MEETING NOTICE
AND AGENDA

COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES (COBRO)

The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) may take action on any item appearing on this agenda.

Tuesday, July 7, 2009

3:00 to 4:30 p.m.

SANDAG, 7th Floor Conference Room
401 B Street, Suite 800
San Diego, CA 92101-4231

Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas
(619) 699-1972
hva@sandag.org

AGENDA HIGHLIGHTS

• COBRO CALENDAR OF MEETINGS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2010
• OTAY MESA-MESA DE OTAY BINATIONAL CORRIDOR STRATEGIC PLAN - 2009 DRAFT PROGRESS REPORT
• SUMMARY OF 2009 BINATIONAL SEMINAR – “CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR CROSSBORDER CLIMATE CHANGE COLLABORATION”
• CLEAN ENERGY FOR TRANSBORDER DEVELOPMENT IN THE STATE OF BAJA CALIFORNIA

MISSION STATEMENT

The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) will advise the Borders Committee of the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG) concerning both short- and long-term binational related activities, issues, and actions; provide input regarding binational border-related planning and development; and identify ways to assist and coordinate with existing efforts in the binational area.

The COBRO will serve as a working group to the SANDAG Borders Committee to facilitate a better understanding of the binational border-related issues and needs of the California-Baja California region.
Welcome to SANDAG! Members of the public may speak to the COBRO on any item at the time that the Committee is considering the item. Please complete a Speaker’s Slip which is located in the rear of the room and then present the slip to Committee staff. Also, members of the public are invited to address the Committee on any issue under the agenda item entitled Public Comments/Communications. Speakers are limited to three minutes. The COBRO may take action on any item appearing on the agenda.

This agenda and related staff reports can be accessed at www.sandag.org under meetings on SANDAG’s Web site. Public comments regarding the agenda can be forwarded to SANDAG via the e-mail comment form also available on the Web site. E-mail comments should be received no later than noon, two days prior to the COBRO meeting.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact SANDAG at (619) 699-1900 in advance of the meeting. To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1990, (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905.

SANDAG offices are accessible by public transit. Phone 1-800-COMMUTE or see www.sdcommute.com for route information.
ITEM # | RECOMMENDATION
--- | ---
1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS | |
+2. COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES (COBRO) MEETING SUMMARY OF MAY 5, 2009 | APPROVE
Meeting summary of May 5, 2009.

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS | INFORMATION
Each speaker is limited to three minutes.

**CONSENT ITEM (#4)**

+4. UPCOMING EVENTS | INFORMATION

+5. COBRO CALENDAR OF MEETINGS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2010 (Hector Vanegas, SANDAG) | ACCEPT
This report presents the proposed calendar of meetings for Fiscal Year 2010.

**REPORT ITEMS (#5 through #9)**

+6. OTAY MESA-MESA DE OTAY BINATIONAL CORRIDOR STRATEGIC PLAN - 2009 DRAFT PROGRESS REPORT (Ron Saenz, SANDAG) | DISCUSSION
SANDAG staff will provide a progress report on the implementation of key actions included in the Otay Mesa -Mesa de Otay Binational Corridor Strategic Plan in the areas of transportation, economic development, housing, and environment.

+7. SUMMARY OF 2009 BINATIONAL SEMINAR – “CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR CROSSBORDER CLIMATE CHANGE COLLABORATION” (Hector Vanegas, SANDAG) | DISCUSSION / POSSIBLE ACTION
The 2009 SANDAG annual binational event was held on June 2, 2009. This report summarizes the outcomes from the seminar. COBRO is asked to review the outcomes from the seminar and discuss possible recommendations to the Borders Committee.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITEM #</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>PRESENTATION ON CLEAN ENERGY FOR TRANSBORDER DEVELOPMENT IN THE STATE OF BAJA CALIFORNIA (David Muñoz, State of Baja California)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INFORMATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This report will provide information on the latest plans and activities related to clean energy in the State of Baja California.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>NEXT MEETING DATE AND LOCATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INFORMATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Please mark your calendar for the second Joint Meeting of the Borders Committee, COBRO, and the City of Tijuana that is scheduled on Friday, July 24, 2009, from 12:30 to 2:30 p.m. at SANDAG.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The August 4, 2009, COBRO meeting is cancelled. The next regular meeting will be on Tuesday, September 1, 2009, from 3:00 to 4:30 p.m., at SANDAG.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

+ next to an item indicates an attachment
COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES (COBRO)
MEETING SUMMARY OF MAY 5, 2009

1. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

The May 5, 2009, Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) meeting was called to order by Chair Paul Ganster. The meeting was held at SANDAG.

Members present were: Chair Paul Ganster, Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias; Co-Chair Cónsul General Remedios Gómez-Arnau, Consul General of Mexico in San Diego; Efrain Ibarra, South San Diego County Economic Development Council; Past Chair Elsa Saxod, SAXOD Enterprises/San Diego County Water Authority; Anthony Aguirre, Caltrans; Craig Ruiz, City of Chula Vista; Denice Garcia, City of San Diego; Arturo Montfort, Desarrollo Económico e Industrial de Tijuana; Tito Alegría, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte; Rebecca Torra, Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce; Nathan Owens, San Diego Dialogue; Angelika Villagrana, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce; Thomas Currie and Jason M-B Wells, San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce; Ivy Cervantes, State of Baja California; Clay Phillips, Tijuana River National Estuarine Research Reserve; and Dave Fege, US Environmental Protection Agency Border Liaison Office (U.S. EPA).

SANDAG staff present were: Hector Vanegas, Elisa Arias, Ron Saenz, and Jeff Wheeland.

2. MEETING SUMMARY

Elsa Saxod, SAXOD Enterprises/San Diego County Water Authority, entertained a motion to approve the March 3, 2009, meeting summary. Nathan Owens, San Diego Dialogue, seconded the motion. The meeting summary was approved.

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS AND MEMBER COMMENTS

Co-chair Consul General Remedios Gómez-Arnau, Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego, commented on the swine flu in Mexico, and stated that it is getting better, and that there is a “light at the end of the tunnel.” She noted that President Calderón had taken good steps to control the flu, and that people would be returning to work after the long weekend (May 1st to May 5th). Consul General Gómez-Arnau concluded by saying that it was unfortunate that labels had been placed only on Mexicans for the spread of the disease, when many cases in other countries were unrelated to travel to Mexico; she said that it was not constructive for people to blame anyone for this outbreak.
Chair Ganster updated COBRO on the latest report by the Good Neighbor Environmental Board (GNEB). He stated that the GNEB looked at environmental issues that exist along the U.S.-Mexico border, and two of them focused on the San Diego-Baja California region: the Campo wind turbine energy project and the artificial wetlands in the Imperial Valley. The overall conclusions of the report are: 1) that the Border 2012 process has been very successful in bringing together binational stakeholders to address border environmental issues; and 2) that the long-term decline in border environmental infrastructure is in need of more federal funding to deal with these problems. The report is available on the GNEB website (http://www.epa.gov/ocem/gneb/). For next year’s report, the GNEB will be looking at environmental policies and making suggestions on what issues should be recommended to the Obama Administration.

David Fege, U.S. EPA, discussed the Border 2012 U.S. EPA and Border Environmental Cooperation Commission (BECC) annual grant-funding process for border environmental projects. There is a new request for proposals to be funded with $500,000 of grant money for projects involving air quality, water quality, pollution reduction, emergency response, hazardous waste and solid waste. Proposals are due by June 30, 2009. More information can be found at www.cocef.org and www.epa.gov/border2012.

Clay Phillips, Tijuana River National Estuarine Research Reserve, discussed the $50 million that is available for the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) for wildlife mitigation included in the border infrastructure project. He stated that only one three-mile section of the 700 mile project is not funded for wildlife mitigation and that section is the western-most three miles which is located in the San Diego-Baja California region. Moreover, this section is one of the most wildlife-sensitive areas along the border and was subject to the most infrastructure-intensive construction project. He continued that since this three-mile zone is under his jurisdiction, that there will be increased efforts to bring this issue to public knowledge in the very near future.

Chair Ganster stated that the San Diego Economic Development Corporation would be reinstated as a COBRO member and that Christina Luhn will represent the group at the meetings.

Francisco Villegas informed COBRO about the “Baja by the Sea” festival on May 30, 2009, from 12 p.m. to 6 p.m. The festival will display crafts, food, and music from Baja California and will be held in San Diego near the San Diego Bay at Embarcadero Park North. It will feature six pavilions of the cities and the State of Baja California, each demonstrating their distinct arts, culture and cuisine. Also, Baja California Governor José G. Osuna will be present at the festival to speak with members of the public.

4. **UPCOMING EVENTS**

A list of upcoming binational events was provided by SANDAG staff and is included in the meeting’s agenda packet.

5. **UPDATES TO THE BINATIONAL CONTACTS GUIDE**

Jeff Wheeland, SANDAG, discussed the Binational Contacts Guide updates which included changes to contact information of elected officials from the November 2008 elections, removing defunct organizations, and fixing all broken web links of border-related organizations. The new guide can
be located on the SANDAG website on the Borders Committee page, on the right-hand side under “Publications” (or at www.sandag.org/uploads/publicationid/publicationid_1268_6113.pdf).

6. PROGRESS ON THE ORGANIZATION OF THE 2009 BINATIONAL SEMINAR “CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR CROSSBORDER CLIMATE CHANGE COLLABORATION”

Hector Vanegas, SANDAG, reported that the 2009 Binational Seminar, which will be held June 2, 2009, has received good feedback and will have many participants from stakeholder groups in the San Diego-Baja California region. The announcement for the event is attached to this meeting’s agenda.

Co-chair Cónsul General Remedios Gómez-Arnau, Consul General of Mexico in San Diego, commented that the United Nations (UN) Program for the Environment World Day would be held in Mexico from June 1-5, 2009, and that the actions of COBRO would be included in their program to make the UN members aware of the actions being taken in this region.

Hector Vanegas, SANDAG, then said that Presidents Obama and Calderón signed an agreement to establish the U.S.-Mexico Bilateral Framework on Clean Energy and Climate Change. The framework will focus on renewable energy, energy efficiency, adaptation, market mechanisms, green jobs, and low carbon energy technology development and capacity-building.

Dave Fege, U.S. EPA, noted that not only were climate change and Border 2012 discussed between the two presidents, but they also discussed the reduction of anti-idling and truck stop electrification measures that was taken directly from a study done by the U.S. EPA in collaboration with SANDAG.

7. OVERVIEW OF SAN DIEGO COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY (SDWCA) ACTIVITIES

Halla Razak, SDCWA, reported on the activities the SDWCA has undertaken in regards to Colorado River water management. She began by stating that less than 10 percent of the water in San Diego comes from local water; the other 90 percent comes from the Colorado River and the Sacramento River Delta.

She then discussed the binational relationship between the U.S. and Mexico with regards to the Colorado River. On the U.S. side, there are seven states that use the river’s water, and in 1922 an Accord was passed to apportion water to each American state, with California getting 4.4 million acre-feet.\(^1\) In 1944, the two countries created the International Boundary and Water Commission (IBWC) which would determine how much water each country gets from the shared sources. With this accord, Mexico was given 1.5 million acre-feet of Colorado River water annually, unless “extraordinary circumstances” occurred. The vagueness of the term “extraordinary circumstances” has led to problems clarifying what this entails, especially since less water flows from the river now, and U.S. demand has increased greatly from booming populations since 1944, in California specifically.

---

\(^1\) One acre foot is enough water for two families per year
Currently, projects such as the All-American Canal Lining have been implemented to reduce water loss. This project aims to eliminate the seepage from the Canal to increase water delivery efficiency to San Diego. However, the lining of the All-American Canal reduces a vast amount of seepage water that reaches Mexico which damages wetlands and hurts their agricultural industry. Another project being initiated by the SDWCA is a Drop 2 Reservoir, which will store Colorado River water that has been released from dams to meet downstream water orders but cannot be delivered for various reasons, such as changes in weather conditions, high runoff into the river, or a number of other factors that create excess water that drains to Mexico. The Drop 2 Reservoir is a project that will help capture this water so that it stays within the U.S. for further use. Another project is the reinitiation of the Yuma desalination plant that was built over twenty years ago, but was abandoned because of improper functionality. However, the U.S. is now looking into resuming operations at the plant which would affect the Mexican Cienega de Santa Clara Wetlands.

With the current drought and the effect of climate change on reducing Colorado River water flow, the U.S. will work with Mexico on water management between the countries and what could be done to more fairly distribute this resource. An example of one of the binational projects includes utilizing the All-American Canal as a means to transport water to Mexico from the U.S. Other examples are the Otay Emergency Connection, the desalination plants in Baja California near Playas de Rosarito, the New River (Río Nuevo) water reuse, and using U.S. reservoirs to store water to eventually transmit to Mexico. In addition, there are many opportunities for innovative international efforts between the two countries to share water and more efficiently put it to use.

Jason M-B Wells, San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce, asked how much the production of the desalination plant in Playas de Rosarito would translate to in acre-feet. Ms. Razak stated that each day the plant can produce 25-50 million gallons per day, which is about 100,000 acre-feet annually.

Angelika Villagrana, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce, asked why there was less water flow expected on the Colorado River in the future. Ms. Razak said that some causes will be the impact of climate change on rain patterns, less wet snow pack means that the snow evaporates easier, and that there is less snow than rain which leads to greater water dissipation.

8. THE ECOLOGICAL RESPONSIBILITY OF CESPT IN THE BINATIONAL REGION

Toribio Cueva, Comisión Estatal de Servicios Públicos de Tijuana (CESPT), presented the role of CESPT in binational water resource management.

CESPT is a state, not municipal, water department in Baja California that serves over 500,000 people in Tijuana and Rosarito. CESPT’s main water supply is the Colorado River, with 90 percent of water coming from this source. Since such a large majority of Baja Californian water comes from the Colorado River, it is imperative that the water received is efficiently used and that effective binational collaboration is created with U.S. agencies to distribute the resource. Along these lines, CESPT has implemented various projects to make Tijuana more efficient in water distribution: increasing water distribution efficiency from 58 percent to 81 percent; completing the Valle de las Palmas development water infrastructure before the homes are built (a first in Tijuana development history); and increasing wastewater drainage projects from 57 percent to 75 percent coverage in Playas de Rosarito.
Moreover, CESPT has developed a strong working relationship with other binational water organizations such SDCWA, U.S. EPA, and Cal-EPA. After the signing of NAFTA in 1994, several binational agreements were also signed between the U.S. and Mexico relating to water management: Minute 270 created more efficient sewage systems in Tijuana; Minute 283 implemented the construction of the International Wastewater Treatment Plant (IWTP); and Minute 295 passed the wastewater sewage collection and treatment system in Sonora.

An example of a large-scale binational project undertaken by CESPT is the Zero Discharge Initiative, with a goal of eliminating untreated water that flows into the Tijuana River. This will be accomplished by using 66 percent of their 2009 annual budget for sewage collection and treatment infrastructure, creating a contingency plan for preventive maintenance including emergency backup generators in Pump Stations, and by increasing sampling, inspection and stream discharge audits in collaboration with Baja’s Environmental Secretary. This project has already begun with the construction of the Monte los Olivos and La Morita treatment plants in Tijuana.

Another project undertaken by CESPT is the Proyecto Morado (Purple Pipe Project) with goals of:

- Considerably increasing green areas for Tijuana and Playas de Rosarito;
- Increasing the consumption of recycled water to 20 percent in the year 2013;
- Installing purple pipes lines throughout the city where recycled water is available; and
- Reducing treated water discharges to the Pacific Ocean.

Angelika Villagrana, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce, asked about the use of gray water in their projects, but Mr. Cueva stated that it is not used because it does not comply with Mexican standards. Jason MB-Wells, San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce, asked if the San Toribio Collector addresses the problem of water contamination at the beaches in Playas de Tijuana. Mr. Cueva responded that the problem with Playas de Tijuana originates from sewage being pumped from Playas de Tijuana to the treatment facilities, and leaks occurring. Elsa Saxod, San Diego County Water Authority, congratulated CESPT on their accomplishments with water treatment and the use of purple pipes. She noted that SDCWA just finished a study that public opinion has changed from 75 percent against recycled water to 40 percent in favor of its use.

Mr. Cueva finished by inviting all COBRO members to see the projects in Baja California in the near future.


Ron Saenz, SANDAG, made a brief report on the updated Otay Mesa – Mesa de Otay Strategic Plan draft of 2009. He will give the full report to the Borders Committee on June 26, 2009, and asked for any feedback or input from members before this report is given. Comments were requested by May 22, 2009.

10. NEXT MEETING DATE AND LOCATION

The next COBRO meeting will be the 2009 SANDAG Binational Event “Challenges and Opportunities for Crossborder Climate Change Collaboration” on June 2, 2009, from 1:00 to 5:00 p.m., at Caltrans District 11.
San Diego Association of Governments

COMMITTEE ON BINATIONAL REGIONAL OPPORTUNITIES

July 7, 2009

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 4

Action Requested: INFORMATION

UPCOMING EVENTS

File Number 3003200

WHAT: Institute of the Americas (IOA) at UCSD
       6th Annual Jack F. Ealy Workshop on Science Journalism
WHEN: July 7-16, 2009
WHERE: IOA – UCSD
MORE INFO: www.iamericas.org

WHAT: El Colegio de la Frontera Norte (COLEF)
       Seminario Internacional de Evaluación de Políticas Públicas: Diagnóstico, Retos y Experiencias para México
WHEN: July 8-10, 2009, 9 a.m. to 4 p.m.
WHERE: COLEF – Tijuana, Baja California.
MORE INFO: consorci@colef.mx or +52(664) 631.63.00 Ext. 3410

WHAT: San Diego Regional EDC
       Fourty-Four Annual Dinner
WHEN: Monday, July 13, 2009
WHERE: San Diego Marriott Hotel & Marina
MORE INFO: www.sandiegobusiness.org

WHAT: South County EDC
       20th Anniversary Celebration
WHEN: July 23, 2009, 5 p.m.
WHERE: Old Town, San Diego.
MORE INFO: Cindy@SanDiegoSouth.com or (619) 424-5143

WHAT: World Trade Center, San Diego
       Cross Cultural Business Communication Workshop III: Japan
WHEN: September 9, 2009
WHERE: TBD
MORE INFO: http://www.wtcsd.org

WHAT: South County EDC
       19th Annual Economic Summit
WHEN: September 18, 2009
WHERE: San Diego Convention Center
MORE INFO: (619) 424-5143 or cindy@sandiegosouth.com
WHAT: Institute of the Americas (IOA) at UCSD, and Consulate General of Mexico
Performance by internationally renowned cellist Carlos Prieto
WHEN: September 23, 2009
WHERE: IOA – UCSD
MORE INFO: www.iamicras.org

WHAT: Transborder Institute at University of San Diego
Greening Borders for Security
WHEN: November 19-22, 2009
WHERE: Joan B. Kroc Building, University of San Diego
MORE INFO: http://www.sandiego.edu/tbi/events/tbi_usd.php

Key Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas, (619) 699-1972; hva@sandag.org
July 7, 2009

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 5

Action Requested: ACCEPT

COBRO CALENDAR OF MEETINGS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2010

The following meeting dates are proposed for the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) meetings in FY 2010 (July 2009 – June 2010). Meetings will be held at SANDAG, 401 B Street, Suite 800, San Diego, from 3:00 p.m. to 4:30 p.m., unless noted otherwise.

- Tuesday, July 7, 2009, 3:00 p.m.
- Tuesday, September 1, 2009, 3:00 p.m.
- Tuesday, November 3, 2009, 3:00 p.m.
- Tuesday, February 2, 2010, 3:00 p.m.
- Tuesday, April 6, 2010, 3:00 p.m.
- Tuesday, June 1, 2010, TBD (Annual Binational Event)

Key Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas, (619) 699-1972; hva@sandag.org
Otay Mesa – Mesa de Otay
Binational Corridor
Strategic Plan

June 2009
Draft Progress Report
INTRODUCTION

The Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay Binational Corridor Strategic Plan approved by the SANDAG Board of Directors and the City of Tijuana’s City Council in fall 2007, identified several strategies in the areas of transportation, economic development, housing, and the environment. This report is an update on the implementation of these strategies since last reported in the 2008 Strategic Plan Progress Report, which was published in May 2008.

TRANSPORTATION ACTIONS

ISSUE IMPLEMENT THE OTAY MESA EAST-OTAY II PORT OF ENTRY (POE) AND CONNECTING ROADS

EARLY ACTION Establish the Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE Technical Commission to advance planning and implementation of the future Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE and connecting roads as a binational project, in collaboration with Caltrans, SIDUE, and IMPlan, and based upon discussions with the United States (U.S.) interagency coordination group.

Progress

The Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE Technical Commission, under the umbrella of the U.S.-Mexico Border Liaison Mechanism, was established in 2007. This Technical Commission continues to meet quarterly to coordinate planning activities and to share information among federal, state, and local agencies responsible for POE planning and implementation. The last meeting took place on June 9, 2009.

In the past year, Caltrans, the U.S. General Services Administration (GSA), the County of San Diego, SANDAG, and the Mexican government have made significant progress to advance the implementation of the proposed Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE and connecting roads on both sides of the border (Figure 1). Caltrans District 11 has taken the lead on several planning tasks to advance this project. In Mexico, the Secretariat of Communications and Transportation (SCT) also has undertaken required studies for the Otay II POE and connecting roads. Key planning activities conducted this fiscal year are described in this section.
Figure 1
State Route 11 / Otay Mesa Port of Entry

Source: Caltrans, 2009
The purpose of the Phase 1 Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) for State Route (SR) 11 and the Otay Mesa East POE document is to identify preferred facility locations and allow for several decisions and actions, which are outlined below:

• Route adoption by the California Transportation Commission (CTC);

• Consideration and approval of a Presidential permit for locating the POE by the U.S. Department of State (DOS);

• Facilitation of land use and circulation planning in the East Otay Mesa Specific Plan area by local agencies;

• Support of international cooperation efforts to pursue the development of the Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE; and

• Possible future designation of right-of-way for SR 11 and the Otay Mesa East POE in cooperation with local and regional jurisdictions to ensure that the rights-of-way are shown conceptually on planning documents.

The Draft Phase 1 PEIS/PEIR was released for public review and comment in January 2008. In May 2008, Caltrans published the Administrative Draft Final Phase 1 PEIS/PEIR, which included responses to comments received. On August 22, 2008, the Final Phase 1 PEIS/PEIR was released. This document identifies the Western Alternative shown in Figure 1 as the preferred corridor for SR 11 and the POE. The U.S. Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) issued a Record of Decision on October 3, 2008.

Caltrans submitted the Presidential permit application to the DOS in January 2008. It included a description of the facility and its relationship to existing border crossings, traffic information, and projected demand for the new POE, projected financing and construction plans, status of the counterpart project in Mexico, status on U.S. approvals necessary for construction, historic preservation information, and a description of how the POE would serve the national interest.

On December 8, 2008, U.S. DOS approved the Presidential permit, which authorizes U.S. GSA to build the Otay Mesa East POE as a vehicular and pedestrian border crossing.

U.S. GSA completed a feasibility study in June 2008 that evaluated alternatives to satisfy the projected traffic demand and space requirements at the proposed Otay Mesa East POE as well as to reconfigure the existing Otay Mesa POE. The preferred alternative calls for the Otay Mesa East POE to function as a commercial and noncommercial facility, includes modernization of the commercial and noncommercial installations at the existing Otay Mesa POE, and takes into account tolls or user fees for the SR 11-Otay Mesa East POE project.

Senate Bill (SB) 1486, the Otay Mesa East Toll Facility Authority Act, was introduced in February 2008 by Senator Denise Ducheny (D-San Diego). SB 1486 was signed by Governor Schwarzenegger on September 30, 2008. The bill allows SANDAG to develop a public toll project to move people and goods along the SR 11 corridor and the Otay Mesa
East POE. This bill also authorizes SANDAG to impose tolls and issue bonds secured by those toll revenues to finance the cost to develop, construct, and operate the new SR 11-Otay Mesa East POE project.

**MEXICO**

The Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE is a priority project for the Mexican government. In March 2008, Mexico’s SCT released an economic, financial feasibility, and functionality study.

According to the study, the preferred alternative calls for a POE that would handle both passenger and commercial vehicles with separate access roads connecting to the Mesa de Otay II-Otay Mesa East POE and SR 11. The study contemplates user fees of approximately $19.17 pesos (about $1.46 dollars) for passenger vehicles and up to $86 pesos (about $6.56 dollars) for 5-axle commercial vehicles (user fees would be based on the number of axles).^1^ The exchange rate used to convert pesos to dollars is $13.08 pesos per $1 dollar.

The study estimates the cost of the Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE project at $391 million pesos (about $29.8 million dollars). The study does not include the cost of the 39 hectares (about 96 acres) already reserved for the POE site by the City of Tijuana, nor the access roads. The Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE would be built through a 30-year concession, and is planned to be a toll facility.

In December 2008, the Governor of Baja California, Hon. José G. Osuna, announced the investment of $1,600 million pesos (about $122 million dollars) for this project, with $780 million pesos (about $59.5 million dollars) to be used to buy the property, $777 million pesos (about $59.3 million dollars) for access roads, and the rest of the funds will be used for planning and other required studies.

Additionally, the State of Baja California and the City of Tijuana are in the process of identifying possible locations for access roads in the vicinity of the Otay II POE. Funds have been allocated to conduct a risk analysis of nearby canyons to determine whether they should be declared as High Risk Zones for housing settlements and could be considered as right-of-way for access roads. Also the City of Tijuana will start the bid process to initiate construction of the first phase for canalizing the Alamar River and of a new expressway, which also would provide access to the new Otay II POE once complete.

**Next Steps**

**Tier II EIR/EIS for SR 11 and the Otay Mesa East POE**

Caltrans, in cooperation with GSA and FHWA, has initiated project-level environmental clearance studies for SR 11 and the Otay Mesa East POE. A Tier II Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement (EIR/EIS) will evaluate design and operational alternatives for SR 11, the POE, and a potential Commercial Vehicle Enforcement Facility (CVEF). A public scoping meeting was held on December 4, 2008. A Draft EIR/EIS will be completed in fall 2009 with completion of the final EIR/EIS anticipated in summer 2010.

In addition, Caltrans will prepare a Project Report for SR 11 (preliminary engineering and design).

**GSA Project Development Study for the Otay Mesa East POE**

The next step in GSA’s planning process, following the completion of the feasibility study in June 2008, is the preparation of a Project Development Study (PDS). The PDS for the Otay Mesa East POE will further develop
and analyze the proposed preferred alternative project leading to future design activities. This study is anticipated to begin in spring 2009.

**Future Project Financing**

SB 1486 enacted the Otay Mesa East Toll Facility Act, which authorized SANDAG to, among other things, solicit and accept grants of funds and to enter into contracts and agreements for the purpose of establishing highway toll projects to facilitate the movement of goods and people along the SR 11 corridor in the County of San Diego or at the Otay Mesa East POE. The bill provides SANDAG with various additional powers and duties, including, among others, authorization for SANDAG to issue bonds for the acquisition, construction, and completion of transportation facilities and to impose tolls and user fees for the use of the corridor. The bill requires that toll revenues from the Otay Mesa toll facility project to be used to pay for specified costs, including, but not limited to, repaying bonds, the cost to SANDAG for operating the project, and the cost for capital improvements, pursuant to an expenditure plan. The bill also authorizes SANDAG to enter into agreements with the County of San Diego or a city within that county to accept development impact fees for the construction and reimbursement of improvements in the county or city.

SANDAG staff is completing a due diligence process related to the financial strategy for SR 11 and Otay Mesa East POE project. Staff will be presenting their findings and recommended course of action to the Board of Directors later this year. Staff also is working closely with USDOT for technical assistance and discussing loans and grant programs as part of this project’s designation as a Border Congestion Relief Project.

In April 2008, the Otay Mesa East POE and SR 11 project was allocated $75 million from the funding from the Trade Corridors Improvement Fund (TCIF). TCIF is one of the programs under Proposition 1B (Prop. 1B), which was approved by the voters at the November 2006 general election and enacts the Highway Safety, Traffic Reduction, Air Quality, and Port Security Bond Act of 2006. This Act authorizes the issuance of more than $19.9 billion of general obligation bonds for various transportation programs.

**ISSUE IMPLEMENT IMPROVEMENTS TO EXISTING OTAY MESA-MESA DE OTAY POE AND CONNECTING ROADS**

**EARLY ACTIONS**

a. Coordinate with Customs Border Protection (CBP) and Mexican Customs on the process to fund and implement identified short-term capital and operational improvements at the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay Commercial POE.

b. Explore the feasibility of short-term operational and capital improvements at the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay Passenger POE (operations and facilities)

**Progress**

As described above, GSA’s feasibility study for the proposed Otay Mesa East POE evaluated the modernization of the existing Otay Mesa POE. GSA’s feasibility study for the proposed Otay Mesa East POE also evaluated reconfiguration of the existing Otay Mesa POE.

Some highlights of the proposed Otay Mesa Modernization include the expansion of the passenger vehicle crossing from 12 to 24 primary inspection booths; acquisition of a 10.5 acre parcel immediately east of the commercial facility that would accommodate
four new commercial inspection booths and the relocation of the existing hazardous waste truck crossing inspection facility located just west of the southbound vehicle crossing in Otay Mesa.

Staff consulted with GSA on the viability of implementing specific reconfigurations that were identified in the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay Strategic Plan of July 2007 and shown in Figure 2.

The status is as follows:

1. **PROJECT:** Construct Access to allow employee vehicles to exit the employee lot directly onto SR-905 lanes.

   **STATUS:** No active plans for this project.

2. **PROJECT:** Remove K-Rail and Tire Shredders along west and east lanes and widen for additional lanes.

   **STATUS:** No active plans for this project.

3. **PROJECT:** Construct retaining wall and pavement between Commercial and Non-Commercial operations for bus processing.

   **STATUS:** No active plans for this project.

4. **PROJECT:** Modify lane No. 3 by adding a swing gate for a second SENTRI lane. This will be a dual use lane and would not include a stacked booth.

   **STATUS:** On April 15, 2009 U.S. Customs and Border Protection opened a new dual use lane in addition to an existing dedicated SENTRI vehicle lane available seven days a week including holidays. This dual use lane will allow flexible use to process either SENTRI or non-SENTRI vehicles, as traffic conditions warrant.

5. **PROJECT:** Install Stacked Booths on West 3 Passenger Occupancy Vehicle lanes.

   **STATUS:** Installation is expected to be completed by August of 2009. Stacked booths could provide a 40-50 percent increase in crossing efficiency.

6. **PROJECT:** Modify visitor parking (east half for visitors / west half for SENTRI Vehicle Processing.)

   **STATUS:** No active plans for this project.

7. **PROJECT:** Construct a slip ramp entrance to the northbound lanes. Allow buses to re-board passengers and have direct access to the northbound SR 905 lanes.

   **STATUS:** No active plans for this project.

8. **PROJECT:** Install signage – Parking for official use only

   **STATUS:** No active plans for this project.


   **STATUS:** No active plans for this project.
Figure 2
Otay Mesa Passenger Port of Entry
Suggested Capital Improvements

All improvements recommended are within
US GSA Right-of-Way.

1. Construct access to allow employee vehicles to exit
the employee parking lot directly onto the
northbound SR-905 lanes.

2. Remove k-rail, install steel bollards (or k-rail) and tire
shredders (port runner system) along the west and
east egress pavement and widen for additional lane(s).

3. Construct retaining wall, sidewalk and pavement
along west edge of the import cargo facility to allow
busses to board passengers.

4. Modify lane #3 for SENTRI/regular vehicles, dual use
(not stacked).

5. Install tandem booths along west portion of primary
inspection. (Pending results from San Ysidro Stacked
Booth Test).

6. Modify visitor parking lot. East half of lot for visitors,
west half for SENTRI vehicle processing.

7. Construct a slip ramp entrance to the northbound
lanes. Allow busses to re-board passengers and have
direct access to the northbound SR-905 lanes.

8. Install signage - Parking for official use only.

Bi-national Effort

9. Implement reversible lanes concept.
(International effort)
CBP recently completed installation of the Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) technology at the San Ysidro, Otay Mesa, Calexico, and Tecate POEs. Although, this project was not identified on the original list of improvements, it is expected to provide significant operational efficiency advancements to the Otay Mesa POE. These upgrades, which include new software, hardware, and the deployment of vicinity RFID technology, are being implemented as part of the Western Hemisphere Travel Initiative (WHTI). RFID is already utilized for toll collection on the I-15 express lanes and the South Bay Expressway in San Diego County. It can be an inexpensive means of tracking and cataloging freight movement through the Otay Mesa border crossing system. The data transmitted by RFID can track and identify vehicles and provide specific information on items being transported as well as border crossing history. In addition, devices can be moved from one lane to another at nominal costs. U.S. authorities said RFID technology will shave six to eight seconds off each inspection because information will appear on an officer’s computer screen before a motorist even arrives at the booth.

**Next Steps**

GSA has commissioned an Otay Mesa Modernization Program Development Study that is expected to be completed in December 2009. A Project Design phase will begin in April 2010 and end in December 2011, and will be followed by construction, which is anticipated to start in April 2012 and end in December 2015.

In April 2009, the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) awarded approximately $21.3 million of American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) funds for some initial Otay Mesa POE modernization projects which will cover the cost of land acquisition and design for the expansion project, described in the previously mentioned Feasibility Study. The expansion project would make improvements to both commercial and non-commercial portions of the existing port. GSA will hold its first scoping meeting in July 2009.

GSA anticipates this initial project will contribute to improving the POE’s functionality, capacity, and security and make improvements to the facility in order to comply with Customs and Border Protections current POE Design Guide.

**NEW ACTION** Support the implementation of technologies to measure cross-border wait times of northbound commercial vehicles at the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay Commercial POE.

**Progress**

In March 2007, Caltrans and SANDAG completed a study funded by the FHWA to determine what Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) or other commercial technologies are available to monitor, measure, and report on commercial vehicle wait times at the Otay Mesa POE. The study was divided into two stages. The first stage identified high-level requirements for the systems, reviewed ten potential technologies, and described the essential features of the selected solutions.

The Stage 2 Report, completed in June 2007, evaluated the viability, cost and high-level requirements of several technologies for the Otay Mesa Commercial POE.

During 2008, the top three technologies, RFID, Global Positioning Systems (GPS) telemetry, and Automated License Plate Recognition (ALPR) were evaluated. GPS telemetry was chosen as the primary means of collecting travel time information at the Otay Mesa Commercial POE because it was
anticipated that GPS data would yield the most robust data set, as opposed to RFID and ALPR that would require more installation of hardware, and therefore be more costly, to get the same potential results.

Subsequently, FHWA’s consultant contracted with a third-party provider to pursue negotiations with motor carriers in the study’s target population and gain access to GPS data. They were successful in securing agreements to collect data from five motor carriers.

Data collection began in January of 2009. Data is being collected throughout a ten-sector area along the route where trucks queue to cross into the U.S. The first sector begins at the intersection of Calle 12 and Bellas Artes in Tijuana, which is the beginning of the queue for northbound trucks in peak season, and the final sector ends in San Diego at the exit of Otay Mesa Commercial Vehicle Enforcement Facility.

**Next Steps**

Data collection will continue until spring of 2010. During this time, data will be validated by manually recording crossing times and other techniques to verify accuracy.

At the end of the data collection period a report will be produced analyzing a year’s worth of historical travel data. This report also will include implementation guidance. This data collection program will expire next year, unless another agency chooses to continue it.

**ISSUE FACILITATE IMPROVEMENTS TO CROSS-BORDER AND REGIONAL PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SERVICES**

**EARLY ACTION** Initiate advanced planning work to extend the South Bay Bus Transit (BRT) service between Eastern Chula Vista and the Otay Mesa POE.

**Progress**

SANDAG is in the process of launching the environmental document for the Phase One BRT alignment. Several technical studies are being conducted including: traffic, habitat, noise, and visual. SANDAG is currently in negotiations with the land owner at Nicola Tesla Court, the location of the proposed transit station, on a long-term lease or acquisition. Figure 3 illustrates the South Bay BRT alignment. The proposed transit station is adjacent to the Otay Mesa POE.

**Next Steps**

The Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) is expected to be completed and permits are anticipated to be secured by December 2009. The South Bay BRT project is on schedule to be implemented in late 2012.
Figure 3

Source: SANDAG, 2008
EARLY ACTION  Evaluate the City of Tijuana’s draft Public Transportation Plan, focusing on routes that would serve the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay POE and the proposed Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE

Progress

The city of Tijuana’s Municipal Planning Institute (IMPlan) is currently conducting a transportation study titled “Technical Legal and Financial Study on Route 1 (Internacional -Refugio), Route 2 (Otay-Rosarito Beach), and Route 3 (Valle de las Palmas),” that is evaluating the City of Tijuana’s public transportation system in context of its Metropolitan Zone. The goal of this study is to improve the access to and flow of public transportation in and around the City.

The study also proposes to define the location of the pick-up and drop-off points for public transportation near the Mesa de Otay POE in Mexico. Recommendations from SANDAG’s study “Evaluation of Tijuana’s Public Transportation Facilities at the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay Port of Entry; South Bay BRT” completed last year will be considered.

An analysis on transit, passenger vehicle, and truck access routes to the proposed Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE also would be included. One of the possible scenarios under consideration is a transit-only access alignment leading from the easternmost extension of Boulevard Bellas Artes in Mesa de Otay to the Otay II POE. All passenger and commercial vehicles would travel through the proposed Cañón Rinconada alignment to access the Otay II POE. This study is being funded by the City of Tijuana and would be completed by summer 2009.

In addition, IMPlan sent a letter of intent to the State of Baja California Secretariat of Infrastructure and Urban Development (SIDUE) in February 2009 expressing the need to acquire right-of-way for access routes to the Otay II POE, emphasizing the Cañon Rinconada alternative. In this letter, IMPlan also requested that public transit and pedestrian access be considered along with a binational strategy to coordinate public transit connections at the Otay II POE.

Next Steps

IMPlan will continue coordinating the Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE study findings with stakeholder agencies on both sides of the border to ensure efficient pedestrian and transit movement and connectivity. As preliminary POE designs are developed, more detailed discussions will focus on pick-up and drop-off points for public transportation near the Mesa de Otay and Otay II POEs.
EARLY ACTION   Evaluate the potential for extension of the South Bay BRT service to the proposed Otay Mesa East border crossing along the future SR 11

Progress

As reported in the 2008 Progress Report, SANDAG commissioned a study to evaluate the potential extension of BRT (Figure 3) (or other alternative transit service) to the Otay Mesa East POE. Building on the findings of this study, SANDAG staff has prepared a conceptual transit center proposal to serve this POE.

Staff has estimated that a two-acre site (Figure 4) would accommodate two bays for one BRT route, two bays for one local bus route, two taxi stacks, two jitney stacks, passenger drop off/pick up, and potential space for long haul transit operators. Scenarios B and C show potential locations for the transit center pending additional planning and design for POE pedestrian inspections (i.e. if pedestrian inspections were
to take place in the eastern side of the POE, then a two-acre parcel as shown in Scenario C would be most appropriate for the transit center).

Ideally, both northbound and southbound pedestrian crossing facilities would be located on the same side of the highway, so that transit facilities in both the U.S. and Mexico can be consolidated for maximum user convenience.

Caltrans will evaluate the footprint of the conceptual transit center in the Tier II EIR/EIS for SR 11 and the Otay Mesa East POE. Since this POE is in the planning stages, it provides a unique opportunity to influence how transit vehicles (and private vehicles picking up pedestrian crossers) will access the POE.

Next Steps

SANDAG staff will continue to collaborate with stakeholders on both sides of the border to ensure transit and pedestrian access is properly considered for the future Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE.

NEW ACTION Collaborate with the San Diego County Regional Airport Authority in the upcoming market demand study of a cross-border terminal connection between Otay Mesa and Tijuana International Airport (TIJ) toward its possible implementation.

Progress

In June 2008, the San Diego County Regional Airport Authority accepted a market demand study of the cross-border terminal that evaluated existing demand and capacity at TIJ, reviewed data on existing U.S. passengers that travel to the Tijuana airport, surveyed San Diego residents that may use the Tijuana airport if a convenient cross-border connection existed, and developed projections of expected passenger growth at the Tijuana airport.

The following are the primary market demand study results:

• The number of passengers using TIJ from the U.S. will continue to grow significantly over the next 20 years regardless of whether a cross-border airport terminal is developed.

• With an easy cross-border airport terminal, an estimated total of 3.2 million annual passengers (MAP) would use TIJ to/from the U.S. in 2020; in 2030 that number could rise to 6.4 MAP. This includes both passengers that would be obligated to use TIJ by the cross-border terminal connection and passengers that would use TIJ even without a connection.

• The passenger demand that would be obligated to use TIJ to/from the U.S. solely because an easy cross-border terminal connection exists is estimated at 1.1 MAP in 2020 and 2.7 MAP in 2030.

• If an easy cross-border terminal connection does not exist, it is still estimated that 2.1 MAP will use TIA to/from the U.S. in 2020 and 3.7 MAP in 2030.

The Authority Board decided not to dedicate additional funds to further study the cross-border terminal but decided to include it in the Regional Airport Strategic Plan.

In 2008, in an effort to advance this concept, a private investment group - the Otay Tijuana Venture LLC - purchased 52 acres of undeveloped industrial land in Otay Mesa to develop the U.S. side of the cross-border airport terminal project. Its intent is to build a full-service cross-border passenger facility that consists of an elevated toll bridge and a full-service passenger terminal in the U.S.
sponsors believe that this facility would also reduce crossings at the nearby Otay Mesa and San Ysidro POEs. The facility would be located west of the existing Otay Mesa POE and south of Siempre Viva Road along Otay Pacific Drive. Access to this facility would likely be from SR 905 south on Britannia Boulevard and onto Siempre Viva Road.

On May 18, 2009, a Community Briefing on the San Diego Tijuana – Airport Cross Border Facility was held in Otay Mesa and sponsored by Land Development Strategies, Inc. The purpose of this meeting was to comply with the U.S. Department of State’s request that a meeting be held to allow the community to provide input on the project relative to the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) process and a requirement of the Presidential Permit. Attendees included residents of Otay Mesa, Otay Mesa business owners, and representatives from the San Diego County Regional Airport Authority, State of Baja California, and Chambers of Commerce.

Some of the meeting highlights include:

- The facility is anticipated to handle 20-25,000 daily crossborder trips.
- This facility is exclusively for the use of ticket holders.
- Project proponents plan to submit presidential permit in July 2009.
- The Environmental Assessment is being conducted as part of NEPA process.
- A traffic impact study is expected to begin this summer.
- Project components would include a U.S. Customs and Border Protection inspection facility inside the terminal on the U.S. side; parking; two hotel sites; commercial retail sites, and an area dedicated for shuttle/taxi services.
- Level 1 of the terminal would house passenger check-in/processing, administrative offices, and retail; Level 2 will have a passenger waiting area, and the U.S. portion of the pedestrian bridge.
- The City of San Diego has agreed to designate the land as Business and Trade in the ongoing Otay Mesa Community Plan Update.
- A presentation was given to the City of Tijuana’s Binational Affairs Sub-Committee.
- The length of the enclosed bridge connecting the terminals would be approximately 160 meters/524 feet (the use of elevators and a moving pedestrian guide way are being contemplated).
- Air quality benefits/impacts will be analyzed in the environmental review process.
- CEQA and NEPA processes would be followed.

Next Steps

Tijuana Venture LLC anticipates that the permit process (including a presidential permit), environmental and traffic studies would begin by spring of 2009 and anticipates the crossborder airport terminal could be operational as early as 2012.
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ACTIONS

ISSUE PROMOTE CREATION OR EXPANSION OF COMMON EMPLOYMENT CLUSTERS ON BOTH SIDES OF THE BORDER AND ADDRESS FUTURE INDUSTRIAL LAND USE SUPPLY AND DEMAND

EARLY ACTION Develop the 2007 San Diego Regional Economic Evaluation and Prosperity Strategy (REPS) with Participation from the Consulate of Mexico in San Diego, San Diego Dialogue, and The Tijuana Economic Development Corporation, among other Stakeholders, in the REPS Advisory Working Group

Progress

As reported in the 2008 Progress Report, the SANDAG Board of Directors accepted the 2007 San Diego Regional Economic Evaluation and Prosperity Strategy (REPS) as an element of the Regional Comprehensive Plan.

The REPS’ Strategic Goal 4 called for reserving prime employment land (existing and vacant) for light industrial and research and development uses and to establish a redevelopment process that would renew and retain existing industrial lands for similar uses in the future.

One of the key recommended actions was to update the Employment Lands Inventory and request that all jurisdictions keep the on-line inventory up-to-date to maintain timely and accurate data on land availability. The previous update was in the year 2000.

The 2008-09 Employment and Residential Land Inventory Task Force began meeting in December 2008 to work on completing the inventory of available land, including a qualitative assessment of its availability and a market analysis to assess the adequacy of the supply.

The 2008-2009 update also will include an inventory of non-retail employment land, and for the first time, residential land.

Next Steps

In June 2009, a group of Otay Mesa stakeholders made up of developers, real estate brokers and the Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce met to provide input on how much land they identified as being immediately available. Their information will be evaluated and incorporated into the Employment Lands Inventory (ELI) report.

A final draft of the Employment Lands Inventory (ELI) report will be presented to the 2008-09 Employment and Residential Land Inventory Task Force in July 2009. The ELI will be presented to the Regional Planning Committee and subsequently to the SANDAG Board of Directors for approval. Once completed, SANDAG will update the Regional Economic Development Information (REDI) system, an Internet-based mapping, analysis, and reporting tool to keep the inventory up to date and provide broad public access to it.
### ISSUE
**Promote Creation or Expansion of Common Employment Clusters on Both Sides of the Border and Address Future Industrial Land Use Supply and Demand**

### Early Action
Within the framework of San Diego Dialogue’s Crossborder Innovation and Competitiveness Initiative, begin the implementation of selected recommendations from the Borderless Innovation study outlined below:

#### Establish the Crossborder Innovation and Competitiveness Center

**Progress**

The Crossborder Innovation and Competitiveness Center concept remains on hold. However, there are other ongoing activities between the University of California at San Diego (UCSD) and the Scientific Research and Post Graduate Education Center in Ensenada (CICESE) that hold promise for enhancing the competitiveness of the crossborder region. These activities include UCSD’s California Institute for Telecommunications and Information Technology’s (Calit2) collaboration with CICESE in areas such as high bandwidth communications under the LambdaGrid project and on metagenomic studies of marine life via the CAMERA project. These projects show the development of future enabling technologies in IT and the life sciences, which are important industries for both San Diego and Baja California.

Initiate a crossborder program to foster scientific and technology relationships, awareness of research, and commercialization of discoveries in the life sciences between the San Diego-Baja California region and other regions in Mexico.

**Progress**

In 2008, stakeholders from the Mexican regions of Cuernavaca, Guadalajara, Guanajuato, and Monterrey were in the process of formally establishing the Mexican Life Sciences Alliance to collaboratively promote their capabilities internationally, including a showing at the BIO tradeshow in June 2008. They also agreed to co-develop a proposal to the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB). Under a three-year grant, IDB funding would be used to support Alliance activities to build commercialization infrastructure (e.g., training and policies) within participating research institutions, business support services for new life science start up companies, and international outreach for research and business development opportunities which include linkages with San Diego’s life sciences community. Under the proposal UCSD Extension (San Diego Dialogue and Global CONNECT) and Merck & Co. would serve as partners to the Alliance. Submission of the proposal is currently pending the formalization of the Mexican Life Sciences Alliance into a legal entity (an A.C. or civil association), per IDB requirements. This is expected to be resolved by summer of 2009, and the IDB award announcement will follow approximately two months later.
NEW ACTION  Explore the consolidation of employment clusters through the establishment of business service centers such as science and technology parks.

Progress

The City of Tijuana’s Urban Development Program (Programa de Desarrollo Urbano del Centro de Población de Tijuana or PDUCPT) proposes a strategy to conduct an industrial clusters study. Baseline information such as the number, type, and location of industries would be gathered to develop an industrial cluster database. Information from the industrial cluster study would then be used to develop strategies focused on promoting industrial clusters in the City of Tijuana. Some of these strategies include establishing incentives to attract investment, and coordinating with universities to gear curriculum towards providing a skilled workforce to better serve specific industrial clusters.

Next Steps

IMPlan will explore funding opportunities to conduct this study.

HOUSING ACTIONS

NEW ACTION  Promote comprehensive housing developments within Tijuana portion of the study area, which would include providing space for recreational activities, sports, green areas, and public facilities and services to improve the quality of life.

Progress

IMPlan applied for and received funds from the Secretariat of Social Development (SEDESOL) to evaluate the social and environmental conditions of the Nido de las Aguilas canyon. This study was completed in late 2008 and its findings will contribute to the decision making process involved with identifying a preferred access route to the Otay II POE.

In addition, IMPlan, the State of Baja California, and local developers have been collaborating to develop the area Valle de las Palmas in southeast Tijuana. This development was designed to meet growing housing demand in Tijuana in a sustainable manner. Smart Growth concepts are planned to be incorporated into this development.

The focus of the sustainability of this development revolves around three points: social equity, ecological balance, and economic development. The social development of the community will involve strong community leadership, community involvement of local residents, and good relations between neighbors. The ecological balance of Valle de las Palmas involves concentrating the housing and commercial activities in one area of the development, while maintaining another part for the natural environment, and promoting renewable energy. The economic development of Valle de las Palmas is designed to promote a high-technology industrial park that caters to such industries as aerospace, automotive, solar energy, information technology, and biotechnology.
NEW ACTION Collaborate with IMPlan and the Urban Land Institute (ULI) on sharing resources, planning techniques, and strategies as they relate to Smart Growth planning.

Progress

IMPlan is currently updating the City of Tijuana’s PDUCPT. The PDUCPT is updated every five years and grants the City zoning authority to regulate land use. IMPlan coordinates the preparation of the PDUCPT and also oversees implementation of long-term urban and regional planning.

The 2009 PDUCPT promotes smart growth practices such as land use densification and infill development of urban zones as a strategy to avoid sprawl and to concentrate access to urban services.

IMPlan also has a new specific planning instrument for the northern zone of Playas de Tijuana that would promote Smart Growth principles in this area.

Additional progress towards the implementation of this strategy was the 2008 binational event, titled “Smart Growth and Sustainability on the Border: Opportunities for Collaboration with Strategic Partners,” sponsored by SANDAG with support from the Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego, the City of Tijuana, IMPlan, and the Urban Land Institute (ULI).

This event focused on regional sustainable planning in Tijuana, the Smart Growth Experience in the San Diego region, as well as emerging issues and next steps in the San Diego region. The conclusions reached from the binational seminar include the following:

- Explore the feasibility of developing maps of the regional transportation infrastructure and existing and planned water, sewer, energy, natural gas, and electrical infrastructure in the San Diego/Tijuana region;
- Investigate and gather existing baseline data on greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions and corresponding target reductions;
- Proceed with arrangements for SANDAG to consider accepting the IMPlan invitation to become a permanent advisory member on its Governing Board;
- Incorporate coordination of Smart Growth and Climate Change planning efforts between the San Diego region and Baja California into the next update of the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay Binational Corridor Strategic Plan; and
- Explore opportunities for COBRO members to invite practitioners to discuss best practices at borders around the world to evaluate San Diego/Tijuana border crossings.

These recommendations were approved by the SANDAG Board of Directors on November 21, 2008. Since then, SANDAG staff has made some initial progress to coordinate Climate Change planning efforts between the San Diego region and Baja California. In December 2008, SANDAG staff met in Tijuana, with the State of Baja California’s Deputy Director of the Secretariat of the Environment, researchers of the College of the Northern Frontier (COLEF), and the Scientific Research and Post Graduate Education Center in Ensenada (CICESE). These two universities along with the Autonomous University of Baja California (UABC) were contracted by the State of Baja California to develop a statewide climate plan.

The purpose of this meeting was not only to engage in some initial discussions on how to implement the above recommendations, but also to review each other’s progress in developing Climate Change Action Plans and evaluate opportunities for collaboration.
Some initial highlights include:

- Both parties agreed to share data and other information.
- The emissions inventories for the San Diego region and Baja California are prepared with different emissions factors—San Diego mostly uses California-specific factors established by the State Air Resources Board, while Baja California uses more generic factors created by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC). Therefore, existing 2005 baseline data on GHG emissions does not match; however, both parties agreed to evaluate ways to reconcile these differences and explore harmonizing data collection methodology in the future.
- It was agreed that some GHG emissions sources, although physically located in Baja California, are essentially binational in nature. Examples include the sale of older (and typically less efficient) vehicles from Californians to Baja Californians and California’s import of electricity generated in Baja California.
- Both parties agreed it would be beneficial to evaluate ways to minimize or avoid GHG emissions at current and planned border crossings. Strategies could include using advance emissions reduction technology, such as Truck Stop Electrification (TSE) and modeling Idle Free British Columbia’s TSE project at the Peace Arch Border Crossing in Vancouver, Canada.
- Both parties thought it would be beneficial to reconvene on climate change planning activities.
- Both parties agreed that jointly exploring funding sources could be advantageous.
- Baja California’s climate action plan is scheduled for completion in December 2009.
- SANDAG’s climate action plan is anticipated to be presented to the SANDAG Board of Directors for approval in December 2009.
- Other important stakeholders will be identified for inclusion in future meetings (Energy Policy Initiatives Center, and Border 2012 San Diego/Tijuana Air Quality Task Force).

In addition, to further advance the 2008 Binational Event’s recommendations, SANDAG focused the 2009 Binational Event on “Challenges and Opportunities for Crossborder Climate Change Collaboration.”

SANDAG’s annual binational event was held on Tuesday, June 2, 2009, with support from the Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego, the City of Tijuana, Tijuana’s Municipal Planning Institute (IMPlan), the Secretariat of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California, and Caltrans District 11.

The seminar “Challenges and Opportunities for Crossborder Climate Change Collaboration,” drew the participation of over 100 stakeholders from both sides of the border, including representatives from the planning institutes, agencies, the private sector, and academic institutions of Baja California, Imperial County, and the San Diego region, which provided a wide range of opinions.

The following are the preliminary outcomes from the binational seminar:

Points of Discussion:

- Agencies and stakeholders in our San Diego – Baja California border region should agree to collaborate binationally on all aspects of climate change (e.g., GHG inventories, mitigation/adaptation strategies, carbon trading plan, etc.).
• It is important to include all levels of stakeholders in discussions to develop a sustainable climate change policy for the region (federal, state, local, NGOs, academic and private sectors).

• Agencies and stakeholders in our border region should focus on both mitigation and adaptation strategies. Cost of inaction will be much greater than the financial costs of mitigation/adaptation.

**Next Steps**

COBRO will provide input to the Borders Committee on possible actions for follow up. The Borders Committee, in turn, will make recommendations for actions by the SANDAG Board of Directors in the next few months.

**ISSUE**

**ADDRESS FUTURE HOUSING SUPPLY AND DEMAND, HOUSING AFFORDABILITY ISSUES AND OPPORTUNITIES, AND INFRASTRUCTURE NEEDS OF EXISTING AND FUTURE RESIDENTIAL LAND USE**

**EARLY ACTION** Collaborate with the City of San Diego in the Otay Mesa Community Plan update to evaluate the potential to convert industrial land use to residential and its regional implications

In March 2009, the City of San Diego released the Otay Community Plan Update (OMCPU) Modified Scenarios 3b and 4b. Scenario 3b places residential land use to the west of Britannia Boulevard, while leaving large portions east designated as International Business and Trade. Although Scenario 4b, the preferred alternative, increased additional residential land use west of Britannia, it reduces residential land uses east of La Media, between Airway Road and SR 905. It also keeps office commercial – residential land uses south of Airway Road.

**Next Steps**

SANDAG will continue to collaborate with the City in its Otay Mesa Community Plan update.

**ENVIRONMENTAL ACTIONS**

**ISSUE** ADDRESS CONSERVATION OF SENSITIVE HABITAT AND URBAN RIVER CORRIDORS (E.G., ALAMAR RIVER AND OTAY RIVER WATERSHED) AND WATER QUALITY

**EARLY ACTION** Support plans for habitat restoration and rehabilitation along the Alamar River riparian corridor.

**Progress**

The Tecate River in Tecate, Mexico, begins as Cottonwood Creek in the U.S. and then is called the Alamar River when it enters eastern Tijuana. It has been severely impacted both on the floodplain and within the riverbed. The Tecate River was once a reliable source of clean water that over the years has been contaminated by rapid unplanned residential and industrial development. This rapid growth has resulted in significant negative ecological and social impacts, including: destruction of sensitive habitat areas; pollution of soil, air, and waterways; overdraft of the aquifer; and extensive erosion. The effects of this pollution are present in the Alamar River downstream and the Tijuana River Estuary where water from this river enters and eventually flows in the Pacific Ocean.

Fundación La Puerta (Fundación), founded in 1977 by the Szekely family and José Manuel Jasso, in partnership with Rancho La Puerta resort, has actively supported environmental, social and educational projects, including the
preservation of endangered native plant and wildlife habitat within Tecate and the surrounding border region.

Its current project is focused on the preservation and rehabilitation of the Tecate River. To accomplish this, the Fundación spearheaded the Tecate River Park Project. Project components include the creation of community parks, recreational areas, and preservation of wetlands and habitat for a cleaner river.

In spring 2008, the State Commission for Public Services in Tecate (CESPTE), La Puerta Foundation (FLP), and the Border Environmental Cooperation Commission (BECC) signed a collaborative agreement to construct “Wetlands for the Restoration of Tecate River” with a total investment of more than $146,885 (equivalent to $1.5 million pesos).

These wetlands were recently restored in early 2009 and will more effectively cleanse the river’s water, create areas for groundwater recharge, help reduce floods, and provide refuge and food for resident and migratory birds. The project covers 5.2 acres (2.1 hectares) of land adjacent to the river with plant species that help improve the quality of the water, most of which comes from the Tecate wastewater treatment plant and the Tecate brewery. This project has the potential to improve water quality in the portion of the Alamar River located in the Strategic Plan’s study area. It also could serve as a prototype for habitat restoration planned for that area.

Next Steps

This project represents only about one-tenth of all the restored wetlands that Fundación and CESPTE envision for the Tecate River. Future funding is being explored by these organizations.

Further downstream, IMPlan is currently in negotiations with Mexico’s National Water Commission (CONAGUA) to define the right-of-way footprint for planned infrastructure along the Alamar River. Jurisdictional authority over this area will need to be secured by the City of Tijuana before any construction would begin.

Also, as part of the first phase of this project IMPlan continues its work on the logistics and negotiations with approximately 300 families that would be relocated to clear the way to construct the Alamar River Expressway, the cement channel, and complete habitat restoration plans. Construction of the channel and of the Alamar River Expressway is scheduled to begin in 2010. Both projects are anticipated to be completed in late 2011.

As soon as the City of Tijuana secures the right-of-way, IMPlan will start the bid process to initiate construction of the first phase for canalizing the Alamar River and a new expressway, which also will provide access to the new Otay Mesa East-Otay II POE once completed.

ISSUE COLLABORATE WITH THE U.S. EPA IN THE BORDER 2012 PROGRAM, THE BINATIONAL AIR QUALITY TASK FORCE, AND THE SAN DIEGO COUNTY AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT (APCD) IN BINATIONAL CLEAN AIR EFFORTS

EARLY ACTION Support the San Diego APCD cross-border clean air demonstration projects.

Progress

In 2008, the APCD received a grant from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) to fund the second phase of the San Diego/Tijuana Clean Diesel Demonstration Project, with the objective of
mitigating the air quality impact of increased cross-border, heavy-duty diesel truck traffic. The first phase of this project was completed in 2008 and retrofitted 50 cross-border trucks with Diesel Oxidation Catalysts (DOCs) plus a Spiracle crankcase filtration system. The second phase of the project is underway and will demonstrate advanced diesel emission control technology, such as Diesel Particulate Filters (DPFs), on eight cross-border trucks. This project is expected to be completed in September 2009.

Next Steps

The APCD is currently applying for a grant from the EPA’s National Clean Diesel Funding Assistance Program to retrofit cross-border drayage trucks. Earlier this year, $156 million in funds were approved by the U.S. Congress to fund this program through the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009 (Recovery Act). Funding is dedicated to reduce emissions from existing diesel engines through a variety of strategies, including: add-on emission control retrofit technologies; idle reduction technologies; cleaner fuel use; engine repowers; engine upgrades; and/or vehicle or equipment replacement; and the creation of innovative finance programs to fund diesel emissions reduction projects. Under this grant program, funding is restricted to the use of EPA and California Air Resources Board (CARB) verified and certified diesel emission reduction technologies.

EARLY ACTION  Link the creation of conservation areas to the objectives and goals established in “A Binational Vision for the Tijuana River Watershed” and the Border 2012 programs.

Progress

City of Tijuana

The City of Tijuana’s Environmental Protection Department (DMPA) engaged in a public private partnership with Casas Geo Foundation, a Mexican residential housing developer, who donated approximately 19 acres of land to be used as open space and recreational purposes in the area known as the Libramiento, located adjacent to the free road between Tijuana and Playas de Rosarito.

IMPlan has identified the following three priority locations in the City of Tijuana for environmental conservation and/or rehabilitation: Vaso de la Presa, Cerro San Ysidro, and Canyon Laureles. IMPlan has had some initial discussions with a key landowner whose landholdings lie in portions of designated conservation areas in Cerro San Ysidro and the Alamar River. Discussions at these meetings have focused on the negotiation of the exchange of development rights for setting aside conservation lands. The landowner is receptive to this concept and discussions are expected to continue this year.

The Nature Conservancy

As reported in the 2008 progress report, the Nature Conservancy (TNC) received approximately $30,000 dollars from a private donor to advance planning efforts in Baja California to support the Park to Parque initiative. TNC has been working with Terra Peninsular, a Mexican Non-Governmental Organization (NGO), on a conservation action plan for the Sierra Juarez that will identify strategies to create a transboundary park that would link Anza Borrego Desert State Park to Parque Constitución Nacional de 1857 (Figure 5). Also during this period and in advance of the Park to Parque initiative, Terra Peninsular secured a contract with a rancher with property adjacent to Parque Nacional that requires the rancher to manage his land for conservation purposes. The size of that ranch is approximately 1,800 hectares and is known as Rancho Rodeo del Rey. The plan is anticipated by be completed by Summer 2009.
State Commission for Public Works in Tijuana (CESPT)

In early 2009, the State of Baja California allocated $64 million to its State Commission for Public Works in Tijuana (CESPT) for a zero sewer discharge program that seeks to ultimately eliminate the City’s sewer discharge into the Tijuana River Watershed and the Pacific Ocean. Funds will be used to provide sewer connections to many neighborhoods in Tijuana, and include monitoring and inspections. The secondary treated sewage would be recycled and sent through purple pipes to irrigate city parks and green spaces. This program marks a significant milestone in reducing the flow of sewage across the border. One of the first neighborhoods to receive sewer connections was the neighborhood of San Bernardo located in and around Las Laureles Canyon. Currently, sewage from San Bernardo discharges to the Los Laureles canyon on the Mexican side, which then flows across to Goat Canyon on the U.S. side to the Tijuana River Estuary, eventually draining into the Pacific Ocean. This new infrastructure would essentially stop the flow of sewage there and thus result in improved water quality in the Tijuana River Estuary. This project is expected to be completed in December of 2009.

Los Laureles

Work continues in the Los Laureles Canyon to collect pavers for erosion protection. So far 130,000 pavers are necessary to pave one of the roads. With the new paving project, the goal is to collect 250,000 pavers by next year.

U.S. Department of Homeland Security

CBP is building fences and access roads along 670 miles of the U.S.-Mexico border as mandated by Congress in the Secure Fence Act of 2006. On April 1, 2008, the DHS Secretary Michael Chertoff waived certain environmental statutes, as authorized by the Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act, to gain expedited access to the U.S. Department of Interior (DOI)-managed lands and other lands for these border security projects. At that time, Secretary Chertoff reiterated his department’s firm commitment to environmental stewardship through the use of best management practices and by providing funding for mitigation measures.

On January 14, 2009, the DHS signed a Memorandum of Agreement with the DOI regarding environmental stewardship measures related to the construction of border security infrastructure. As part of this agreement, $50 million has been set aside for environmental and regulatory mitigation in the FY 2009 Border Security, Fencing, Infrastructure and Technology appropriation. DOI manages public lands along over 900 miles of the southwestern border. Its biologists and land managers have examined the expected impacts from these projects and proposed a range of mitigation measures.

For the California border area, the Bureau of Land Management (BLM), on behalf of the DOI, has taken the lead in prioritizing these funds. The Nature Conservancy (TNC) has been actively involved in discussions with the BLM on identifying priority conservation areas that would foster Las Californias crossborder habitat linkages.

The westernmost three miles of San Diego’s border with Mexico which are located in the Tijuana River National Estuarine Research Reserve (TRNERR), will not receive funding for wildlife mitigation included in the border infrastructure project. TRNERR believes this wildlife-sensitive area has been adversely impacted by ongoing construction of the triple border fence. As a result, TRNERR representatives have raised concerns for not funding mitigation in this area.
Next Steps

When the necessary DHS environmental and regulatory mitigation funding is received, the DOI will implement the reasonable mitigation measures on behalf of CBP in those areas and for those projects identified where the Secretary of Homeland Security has waived the applicability of certain federal laws. DOI will coordinate with CBP as it implements the reasonable mitigation measures on behalf of that agency.

In June 2009, preliminary discussions between the California Biodiversity Council (CBC), TNC, BLM, and SANDAG focused on exploring these funds for local conservation land acquisition opportunities. It was agreed that CBC would consider organizing a Las Californias Binational Working Group meeting, initially with U.S. stakeholders, to explore existing and future funding opportunities. The CBC representative indicated that agencies such as TRNERR and the California-Mexico Border Relations Council would be invited to participate in these discussions.

Figure 5

Source: The Nature Conservancy, 2004
NEW ACTION  Support Air Pollution Control District (APCD) efforts to implement the SmartWay Transport project in the San Diego region.

Progress

To advance SmartWay Transport goals, EPA completed an Anti-Idling and Truck Stop Electrification (AI/TSE) study in April 2009. AI/TSE approaches are strategies to encourage (or require) drivers to turn off their vehicles rather than idling at a stand-still or very slow speeds. This study analyzed AI/TSE approaches successfully applied at international POEs between the U.S. and Mexico and how they can be implemented to save money, reduce diesel emissions, and reduce traffic congestion from idling trucks. Various stakeholders, including SANDAG, were interviewed to help identify opportunities and barriers to implementation.

The study applied its findings to examine how AI/TSE could be implemented at the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay POE. According to SANDAG (2006) the average wait time for a truck at the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay POE is estimated at two hours. It is calculated that a cargo truck idling for one hour uses one gallon of gas and emits 24.69 lbs of GHG gases.

After research and discussion with various stakeholders, three viable adaptations of the AI/TSE concept were developed to avoid trucks slowly idling in a queue while they wait to access border crossing facilities:

- **Traffic Controls on Existing Roadways:** This approach uses traffic controls on existing roadways to process truck crossings in “batches.” Traffic signals are used to stop vehicles, which are encouraged or required to turn their engines off, and drivers wait for a period of time while batches of vehicles in front of them cross the border and clear the roadway. This strategy would not include TSE technology.

- **Mandatory AI/TSE Facility:** This approach requires all vehicles accessing a POE to enter a parking area, turn off their engines, and wait for a signal to cross the border via an appointment.

- **Voluntary AI/TSE Facility:** Trucks accessing a POE have the option to enter a parking area with an appointment system, TSE equipment, and amenities. Or they can choose to use the traditional (congested) approach to the customs facility. Drivers would pay to use the facility in exchange for reduced fuel costs, a resting environment, use of amenities and possibly (depending on the procedures) a shorter wait time.

The study also focused on how AI/TSE could work at the current Otay Mesa POE and the planned Otay II POE. Based on the characteristics of the location of the POE – congestion, length of wait, land availability, local climate, need for new/upgraded infrastructure, cost, and willingness to pay – the following conclusions were determined about the value of AI/TSE in these locations:

- **Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay POE:** Due to high population density and expensive land costs in the area, the most effective AI/TSE approach would be a mandatory traffic control approach on the existing roadway, or a voluntary off-site AI/TSE parking area that serves the POE by a designated roadway.

- **East Otay Mesa POE:** since more land is available in the area, a mandatory on-site parking facility would be most effective.
Based on the study's key findings, EPA made the following recommendations:

**Recommendation 1:** All new POEs should consider strategies for reducing idling through infrastructure and border crossing processes in their planning. The BECC and NADBank should consider an evaluation of AI/TSE approaches as air emissions mitigation strategies. NADBank could leverage AI/TSE facilities through loans for new ports. Decisions not to have anti-idling should be justified by showing that approaches are not viable or that air quality benefits are not sufficient over the life of the facility.

**Recommendation 2:** Existing POEs with congestion issues should evaluate options for retrofitting with anti-idling infrastructure and determine which model (with which adaptations) could work. Anti-idling retrofits will not be appropriate or feasible for all border crossings.

**Recommendation 3:** For the Mexican side of the Otay Mesa border crossing, the U.S. and Mexico should jointly conduct a feasibility study to evaluate and compare the cost and effectiveness for: 1) a mandatory on-road AI approach that uses traffic controls to “batch” trucks through the port using the existing access road and lanes (Strategy A) and 2) a fee-based, voluntary, remote, off-site parking/TSE area that serves the port via a dedicated roadway (Strategy C). The study should involve extensive outreach with stakeholders, especially those in the trucking and shipping sectors to make sure that the strategy is consistent with patterns of drayage logistics at the POE.

**Recommendation 4:** For the Mexican side of the Otay II crossing, if congestion is predicted over the life of the facility, the project planning should include an AI/TSE facility that is incorporated into the port infrastructure so that all vehicles accessing the POE would use it (Strategy B). Otay II project planning should analyze options for using a portion of toll fees for the new port to cover the cost of the TSE facility. This facility should be evaluated as a possible staging area for access to the Otay Mesa POE as well, via a dedicated roadway.

**Next Steps**

The following are U.S EPA’s recommended future steps:

1. Hold additional discussions with stakeholders involved in AI/TSE strategies for Otay Mesa to better understand institutional jurisdictions and the feasibility of the recommended AI/TSE strategies. These stakeholders include: Mexico’s Secretariat for Communications and Transportation, City of Tijuana (e.g. Sub Comité Binacional and local traffic enforcement) and the State of Baja California Secretariat of Infrastructure and Urban Development (SIDUE) and shippers/maquiladoras.

2. Further evaluate key aspects of the Otay Mesa and Otay II crossings, including:
   - What land is available for a dedicated AI/TSE parking area and the acquisition cost;
   - The length of the roadway needed to accommodate batching of trucks using existing roadways;
   - A more refined analysis of congestion and wait times that takes into account possible near-term congestion relief due to a new Otay II crossing and possible longer-term increases in commercial vehicle traffic at both POEs;
   - The impact on the viability of AI/TSE approaches if Otay II offers a service that guarantees a 30 minute crossing time; and
   - The demand impact on Otay II from an additional fee component to pay for the AI/TSE facility.
3. Evaluate other existing northbound and southbound truck and passenger vehicle border crossings for the need for, and viability of, AI/TSE strategies using consistent analytical approaches and/or tools for evaluating when AI/TSE sites make sense, what type of AI/TSE strategy is most appropriate in a given location, and the costs and benefits of different approaches.

4. Evaluate existing and planned AI/TSE strategies at international POEs and elsewhere, including 1) the planned San Luis Rio Colorado Commercial POEs TSE facility and 2) the traffic controls at the U.S.-Canada Peace Arch passenger vehicle crossing. Other examples may be useful to monitor as well (e.g., using maglev technology to move trucks with their engines shut off through ports, as suggested by the Long Beach Port study, or the Universal Freight Shuttle concept developed by the Texas Transportation Institute).

5. Develop more sophisticated approaches for quantifying potential emissions reductions from AI/TSE strategies at various levels of congestion and length of wait times, beginning with the Otay Mesa and Otay II crossings. These approaches should take into account the various emissions dynamics of creep idling, idling at a stand-still, starting and stopping, etc. The Texas Transportation Institute, for example, has done detailed analyses of emissions characteristics at POE sites that could be used in such an analysis (Zietsman, et al, 2005).

6. Further analyze anti-idling options, including their staffing requirements and operations and maintenance costs.

7. Conduct outreach or educational campaigns with Mexican trucking and shipping companies and with drivers about anti-idling options that are available and their benefits.

8. Develop “model” approaches for deploying AI/TSE at new POEs.

9. Conduct pilot projects to test and evaluate AI/TSE strategies.

10. Share data and collaborate with global climate change planning efforts in both the U.S. and Mexico and incorporate the use of AI/TSE as a greenhouse gas and air pollution reduction strategy.

To follow up on selected recommendations and areas identified for future work in EPA’s study referenced above, SANDAG applied for a grant from the Border Environment Cooperation Commission (BECC) in June 2009. The BECC grant is meant for projects that meet U.S.-Mexico Border 2012 Program 2009 Priority Areas.

The grant proposal titled, Truck Stop Electrification and Anti-Idling as Vehicle Emissions-Reduction Strategies at San Diego-Tijuana Ports of Entry, proposes to research the applicability of TSE/AI strategies at San Diego-Tijuana POEs to reduce GHGs, air pollutants, and fuel consumption.
SUMMARY OF 2009 BINATIONAL SEMINAR -  File Number 3003200
“CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR CROSSBORDER CLIMATE CHANGE COLLABORATION”

Introduction

SANDAG’s annual binational event was held on Tuesday, June 2, 2009, at the Caltrans District 11, facilities with support from the Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego, the City of Tijuana, Tijuana’s Municipal Planning Institute (IMPlan), the Secretariat of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California, and Caltrans District 11. The seminar “Challenges and Opportunities for Crossborder Climate Change Collaboration,” drew the participation of over 100 stakeholders from both sides of the border, including representatives from planning institutes, governmental agencies, the private sector, and academic institutions of Baja California, Imperial County, and the San Diego region, which provided a wide range of opinions.

Recommendation

The Committee is asked to review the summary and outcomes of the 2009 binational seminar and discuss possible recommendations to the Borders Committee.

Background

In 2007, SANDAG and the Tijuana City Council approved the Otay Mesa-Mesa de Otay Binational Corridor Strategic Plan that served as the framework for the 2008 binational seminar, which focused on smart growth and sustainability along the region’s international border. The recommendations from that event were presented to the Board of Directors and approved on November 21, 2008. One of the recommendations from the 2008 event called for evaluating coordination between agencies on both sides of the border on Greenhouse Gas (GHG) emissions data. Based on this recommendation the theme of the 2009 Binational Seminar was “Challenges and Opportunities for Crossborder Climate Change Collaboration.”

A white paper was prepared for the event, containing some background information on what the State of California, the San Diego region, México, and the State of Baja California are doing in terms of climate change. (The document can be accessed on SANDAG’s Web site at http://www.sandag.org/index.asp?projectid=235&fuseaction=projects.detail).
Discussion

This year’s seminar gave stakeholders from both sides of the border an opportunity to learn about the latest developments in climate change mitigation and adaptation planning in California and Baja California.

Specifically, the 2009 SANDAG binational annual event focused on the recommendations from last year’s event that called for COBRO to “Evaluate coordination with the appropriate agencies on both sides of the border to investigate and gather existing baseline data on GHG emissions in the San Diego/Tijuana region and corresponding target reductions. If baseline data on GHG emissions can be gathered by sector, create a graphic of the San Diego/Tijuana Region carbon footprint. (Sectors may be defined as transportation, electricity, industrial, natural gas end uses, agriculture, and other waste).”

The moderators of the event were Borders Committee Chair Patricia McCoy, Mayor Pro Tem of the City of Imperial Beach, and COBRO Chair Paul Ganster, Director of the Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias at San Diego State University. The program included presentations on crossborder climate change planning by Sócrates Bastida, Secretary of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California (SPA, in Spanish); Mayor Crystal Crawford, City of Del Mar; and Bob Leiter, SANDAG’s Director of Land Use and Transportation Planning. Emily Young presented the San Diego Foundation’s Regional Focus 2050 Study; Susan Freedman, SANDAG, presented an Overview of SANDAG’s Regional Climate Change Action Plan (RCAP); Efrain Nieblas (SPA), Rafael García-Cueto, Universidad Autónoma de Baja California (UABC, in Spanish), and Gabriela Muñoz from El Colegio de la Frontera Norte (COLEF, in Spanish), presented an Overview of Baja California’s Planning Efforts on Climate Change; and Elisa Arias, SANDAG, and Fausto Armenta, IMPlan, gave the final presentation, “Opportunities to Address Climate Change at San Diego – Tijuana Ports of Entry.”

In addition to the presentations, the program included a roundtable discussion of experts on challenges and opportunities for crossborder climate change collaboration. The panelists were Scott Anders, Energy Policy Initiatives Center (EPIC) of the University of San Diego; Francisco Dóñez, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency; José Raúl Félix, Baker and McKenzie; Susan Freedman, SANDAG; Dan Garza, California Environmental Protection Agency (Cal/EPA); Saúl Guzmán, Mexico’s Secretariat of Environment and Natural Resources (SEMARNAT, in Spanish); Holly Lepre, CleanTECH San Diego; and Efraín Nieblas, SPA.

Outcomes

The following are the preliminary outcomes from the binational seminar:

Points of Discussion:

• Agencies and stakeholders in our San Diego – Baja California border region should agree to collaborate binationally on all aspects of climate change (e.g., GHG inventories, mitigation/adaptation strategies, carbon trading plan, etc.).

• It is important to include all levels of stakeholders in discussions to develop a sustainable climate change policy for the region (federal, state, local, NGOs, academic and private sectors).
Agencies and stakeholders in our border region should focus on both mitigation and adaptation strategies. Cost of inaction will be much greater than the financial costs of mitigation/adaptation.

Potential Actions:

- Explore the possibility of developing a harmonized inventory of emissions between the two countries to create a border GHG inventory.

- Work collaboratively on both sides of the San Diego-Tijuana border to advance multimodal transit center concepts at Ports of Entry and implement additional transit services (new routes and increased frequencies) to serve San Diego-Tijuana border crossings to reduce vehicle emissions.

- Enhance communication between crossborder climate change stakeholders to facilitate sharing of information by supporting the institutionalization of a collaborative mechanism (e.g. bringing together existing mechanisms such as Border 2012, Border Governors Conference, etc.).

- Support efforts by academic institutions to examine the possibility/feasibility of a crossborder carbon trading system.

- Explore possible collaboration between regions in developing Regional Climate Action Plans (RCAPs) (SANDAG and Baja California) to promote collaborative strategies and share approaches for creating effective climate change policies.

- Support of development of binational industrial clusters that foster clean technology to combat climate change, among other environmental and economic development goals.

Attachment: 1. Summary from the June 2, 2009, Binational Seminar

Key Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas, (619) 699-1972; hva@sandag.org
2009 Binational Seminar Summary

1. REGISTRATION AND INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The moderator of the first segment of the binational seminar, Borders Committee Chair Patricia McCoy, Mayor Pro Tem of the City of Imperial Beach, announced that the event would be digitally recorded and posted on the SANDAG Web site. Also, a phone-bridge line was available for outside listeners, and the event would be translated for both Spanish and English listeners present at the seminar.

2. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The June 2, 2009, SANDAG Binational Seminar, “Challenges and Opportunities for Crossborder Climate Change Collaboration,” was called to order by Chair Patricia McCoy, Borders Committee. The seminar was held at Caltrans District 11.

Chair McCoy remarked that individual and collective decisions are crucial to combat the real, and not perceived, effects of climate change which will inevitably have an impact on all members of humanity. Our response to this problem is therefore imperative to limiting the impacts we see in the near future. To finalize her remarks, Chair McCoy emphasized that today’s topic was not only a regional issue, but is also being addressed internationally. The Kyoto Protocol expires in 2012. Final negotiations to develop a new protocol to replace Kyoto will occur later this year.

Hon. Martha Elvia Rosas, Deputy Consul General of Mexico in San Diego, stated that the binational collaboration between Mexico and the United States is one of the priorities of Presidents Calderón and Obama. She hopes that this seminar will create valuable recommendations to address climate change and clean energy in the San Diego – Baja California region, and create a framework to implement binational climate change planning.

Ruben Carrillo, City of Tijuana, stated that in Baja California the problem of climate change is one of perception: it is not just a problem of the future, but a problem that must be addressed today. He said that the City of Tijuana recognizes the problem of climate change but has to address issues of immigration, economics, and development and how they affect the local environment. Tijuana has developed many plans to indirectly address climate change, from transportation to smart growth developments, but hopefully more specific plans can be created regionally to combat climate change.

Pedro Orso-Delgado, Caltrans District 11, stated that the new Caltrans building is a model of climate change adaptability, with its use of solar panels and gray water reuse. Climate change is not an issue of just one country, or one region, but a global problem that will greatly impact future generations.
3. SETTING THE STAGE FOR A DISCUSSION ON CROSSBORDER CLIMATE CHANGE PLANNING

Hon. Crystal Crawford, Mayor of Del Mar, discussed the fact past conferences have dealt with issues that are of binational interest to San Diego and Baja California. One of the conclusions that came from last year’s conference was the need to address crossborder climate change, and the profound importance of binational collaboration to effectively plan against its future consequences.

Bob Leiter, SANDAG, discussed the role of SANDAG in addressing climate change in the San Diego region. He stated that this conference builds greatly upon last year’s conference as smart growth planning helps reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions by utilizing greener building materials, incorporating public transportation usage, using cleaner fuels, and implementing clean energy technologies. Mr. Leiter also discussed California and San Diego’s efforts to combat climate change: from Assembly Bill (AB) 32 (which sets GHG reduction levels) to Senate Bill (SB) 375 (which focuses on transportation and urban sprawl-reduction strategies to reduce GHGs). Under SB 375, SANDAG is the first regional agency to tackle the problem of climate change with transportation planning, and is working on a Regional Climate Action Plan (RCAP) and its 2050 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) to address these issues. Furthermore, SANDAG’s partnerships with Mexico will help create solutions to the problems of public health and environmental degradation caused by climate change. SANDAG has worked with its partners in Mexico and the U.S. on three ports of entry (POEs), San Ysidro, Otay Mesa, and the future Otay Mesa East, to incorporate better public transportation and pedestrian facilities, and other strategies to reduce GHGs.

Hon. Socrates Bastida, Secretary of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California (SPA, in Spanish), discussed Baja California’s role in climate change reduction. Mexico, which has signed the Kyoto Protocol, is obligated to address specific climate change goals to comply with GHG reductions. In April 2005, Mexico created the Intersecretariat Group of Climate Change to manage the coordination of policies to address climate change. This plan, the State Climate Action Plan (PEAC, in Spanish) includes the strategy of creating an inventory of GHG emitted in the region, and addresses climate change by implementing three broad policies: the mitigation of GHGs, the promotion of renewable energy and the smart use of energy, and adaptability measures. Mr. Bastida stated that binational collaboration between Baja California and the U.S. is crucial for creating an effective plan to reduce the effects of climate change.

4. THE SAN DIEGO FOUNDATION’S REGIONAL FOCUS 2050 STUDY ON HOW THE REGION WILL CHANGE AS A RESULT OF GLOBAL WARMING

Emily Young, San Diego Foundation, discussed the possible impacts of climate change on the San Diego region with no mitigation policy implementation. She stated that it is critical to address regional climate change binationally, especially with Mexico’s strong history of environmental protection. The San Diego Foundation has utilized a framework of partners from nonprofit organizations, businesses, and public institutions to develop their Focus 2050 Study. Some of the impacts of climate change in the San Diego region could include:

- $2.5 to $15 billion of annual revenue loss from tourism, fisheries, commercial sectors.
- $14 billion infrastructure costs to adapt to rising sea levels.
- Annual temperature changes of 1.5° to 4.5°F by 2050, with greater fluctuations in summer temperatures creating heat waves.
- Greater susceptibility to drought with water demand outstripping supply.
- Peak electricity demand will increase 70 percent.
- Sea level rise of 18 inches (without including the impact of the polar ice caps melting).
- Greater public health risk (especially for elderly).
- Ecosystems and animal populations will be threatened.
- Increased wildfires and more intense droughts.

Ms. Young stated that local governments can implement specific strategies to adapt and mitigate climate change impacts: develop GHG inventories, assess local vulnerabilities to climate change, adopt targets for reducing emissions, and enact programs and policies to reduce emissions.

5. **OVERVIEW OF SANDAG REGIONAL CLIMATE CHANGE ACTION PLAN**

Susan Freedman, SANDAG, discussed SANDAG’s Regional Climate Action Plan (RCAP) which will identify GHG emissions reduction policies for the San Diego region. She outlined actions taken by California and the San Diego region to reduce GHG emissions. To address emissions in San Diego, the RCAP will include quantitative measures to reduce emissions from passenger vehicles and light trucks, and qualitative measures that reduce emissions from electricity and natural gas usage, and land use and transportation planning. Specific policy measures to reduce GHG emissions from electricity include: increased use of renewable energies, supporting highly efficient natural gas power plants, and supporting improvements to the electricity grid. With regards to mitigating GHG emissions from buildings, policies include: increasing energy efficiency of retrofits of residential and commercial buildings; supporting energy-saving equipment; and promoting new building codes. To reduce GHG emissions from transportation, the RCAP will include measures to improve vehicle efficiency, decrease carbon intensity of fuels, and improve vehicle travel by reducing congestion, idling, and vehicle miles traveled. Ms. Freeman concluded by stating that climate change policy should come from collaboration in all sectors: international, federal, state, regional, local, individual, and nonprofit.

6. **OVERVIEW OF BAJA CALIFORNIA’S PLANNING EFFORTS ON CLIMATE CHANGE**

The moderator of the second part of the binational seminar, COBRO Chair Paul Ganster, Director of the Institute of Regional Studies of the Californias at San Diego State University (SDSU), introduced three speakers from the State of Baja California who outlined the state’s climate change action plan.

Efraín Nieblas, Undersecretary of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California, discussed the common binational climate change problems facing Baja California and San Diego, and the efforts that the State of Baja California has undertaken to address climate change. Mr. Nieblas emphasized that while mitigation of GHGs is important, adaptation to climate change impacts is the primary focus of Mexico. He stated that the stakeholders in Baja California are creating a forum to design a diagnostic action plan, create a GHG inventory, and evaluate the impacts of climate change on the region.

Rafael García-Cueto, Universidad Autónoma de Baja California (UABC), outlined the impacts of climate change in Baja California. Mr. García-Cueto described rising temperatures, sea level increases, sporadic intense rainfall, and increased heat waves as some of the climate change impacts facing Mexico.
Gabriela Muñoz, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte (COLEF), discussed the GHG Emissions Inventory in Baja California. The GHG inventory gives a precise account of emissions in the region, which gives solid information on where climate change policy should be applied. The inventory was developed along the United Nations’ IPCC guidelines outlining emissions from a sector-wide view. One important issue is that Baja California and San Diego use different GHG emissions-measuring guidelines, and they need to be harmonized so that a regional GHG Inventory can be developed to create better binational policies on mitigation, adaptation, and perhaps carbon trading mechanisms.

7. OPPORTUNITIES TO ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE AT SAN DIEGO – TIJUANA PORTS OF ENTRY

Elisa Arias, SANDAG, and Fausto Armenta, IMPlan, discussed the opportunities to address climate change at the San Diego – Tijuana POEs.

Ms. Arias began by describing strategies to reduce GHG emissions at the border crossings: viable choices for cross-border travelers such as improved pedestrian mobility, increased public transportation, and reduced commercial and private vehicle idling. The San Ysidro POE is the busiest land border crossing in the world with more than 66 million people crossing each year – 10 percent more than use Los Angeles International (LAX) airport annually – which is 180,000 people per day. At this POE, public transportation is used by over 7.2 million people annually: 42 percent use the trolley, and 17 percent use the bus to reach their final destination. Personal vehicles are the second-most used form of transportation for cross-border pedestrians to complete their trip (22%). Both SANDAG and IMPlan are working to increase multimodal transit facilities to enhance access to public transportation opportunities. The Otay Mesa POE averages about 21 million crossings annually – more than all the passengers at the San Diego International Airport (SAN) last year. Planning is underway to create the new South Bay Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) that will increase the limited public transit access at this POE. Finally, the planned Otay Mesa East POE will have better access to public transportation since advanced planning is possible to develop the infrastructure. Another option to reduce GHG-emissions at the POEs is the Truck Stop Electrification (TSE) concept which could require trucks idling at the border to shut off their engines to reduce emissions while they wait to cross the border.

Fausto Armenta, IMPlan, commented that the City of Tijuana is working to develop an X-shaped transportation structure to enhance public transportation from each part of Tijuana with improved access to the border. The proposed transportation structure considers the implementation of mass transit system, such as a light train and express buses. One of the lines is planned to be placed in the Tijuana River canal, to utilize its location to cross the city from the area of Puerta México (San Ysidro) to the southeast of Tijuana. The other would run from the populous neighbors at Santa Fe in the southwestern area of Tijuana, to a northeast location near the POEs at Mesa de Otay (Otay Mesa).
8. BINATIONAL PANEL'S ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION ON CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR CROSSBORDER CLIMATE CHANGE COLLABORATION

Participants at the roundtable discussion were Efraín Nieblas, Secretariat of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California; Susan Freedman, SANDAG; Holly Lepre, CleanTech San Diego; Saúl Guzmán, Mexico’s Secretariat of the Environment and Natural Resources (SEMARNAT, in Spanish); Dan Garza, Cal-EPA; José Raúl Félix, Baker and McKenzie Ciudad Juárez, México; Francisco Doñez, US EPA; and Scott Anders, University of San Diego’s EPIC Program.

Efraín Nieblas, Secretariat of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California, discussed the role of his organization. He stated that it would be useful to create a crossborder environmental working group comprised of members of both countries’ environmental stakeholders to discuss and plan joint policies. He also believes that a harmonized inventory of GHG emissions needs to be formed for the region using the same emissions-measuring method.

Susan Freedman, SANDAG, stated that POEs present a great opportunity to reduce emissions to decrease climate change impacts. Increasing public transportation and creating transit opportunities will help achieve this goal, as will efficient planning at the new Otay Mesa East POE. Also, by working with groups like the North American Development Bank, projects can be funded binationally to help the environment; these opportunities must be further investigated.

Holly Lepre, CleanTech San Diego, discussed the need to develop a clean technology cluster in the border region to rejuvenate the local economy. With regards to climate change, this clean technology sector could create a local pipeline of companies and employees and enhance access to climate change mitigating technology for the region.

Saúl Guzmán, SEMARNAT, discussed the need for more local and federal collaboration on climate change issues. Mexico plans to reduce GHG emissions by 50 percent in 2050, but in the short-term they have developed a three-pronged plan to address climate change with mitigation, adaptation, and maintaining reduced GHG levels. He further stated that it is estimated that the costs of inaction on climate change are 4 percent – 15 percent more than the costs of climate change mitigation. Therefore, it is more economical to reduce GHG emissions than to maintain a business-as-usual strategy.

Dan Garza, Cal-EPA, discussed two effective climate change discussion mechanisms: the Border Government Conference and the U.S.-Mexico Border 2012 Program (which explicitly defined a goal of climate change collaboration). It is important to adapt the protocols from these programs to Mexico, so that the programs can be implemented across the border and will be able to compete for funding from these climate change mechanisms.

José Raúl Félix, Baker and McKenzie, stated that it is important to develop common regional strategies to combat climate change. Mexico has a significant carbon footprint similar to France, Italy, and Australia; therefore, the impact of GHG reductions will greatly help the global environment. Mexico has the ability to plan aggressive GHG-reduction objectives because the energy, oil, and gas industries are all state-owned which means the costs will be absorbed by consumers without a tax. Also, he stated that international organization funding of local border energy-efficient programs on the border should be investigated.
Francisco Doñez, US EPA, discussed some regulatory aspects of the US EPA: first, the California GHG waiver is under consideration; second, the GHG reporting rule will be achieved in 2009; third, the GHG Endangerment rule - that GHGs are dangerous to human health - will be finalized; finally, mandatory fuel efficiency is being increased for vehicles. Also, there is a funding program by Border 2012, which will look to fund border-related climate change reduction proposals.

Scott Anders, University of San Diego’s EPIC Program, stated that a crossborder GHG inventory is extremely important to flesh out opportunities for collaboration such as landfills and livestock emissions. Also, while there are many excellent opportunities for crossborder collaboration, there are many challenges as well, such as energy transmission internationally. Such challenges must be discussed to attempt to create a feasible program to deliver such important programs.

9. OPEN DISCUSSION

QUESTION: Jason M-B Wells, San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce, commented that California should work to get the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requirements up to date with National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA). Next, he asked if SANDAG’s GHG Emissions Inventory included emissions from vehicles at the POEs, and if so, can these emissions be separated to clearly draw a picture of GHG emissions from vehicles at the borders? Also, he asked which organization is charged with monitoring the emissions and evaluating plans to mitigate GHGs at the POEs.

Scott Anders, EPIC, commented that EPIC’s GHG Emissions Inventory did not separate emissions specifically at the border, but that it would be possible to measure with another study. He further commented that it would be a valuable study because it could potentially target areas where GHG-reduction would be effective. Also, there was a study of indoor car air quality that demonstrated that emissions increased when vehicles approached the border.

Dave Fege, US EPA, stated that the U.S.-Mexico Bilateral Framework would specifically address emissions at the border.

QUESTION: Al Sweedler, SDSU, stated that SDSU did a study five years ago that measured pollution at the border. The study found that a relatively small fraction of pollution was emitted at the border, although in recent years the numbers will have increased because traffic has increased as well. However, this study could give a methodology for measuring GHG emissions at the border. Mr. Sweedler then asked if a binational cap-and-trade system should be implemented in the region? He stated that instead of just buying and selling emission permits in San Diego, it would allow for a better regional mechanism for reducing GHG emissions for the region.

Francisco Doñez, US EPA, commented that his organization has investigated this issue, but there are significant problems in binational emissions trading. Mainly, enforcement problems with sustainable emissions-reductions would be difficult to measure. However, with assistance from other international organizations with experience in these matters, such a system could potentially be created.

Scott Anders, EPIC, made two comments: first, the California Energy Commission (CEC) did a study of crossborder emissions; and second, he wondered if Mexico’s ambitious emissions-reductions goals would offer any opportunity for a cap-and-trade system for Americans? Finally, he stated that
Baja California has per capita emissions of 6 metric tons per year, while Californians have 12 metric tons.

Dan Garza, Cal-EPA, stated that the Border Governors Conference meeting discussed the encouragement of legislation of emissions offsets in Mexican Border States.

QUESTION: Cary Lowe, Attorney, wondered if there had been studies of a crossborder airport could assist in reducing GHGs?

Paul Ganster, COBRO, commented that a crossborder airport has been studied for 40 years, but no concrete action has been taken on its effect on GHGs.

QUESTION: Angelika Villagrana, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce, asked if the Mexican stakeholders had developed regulations for environmentally-friendly construction procedures.

Efraín Nieblas, Secretariat of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California, commented that the State of Baja California has not created this type of system, but such a system is being developed.

Saúl Gúzman, SEMARNAT, stated that the greater concern for Mexico is improving the existing infrastructure (which is fairly poor due to a lack of building standards), but a mechanism for environmental development is being created.

José Raúl Félix, Baker and McKenzie, said that the main barrier to this is distribution of funds from the State of Baja California, but there is little harmony from one project to another.

QUESTION: Carlos Quintana, City of Tijuana (Dirección de Protección al Ambiente), stated that developed countries use more energy, have more cars, etc. and therefore have higher emissions.

Efraín Nieblas, Secretariat of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California, stated that Border 2012 Work Groups addressed the issue of what to do with cars that do not meet binational emission standards; they are developing a plan to allow the importation of cars to Mexico but to purchase a permit to show that they meet certain emissions levels.

Saúl Guzmán, SEMARNAT, one of the primary problems that Mexico has is a system to evaluate the emissions of cars that cross the border. They are working to decided how to accept used vehicles into Mexico, so that these vehicles meet specific emissions standards. Another problem is that of economics: the U.S. is a large supplier of older used automobiles (which have higher emissions), and Mexicans can afford to purchase these vehicles as opposed to new ones. The problem involves how to create emissions standards without limiting the purchase of used cars by Mexican citizens?
QUESTION: Kevin Sampson, Syntropic Systems, asked how these stakeholders can focus resources to change attitudes of the local consumer to incorporate more environmentally-friendly lifestyles.

José Raúl Félix, Baker and McKenzie, stated that in the long-term education would be the key to changing attitudes, but in the short-term fines and strict repercussions would have to be the answer.

QUESTION: Mike McCoy, member of the public, asked about the situation with the Sempra power plant in Mexicali Valley, and what was going to be done binationally for emissions standards and the transmission of energy across the border?

Paul Ganster, COBRO Chair, said that standardization is difficult for businesses to achieve, so harmonization of standards (especially binationally) would facilitate better business proceedings between companies, states, and local governments.

QUESTION: Sean O'Keefe, Beacon Environmental, stated that vehicle emissions tend to be the leading cause of climate change in the region, but only 5 percent of efforts were being directed towards changing this source. What technologies were being implemented to improve this situation?

Susan Freedman, SANDAG, commented that in SANDAG’s RCAP transportation is the main focus of emissions reduction. She stated that as of right now, congestion management is the primary tool that is being used to reduce GHG emissions. However, new technologies are being examined to address this problem.

Efraín Nieblas, Secretariat of Environmental Protection of the State of Baja California, stated that 80 percent of emissions in Baja California are from the generation of electricity. They are focusing on renewable technologies to reduce these emissions. Also, to reduce transportation emissions, they are developing a mechanism to evaluate emissions from vehicles, and to implement the use of cleaner fuels.

QUESTION: Paula Stigler, San Diego Foundation, asked how each region will address the impacts of policies on vulnerable populations?

Susan Freedman, SANDAG, stated that one of the guiding principles of the RCAP is to service the underserved communities. SANDAG, for example, is holding workshops in communities that are generally not involved in these decision-making processes to educate and understand their opinions.

10. CONCLUSIONS

COBRO Chair Paul Ganster concluded by thanking all participants and attendees. He stated that the outcomes and conclusions drawn from the seminar will be outlined for discussion at the next COBRO meeting on July 7, 2009.