Plan (RCP).

Sergio Pallares, Caltrans, stated that a very important subject that should be addressed and informed to the community are the forthcoming modifications for southbound crossings, which could potentially cause future congestion, therefore, it is an important topic that should be up for discussion in COBRO. Senator Denise Ducheny supported Sergio Pallares suggestion and added that it should be made public before November when it’s due to happen.

Alberto Díaz added that it is very important for people to be informed about the status of the San Ysidro-Puerta Mexico Port of Entry, which is also linked with Recommendation 1 of the Binational Seminar Task Force. He also stated that there has been at least one meeting where the media was involved, as part of the agenda of the media outreach group led by Javier Fernández, General Services Administration, in which the Consulate General of Mexico participates.

Juan Carlos Rivas, Consulate General of Mexico, explained there have several construction technical meetings every week to address every step of the construction of the Project, and every two weeks they’ve been also having binational meetings, in which the media outreach strategy has been determined, in order to decide the time and information that will be given to the public in the next two weeks. The official date for the opening of “El Chaparral” southbound crossing is November 1, 2012, for which several studies and traffic simulations have been made in order to guarantee there will be no congestion or problems on the Interstate 5 (I-5). The project stipulates five connecting lanes will make up the temporary connection from I-5 to “El Chaparral”, one for buses and four for vehicles. Also the pedestrian southbound crossing will be open before November 1, 2012, in order to provide a transition period.

Chair Paul Ganster highlighted all of this is related to the 2012 Binational Seminar Recommendation 1, and since it seems to be a current and very important subject it could be a possible theme for the 2013 Binational Seminar.

Although there was an insufficient quorum, the present COBRO members unanimously supported the 2012 Binational Seminar Task Force recommendations.
+7. SANDAG AGENCYWIDE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN (Paula Zamudio)

Paula Zamudio explained that currently SANDAG is in the process of updating the agencywide Public Participation Plan (PPP), which is meant to inform the public and other stakeholders about the overall public participation process, including how to receive information from SANDAG and how to provide input into the regional planning, policy, and planning decision efforts. The PPP provides the foundation for the development of specific outreach plans, including involvement for the Regional Plan which is being worked on simultaneously.

Some of the things outlined in the PPP include when, where, and how to conduct open houses, workshops or community meetings, update options for SANDAG mail and distribution lists, and required public noticing procedures, as well as the audiences that should be reached when conducting community outreach. The PPP was adopted in 2009, and currently SANDAG is soliciting input from the public regarding the outreach methods in place until the end of September. This includes surveys translated to Spanish that are being sent to a great range of audiences in order to get the most complete feedback possible. Ms. Zamudio invited attendees to provide their input and shared the link for the survey and comments. All of this will be used to evaluate the PPP and update the plan accordingly.

Ms. Zamudio added that when the draft document is ready it will be presented for review to COBRO and other outreach groups.

Chair Paul Ganster also suggested to send out an e-mail with all the information in order for it to be more accessible to everyone, and as an easier tool for sharing.

Paula Zamudio explained that SANDAG offers an electronic newsletter called “The rEgion” that sends out monthly updates, and which can be accessed on SANDAG’s Web site and available to subscription.

+8. 2050 REGIONAL PLAN

a) DRAFT WORK PROGRAM AND SCHEDULE (Heather Adamson)

Heather Adamson, SANDAG, explained that on May 2012, the SANDAG Board of Directors approved merging the Regional Comprehensive Plan (RCP) update with the next Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (RTP/SCS). SANDAG has been doing updates to the RTP since the 1970’s and the last update for the RCP was in 2004. Both plans provide the long range vision for the region on how to improve the quality of life and mobility, as well as being the mechanisms to leverage federal and state funding, particularly TransNet.

Ms. Adamson explained that in terms of Smart Growth there has been a great effort and work towards the development of the region and regional transportation improvements for the last 20 years, which have all come from both plans. Currently the goal is to merge both plans.

Attachment 1 is a detailed outline, task by task, of the major planning efforts. Attachment 2 highlights the schedule of each of the work elements, which are organized by task and fiscal year. Ms. Adamson explained that with the adoption of the 2050 RTP, the Board of Directors committed to some planning efforts that include the preparation of a regional transit-oriented development
policy, a complete streets policy, development of an active transportation early action program, as well as land use and transportation scenarios. All of this work is already underway and will be included in the development of the regional plan. The work identified in both attachments will be finished by the beginning of 2013.

Also beginning next year, they will be working on updating the regional growth forecast for 2050 called Series 13, and completing an activity base model. This is also currently under development and expected to be available in summer 2013.

Another part is to work on policy areas, strategies, and the update of technical information, which covers a series of subjects, including binational, for which they will be closely working with COBRO to determine goals for the region.

By spring and summer 2013, similar to past development of transportation plans, they will review the transportation project evaluation criteria as well as performance measures, requirements, and will conduct an economic analysis. All of these actions will continue until fall 2013.

By spring and summer of 2014, they will evaluate the different revenue constrained scenarios using the prioritized project list, after which a preferred project list will be developed.

Once all of this is done the draft of the RTP/SCS and the environmental impact report will be developed.

By the end of 2014, the air quality conformity evaluation draft for federal requirements will be released. The draft Regional Plan, including all the components, policies, and strategies will be released by March 2015 for public comments and as part of the public outreach. The plan is expected to be adopted in summer 2015.

Ms. Adamson explained that Attachment 3 shows the roles and responsibilities of the major tasks, in which COBRO is included for the binational tasks and input in related topics.

To conclude Ms. Adamson invited COBRO members to give input on the overall process.

Ron Saenz, SANDAG, and Rubén Carrillo, IMPLAN, explained that Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito are undergoing a similar process in which they are merging different plans into the 2034 Metropolitan Zone Strategic Plan that will serve the whole metropolitan region. That plan is also divided in different subjects according to different issues, in which the binational theme is included.

Denise Ducheny stated the importance of linking both countries’ upcoming plans, and work as one region in addressing problems that include both sides of the border. SANDAG and IMPLAN will need to work closely to determine in what areas and subjects both plans need to coincide.

Tito Alegría, COLEF, added that in order to have a better understanding and control of the growth of the border, a wide range of subjects need to be addressed from the binational perspective. Heather Adamson explained that the RTP/SCS is considering a separate chapter dedicated for binational issues and will be developed in close work with COBRO and the Borders Committee. She
also added that they will be contacting COBRO throughout the three year schedule to receive input in the development of the plan.

b) DRAFT PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT PLAN (Carolina Gregor)

Carolina Gregor, SANDAG, explained the RTP/SCS merge is a first of its kind effort, and every time an effort of this magnitude is made, a public involvement plan is required in order to involve the public and determine how stakeholders and working groups wish to be involved in the process.

The first part of the outreach for the 2050 RTP/SCS included early public involvement, in which they determine how everyone wants to be involved. The second part was public involvement during the development of the plan with more specific public workshops, newsletters, “The rEgion”, social media, over 200 presentations on the plan, informational materials, and other efforts.

The third part was community-based outreach, in which they involve a number of community-based organizations who could reach out into their own communities, and involve them into the planning process.

In addition the public involvement plan addressed government consultation, which included consultations with the Native American Groups, coordination with Mexico, and other regional planning agencies. In regards to Mexico, the primary approach is through SANDAG Board of Directors, the Borders Committee, COBRO, binational workshops, and IMPLAN.

Ms. Gregor explained that for this plan they are implementing more Web based techniques.

Ms. Gregor added that they will be holding a workshop in mid-October, in which the American Planning Association, Public Health, and Environmental Groups will be welcomed to participate.

Ms. Gregor explained that after all the results are gathered, they will be included in the Public Involvement Plan and will go through the committee structure and SANDAG Board of Directors for approval after which they will actually get started in the public involvement.

Ms. Gregor invited attendees to share any ideas to include other groups or input they may have.

Chair Paul Ganster suggested contacting agencies in Mexico, to arrange a workshop at a venue in Mexico, in order to get a more enriching input from their agencies and public.

Mario Lopez added that it would be important to make at least one public outreach event south of the border in association with IMPLAN, since they could bring a good quorum from the different cities and stakeholders. Mr. Lopez explained that planning with the community is something new in Mexico, and these kinds of workshops help the process and give the opportunity to link actions made on both sides.

Tito Alegría suggested that if they wanted more technical inputs they could have a workshop at COLEF with specialists from different areas.
Dave Fege, U.S. EPA, there should also be interest in the maquiladora industry, tourism industry, and trucking industry which are all important groups south of the border. Chair Ganster suggested that since those groups are very well organized it should be easy to invite them to meetings in order to get their input.

+9.  2011 SAN DIEGO - BAJA CALIFORNIA BORDER CROSSINGS AND TRADE STATISTICS
(Freslinda Vera)

Freslinda Vera informed attendees on the complete report of Border Crossings and Trade Statistics for 2011 which could be found in the agenda packet and posted on SANDAG’s Web site. It includes detailed graphics and statistics regarding volumes and trends at the San Ysidro, Otay Mesa, and Tecate POEs. She added that the source of the information was the U.S. Bureau of Transportation Statistics.

Ms. Vera also invited attendees to contact Hector Vanegas or her if they had any questions or comments.

10. NEXT MEETING DATE AND LOCATION

The next meeting of the COBRO is scheduled for Tuesday, November 6, 2012, from 3:00 to 4:30 p.m., at SANDAG.

Chair Paul Ganster adjourned the meeting at 4:32 p.m.
UPCOMING EVENTS

WHAT: Coloquio Internacional de Desarrollo Sustentable Norte-Sur: Diálogos de Frontera (International Colloquium on North-South Sustainable Development: Border Dialogues)
COLEF - Nogales, Sonora
WHEN: November 7-9, 2012.
WHERE: Fray Marcos de Niza Hotel in Nogales, Sonora and University of Arizona in Tucson.
MORE INFO: Dr. Rigoberto García Ochoa at 01 (631) 314-3710, rigo@colef.mx or http://www.colef.net

WHAT: IV Congreso de Estudios de Género en el Norte de México (IV Studies of Genre in North of Mexico Congress)
COLEF
WHEN: November 22-23, 2012
WHERE: Instituto de Investigaciones Sociales de la UABC, Mexicali.
MORE INFO: Dra. Lya Margarita Niño Contreras at +52(686) 566-06 58 ext. 123, lnino@uabc.edu.mx or http://www.colef.net

WHAT: 3rd Annual Binational Borders Studies
USD Trans-Border Institute
WHEN: November 29-30, 2012
WHERE: San Diego City College and Casa del Túnel, Tijuana
MORE INFO: Binational Conference on Border Issues, binationalconference@gmail.com or https://www.sandiego.edu/peacestudies/tbi

WHAT: Policy Report: Water in the San Diego-Baja California Region
USD Trans-Border Institute
WHEN: November 30, 2012
WHERE: USD, Joan B. Kroc Institute for Peace & Justice Rooms A&B
MORE INFO: Vivien Francis at transborder@sandiego.edu or https://www.sandiego.edu/peacestudies/tbi/news/events

Key Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas, (619) 699-1972, Hector.Vanegas@sandag.org
BORDER 2020: UNITED STATES–MEXICO ENVIRONMENTAL PROGRAM

Introduction

The Border 2020: United States–Mexico Environmental Program (Border 2020 Program) is the latest cooperative environmental initiative and builds on previous binational efforts, particularly the Border 2012 Program. The Border 2020 Program is an eight-year (2013-2020) binational effort designed to protect the environment and public health in the U.S.-Mexico Border region.

Discussion

The Border 2020 Program is the most recent version of the environmental programs implemented between the two countries since the execution of the 1983 La Paz Agreement. This new program continues encouraging participation from local communities and stakeholders and focusing on areas where environmental improvements are needed most. Attachment 1 is a summary that highlights the mission statement, guiding principles and fundamental strategies, as well as goals and objectives of the Border 2020 Program.

A full version of the Border 2020 Program can be accessed at: http://www.epa.gov/usmexicoborder/


Key Staff Contact: Ron Saenz, (619) 699-1922, Ronald.Saenz@sandag.org
**BORDER 2020:**
**U.S.-MEXICO ENVIRONMENTAL PROGRAM**

**Summary**

The Border 2020 Program is the latest environmental program implemented under the 1983 La Paz Agreement. It builds on the Border 2012 Environmental Program, emphasizing regional, bottom-up approaches for decision making, priority setting, and project implementation to address the environmental and public health problems in the border region. As in Border 2012, the new Program encourages meaningful participation from communities and local stakeholders.

The Border 2020 Program also strengthens its focus in regional areas where environmental improvements are needed most: establishing thematic goals, supporting the implementation of projects, considering new fundamental strategies, and encouraging the achievement of more ambitious environmental and public health goals.

The **Guiding Principles** support the mission of the Border 2020 Program and will ensure consistency by continuing the successful elements of previous binational environmental programs:

- Reduce the highest public health risks and preserve and restore the natural environment
- Adopt a bottom-up approach
- Address disproportionate environmental impacts
- Improve stakeholder participation
- Foster transparency, public participation, and open dialogue
- Strengthen capacity
- Achieve concrete, measurable results
- Measure program progress through the development of environmental and public health-based indicators
- Recognize tribal sovereignty of U.S. Tribes and address issues impacting tribes on a government-to-government basis
- Address the specific concerns and protect and preserve the cultural integrity of Mexican indigenous communities

Border 2020 has established six **fundamental strategies** that complement and inform the way we achieve the goals and objectives of the program:

1. Working to Improve Children’s Health
2. Building Capacity towards Climate Change Resiliency
3. Protecting Disadvantaged & Underserved Communities
4. Promoting Environmental Awareness
5. Promoting Environmental Health
6. Strengthening Tribal, State, Federal and International Partnerships

Border 2020 has identified five long-term **Goals** with specific **Objectives** to address the most serious environmental and environmentally-related public health challenges in the border region. Some objectives and sub-objectives targeted by these strategic goals are broad and are expected to serve as guidance in the development of biennial action plans.
Biennial action plans establish priority and near-term targets that pay attention to the particular needs of a geographic area, region, or community, and adapt to emerging issues and/or unanticipated resource constraints.

**Goal #1: Reduce Air Pollution**
- Continue to focus on air pollution reductions in binational airsheds
- By 2018, maintain effective air quality monitoring networks and timely access to air quality data
- Reduce greenhouse gas emissions through energy efficiency and alternatives or renewable energy projects

**Goal #2: Improve Access to Clean and Safe Water**
- By 2015, increase homes connected to safe drinking water (DW) and waste water (WW) treatment
- Help DW and WW utilities become more efficient and sustainable
- Reduce levels of metals, sediment, or bacteria entering rivers and watersheds

**Goal #3: Promote Materials and Waste Management and Clean Sites**
- Develop capacity to improve collection and recycling of e-waste, plastics, and trash
- Develop scrap tire pile prevention and recycling capacity
- Develop institutional capacity to clean up contaminated sites
- Continue to share information on border area hazardous waste facilities

**Goal #4: Enhance Joint Preparedness for Environmental Response**
- Update eight sister city joint contingency plans with risk identification and reduction of all hazards
- Facilitate easier trans-boundary movement of equipment and personnel
- Continue updating the U.S.-Mexico Joint Contingency Plan

**Goal #5: Compliance Assurance and Environmental Stewardship**
- Improve information sharing between enforcement agencies on the movement of hazardous waste across the border
- Use Toxics Release Inventory (in the U.S.) and the Emissions and Contaminant Transfer Registry (RETC, in Mexico) to identify top polluters of toxic releases
- Training and information exchange on laws and regulations of respective countries

To complement and support the goals and objectives, Border 2020 encourages the use of **Border 2020 Tools**. The tools are not intended to be all-inclusive. They include:

- Pollution Prevention Techniques
- Public Health Interventions
- Sustainable Management of Water Resources
- Environmental Information
- Regulation and Policy Development
- Cooperative Enforcement and Compliance Assistance
- Environmental Education and Training
- Infrastructure Planning and Development

### Key differences between Border 2012 and 2020
**Border 2020 includes:**
- An 8-year implementation horizon
- Six Fundamental Strategies
- 2-Year Action Plans that account for resource and priority changes and that consider the particular needs of a community or geographic area
- Indicators and Communication Committees
- A stronger communication component
- Updated goals and objectives
Organizational Structure and Coordinating Bodies (see figure) remain similar to the previous Border Environmental Program. Consistent with the La Paz Agreement, National Coordinators from each country manage overall program implementation, and ensure cooperation, coordination and communication among all coordinating bodies. Policy Fora focus on border-wide and multi-regional issues (identified as a priority by two or more regional workgroups), primarily federal in nature (requiring direct, high-level, and sustained leadership by federal program partners in the United States and Mexico) and that require broad policy considerations. Each of the five Policy Fora has a federal co-chair from the United States and Mexico. Regional Workgroups are multi-media and geographically-focused, and emphasize regional public health and environmental issues. They coordinate activities at the regional level and support the efforts of local Task Forces and coordinate with U.S. Tribes and Mexican indigenous communities. Each Regional Workgroup has one state and one federal co-chair from each country. The Regional Workgroups may create Task Forces to identify priority issues and help facilitate pilot projects by engaging with local, state and tribal governments, academia, NGOs, and the public.

Communication is an essential element of past and present U.S.-Mexico Border Environmental Programs. Border 2020, like the previous program, Border 2012, depends on a bottom-up communication approach. In order to ensure effective and timely communication and engagement with the public, program partners, and stakeholders, a communication strategy has been developed and will be updated regularly to ensure that efforts are streamlined and effective.

Interagency Cooperation and Leveraging of Resources – In order to maximize interagency cooperation, Border 2020 considers the relevant activities implemented by other institutions and the input provided by organizations that represent a broad spectrum of programs and perspectives from governmental, non-governmental, academic, and private sectors. Achievement of the goals of Border 2020 depend on continued availability and efficient utilization of funding from federal, state, and local governments as well as from public/private partnerships and collaborations. Border 2020 encourages all parties to participate in leveraging resources when developing projects, policies, and programs to meet its goals and objectives.
BINATIONAL SEAWATER DESALINATION FEASIBILITY STUDY: STATUS UPDATE  File Number 3400200

Introduction

At the July 24, 2009, joint meeting of the Borders Committee, the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO), and the City of Tijuana, Mayor Jorge Ramos (City of Tijuana) raised the issue of future water supply to his city and the possibility of a binational desalination plant that could supply water to the border region, to meet future demand and alleviate challenges of importing water from the Colorado River. More recently, the Tijuana, Tecate, and Playas de Rosarito Metropolitan Zone Strategic Plan has identified water scarcity as a critical issue and listed the future construction of seawater desalination plants as a key strategy to address future potable water needs.

Discussion

The objective of this presentation is to provide an update on the cross-border desalination efforts since it was last presented at the April 23, 2010, Borders Committee meeting. During that presentation, Halla Razak, San Diego County Water Authority (SDCWA), provided an overview of SDCWA’s work on crossborder issues, including outcomes from a preliminary study on a proposed desalination plant in Baja California.

This upcoming presentation will focus on the activities the SDCWA has undertaken in regards to the binational feasibility study of a large-scale seawater desalination plant that would be constructed in Rosarito Beach in Baja California, Mexico. The objective of this study is to evaluate the potential for constructing a seawater desalination plant with a capacity of up to 75 million gallons per day. The potable water produced from this project could be made available to U.S. and Mexican water users, augmenting Colorado River supplies. Funding for the first phase of this project was shared among SDCWA, Metropolitan Water District, Central Arizona Water Conservation District, and Southern Nevada Water Authority.

Key Staff Contact: Ron Saenz, (619) 699-1922, Ronald.Saenz@sandag.org